

\* \* \* \* \*

PUBLIC HEARING

ON THE

SAGO MINE DISASTER

May 2, 2006 - May 4, 2006

\* \* \* \* \*

May 2, 2006

\* \* \* \* \*

West Virginia Wesleyan College  
Rockefeller Physical Education Center  
Buckhannon, West Virginia

\* \* \* \* \*

REPORTER: Miranda D. Elkins

Any reproduction of this transcript is  
prohibited without authorization by the  
certifying agency.

## A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2  
3 DAVITT MCATEER,  
4 Chair  
5 GOVERNOR JOSEPH MANCHIN,  
6 Governor State of West Virginia  
7 RAY MCKINNEY,  
8 Administrator, MSHA  
9 JAMES DEAN,  
10 Director WV Office, MHST  
11 SENATOR JEFFREY KESSLER,  
12 Senate Judiciary Committee  
13 DELEGATE WILLIAM HAMILTON,  
14 Delegate, WV  
15 DELEGATE EUTACE FREDERICK,  
16 Delegate, WV  
17 SENATOR SHIRLEY LOVE,  
18 Senator, Oak Hill  
19 DELEGATE MIKE CAPUTO,  
20 Delegate, WV  
21 SENATOR DON CARUTH  
22 Senator, Mercer  
23  
24  
25

## A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2  
3 KEVIN STRICKLIN,  
4 MSHA District Manager, District  
5 Three Office, Morgantown  
6 BRIAN MILLS,  
7 Inspector at Large, WVMSHT  
8 JOHN COLLINS,  
9 District Inspector, WVMSHT  
10 KEN TENNEY,  
11 Field Office Supervisor,  
12 Bridgeport  
13 ED CLAIR,  
14 Associate Solicitor, MSHA  
15 BENNETT HATFIELD,  
16 President/CEO, ICG  
17 JEFFREY TOLER,  
18 Superintendent, Sago Mine  
19 SAMUEL KITTS,  
20 Senior Vice President, WV&MD, ICG  
21 CHARLES SNAVELY,  
22 Vice President, ICG  
23 TYRONE COLEMAN,  
24 Manager for Safety, WV, ICG

## A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2 PEGGY COHEN,  
3 Daughter, Fred Ware  
4 VIRGINIA MOORE,  
5 Fiancé, Terry Helms  
6 AMBER HELMS,  
7 Daughter, Terry Helms  
8 RUSSELL BENNETT,  
9 Son, Marty Bennett  
10 PAM CAMPBELL,  
11 Sister-In-Law, Marty Bennett  
12 SAMANTHA LEWIS,  
13 Wife, Dave Lewis  
14 CHRISTOPHER TOLER,  
15 Son, Martin Toler  
16 SHELLY GROVES ROSE,  
17 Daughter, Jerry Groves  
18 JOHN GROVES,  
19 Brother, Jerry Groves  
20 DEBBIE HAMNER,  
21 Wife, George Hamner  
22 CHARLOTTE WEAVER,  
23 Wife, Jackie Weaver  
24 ANN MEREDITH,  
25 Daughter, James Bennett

## A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2  
3 JOHN STEMPLE, JR.  
4 Assistant Director of Safety and  
5 Employee Development, ICG  
6 CARL CRUMINE,  
7 Mine Foreman, Sago Mine  
8 FRED JAMISON,  
9 Fire Boss, Sago Mine  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Page 6

I N D E X

1 STATEMENTS

2

3 By Chair 8 - 14

4 By Governor Manchin 14 - 23

5 By Mr. McKinney 24 - 28

6 By Mr. Dean 28 - 34

7 By Senator Kessler 34 - 37

8 By Delegate Hamilton 37 - 41

9 By Delegate Frederick 41 - 43

10 By Senator Love 43 - 45

11 By Delegate Caputo 45 - 49

12 By Senator Caruth 49 - 53

13 STATEMENTS OF FAMILY MEMBERS

14 By Peggy Ware- Cohen 55 - 59

15 By Virginia Moore 60 - 61

16 By Amber Helms 61 - 66

17 By Russell Bennett 66 - 67

18 By Pam Campbell 67 - 69

19 By Samantha Lewis 69 - 72

20 By Christopher Toler 72 - 74

21 By Shelly Grooves Rose 74 - 77

22 By John Groves 77 - 85

23 By Debbie Hamner 85 - 90

24 By Charlotte Weaver 90 - 95

25 By Ann Meredith 92 - 102

Page 7

I N D E X

1 STATEMENTS

2

3 By Kevin Strickland 103 - 116

4 By Brian Mills 116 - 124

5 By John Collins 124 - 128

6 QUESTIONS OF PANEL TWO 128 - 191

7 STATEMENTS

8 By Bennett Hatfield 192 - 198

9 By Jeffrey Toler 198 - 207

10 By Bennett Hatfield 207 - 210

11 QUESTIONS OF PANEL THREE 210 - 486

12 CERTIFICATE 487

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 8

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 -----

2

3 CHAIR:

4 My name is Davitt

5 McAteer, and I want to welcome all of

6 you here this morning. We'd like to

7 open with a prayer and a pledge of

8 allegiance, and then we'll begin the

9 process. If you could stand for

10 prayer, please.

11 PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE RECITED

12 CHAIR:

13 I would like to thank the

14 staff of West Virginia Wesleyan for

15 hosting this hearing, and for the

16 support and cooperation that they have

17 provided to everyone affected by the

18 Sago tragedy and involved in the

19 investigation for the past four months.

20 They have been marvelous.

21 In a moment, I'll outline

22 the procedure we'll be following.

23 First, however, I would ask us to stand

24 once more for a moment of silence for

25 the 12 miners who perished in this mine

Page 9

1 disaster.

2 MOMENT OF SILENCE

3 CHAIR:

4 Thank you. This public

5 hearing on the Sago Mine disaster

6 augments a joint investigation by the

7 West Virginia Office of Miners' Health,

8 Safety & Training, and the Federal Mine

9 Safety & Health Administration.

10 Historically,

11 investigations of mine disasters in the

12 United States have never involved the

13 families of the victims. That era ends

14 today. The families of the victims

15 have more at stake than anyone else in

16 this room. They want to know that

17 their men, their husbands, fathers,

18 sons, fiancées and friends did not die

19 in vain.

20 They have the right to

21 expect those in authority to do right

22 by their men. They have the right to

23 participate in this hearing, and they

24 have the right to insist that their

25 questions be answered. Most of all,

Page 10

1 they have the right to expect that  
 2 everything necessary will be done to  
 3 improve mine safety conditions in the  
 4 United States, so that the Sago Mine  
 5 disaster will be remembered as the  
 6 turning point in this country's  
 7 history.  
 8 Toward that goal and in  
 9 that spirit, we have convened this  
 10 panel, this meeting. In addition to  
 11 the Mine Safety & Health Administration  
 12 and the Office of Miners' Health,  
 13 Safety & Training, the legislative  
 14 bodies of the West Virginia Senate and  
 15 House of Delegates have both  
 16 established investigative panels. The  
 17 members are here as part of their  
 18 charge to review the tragedy in order  
 19 to formulate legislative actions to  
 20 build on the legislation that Governor  
 21 Manchin introduced and that the  
 22 legislature enacted earlier this year.  
 23 The West Virginia Board  
 24 of Coal Mine Safety & Health, whose  
 25 members are here also today is charged

Page 11

1 with reviewing accidents, so as to make  
 2 recommendations. Also, as part of the  
 3 legislation adopted earlier this year,  
 4 a joint committee representing labor  
 5 and management was established to  
 6 review mine safety technology, and they  
 7 are with us as well.  
 8 The United Mine Workers'  
 9 of America is represented today by its  
 10 president, Cecil Roberts. Both in its  
 11 capacity as the nation's longest  
 12 standing advocate of improved mine  
 13 safety & health, and also as a  
 14 representative of some of the miners of  
 15 the Sago Mine. Some of the Sago miners  
 16 have also chosen other representation,  
 17 and they are represented here as well  
 18 today.  
 19 I will be chairing this  
 20 meeting, and I will ask for your  
 21 patience while I briefly outline the  
 22 procedures we will follow. Our basic  
 23 intention is to follow the accident  
 24 chronologically, to look at the events  
 25 leading up to the accident, then to the

Page 12

1 circumstance of the explosion and then  
 2 to the rescue and recovery effort.  
 3 At each stage, we will  
 4 focus on causation and what can be done  
 5 to prevent further types of accidents  
 6 from happening. Clearly, they are of  
 7 equal importance in determining what  
 8 went wrong at Sago. In order to  
 9 attempt to establish an orderly  
 10 process, we have adopted a set of  
 11 procedural rules, which you will find  
 12 attached to your agenda. The  
 13 representatives of MSHA and the West  
 14 Virginia Office of Miners' Health,  
 15 Safety & Training will ask questions of  
 16 the witnesses, representatives of the  
 17 family will also ask questions of the  
 18 witnesses. The legislators will ask  
 19 questions of the company and will ask  
 20 questions  
 21 --- and will ask questions of the state  
 22 and federal witnesses through the  
 23 Chair.  
 24 Other participation and  
 25 members of the public may submit

Page 13

1 questions in writing, which we will  
 2 direct to the appropriate third parties  
 3 to address. We will do our best to see  
 4 that these questions are addressed in  
 5 the course of the hearing. They will  
 6 also be made part of the official  
 7 record.  
 8 The record will remain  
 9 open for 30 days following the hearing,  
 10 and questions and comments, suggestions  
 11 and other materials relevant to the  
 12 purposes of the hearing may be  
 13 submitted to me by  
 14 e-mail or mail at the address shown on  
 15 the procedures page.  
 16 If you have any questions  
 17 about the procedures we are following,  
 18 I would ask you to hold those until we  
 19 have a break, at which time I will  
 20 attempt to address those concerns.  
 21 Now, it is my privilege  
 22 to introduce the Governor of West  
 23 Virginia, Joe Manchin. Governor,  
 24 welcome home.  
 25 GOVERNOR MANCHIN:

Page 14

1 Thank you, Davitt. First  
2 of all, let me thank the West Virginia  
3 Wesleyan College, the president, Bill  
4 Haden, and the entire staff for being  
5 our host, and a gracious host they have  
6 been. I also want to acknowledge the  
7 U.S. Department of Labor, the Mine  
8 Safety & Health Administration, and the  
9 West Virginia Office of Miners' Health,  
10 Safety & Training. The West Virginia  
11 Board of Coal Mine Health & Safety, the  
12 United Mine Workers' and the Coal  
13 Association of West Virginia for all of  
14 their efforts in this investigation and  
15 this process.  
16 The members of the West  
17 Virginia legislature for their  
18 involvement in this process and for  
19 their efforts in making changes to our  
20 laws, with the knowledge and desire to  
21 make mining safer. And they truly have  
22 done an outstanding job. But most  
23 importantly, we're here for the  
24 families, all the extended families and  
25 those representing the families today.

Page 15

1 With the opening of this  
2 public hearing this morning, we  
3 continue the ongoing process to  
4 determine exactly what happened at the  
5 Sago Mine. And we also take another  
6 important step to help put closure to  
7 this horrible tragedy.  
8 The tragedy at the Sago  
9 Mine was devastating, something that no  
10 family should be forced to deal with.  
11 And I mean families all over the State  
12 of West Virginia, all over this nation  
13 who have lost a loved one to a horrible  
14 tragedy, whether it be just one or  
15 whether it would be a multiple of  
16 people. I can only reflect on my  
17 personal experience in my families at  
18 the '68 Farmington Mine Explosion, and  
19 a lot of people here today remember  
20 that mine explosion so vividly and the  
21 impact that it had on our family, and  
22 the scars that it left on our family  
23 that we still carry today.  
24 Being a family member in  
25 a very similar position, I thought

Page 16

1 there was something that we could do  
2 and do it better and do it differently.  
3 And that's why we are here today,  
4 basically for you. I know what we went  
5 through with the loss of my Uncle John,  
6 my mother, who was --- that was her  
7 brother, my Aunt Jenny, and my cousins  
8 John, and Susie and Vincent, and all of  
9 the family. It's just --- it's  
10 something you never ever recover from,  
11 but you try to go on.  
12 The Sago families need  
13 closure, and they need to know what the  
14 facts are. It is my sincere hope that  
15 this hearing will give the families  
16 directly impacted by this tragedy, an  
17 opportunity to get answers to their  
18 questions.  
19 It pleases me that the  
20 commitment made to these families is  
21 being honored. Providing them with an  
22 opportunity to have their voices heard  
23 with regard to this tragedy.  
24 There were two requests  
25 that I made at the beginning of this

Page 17

1 investigative process, really while we  
2 were still at the mine site waiting. I  
3 asked for a complete report consisting  
4 of an overview of the determined causes  
5 of the Sago accident and an overview of  
6 the rescue and recovery operation,  
7 including the miscommunication that  
8 caused such needless heartache. And  
9 recommendations as to how mine safety  
10 and mine communications can be  
11 improved, not only in West Virginia,  
12 but across the entire nation.  
13 This report will be  
14 completed, hopefully by July 1st.  
15 That's our target date. And I've  
16 spoken to Davitt, and they have been  
17 working towards that, because I believe  
18 that we will be able to accomplish  
19 that, and I hope so.  
20 I also asked, number two,  
21 that upon completion of the traditional  
22 state and federal fact finding period,  
23 the state would join with the federal  
24 government to hold an open public  
25 hearing on the accident and this

Page 18

1 aftermath.  
2 The open hearing process  
3 is very important for everyone  
4 involved, particularly, you the family.  
5 I believe that if we would have had  
6 this opportunity, it might have helped  
7 us. And I'm hoping that it's going to  
8 help you. The hearing will also  
9 provide state and federal officials  
10 with additional knowledge to learn and  
11 improve from this tragedy to make  
12 mining workplaces throughout our state  
13 and nation safer.  
14 I'm pleased at Davitt  
15 McAteer, former assistant secretary for  
16 the Mine Safety & Health Administration  
17 and the U.S. Department of Labor, and a  
18 noted authority on mine safety, agreed  
19 in the days following the Sago tragedy  
20 to serve as my special advisor on this  
21 investigation. I could not have asked  
22 a person who had more skill, trust and  
23 knowledge to support me and the people  
24 of West Virginia and our staff  
25 throughout the course of this

Page 19

1 investigation. And to chair and  
2 operate this hearing with the  
3 guidelines of the state and federal  
4 regulations. And Davitt, I can only  
5 tell you, on behalf of a grateful  
6 state, I appreciate your efforts, your  
7 staff efforts throughout this process  
8 in working with our office and with all  
9 of the families and all of the parties  
10 involved.  
11 It is very important to  
12 know that these brave miners have not  
13 died in vain, as their legacy is living  
14 on through the significant safety and  
15 technology advances and regulatory  
16 changes that are being instituted to  
17 improve mine safety. As a result of  
18 the horrible tragedy at Sago, we have  
19 already strengthened our mine safety  
20 laws on a state level. And we are in  
21 the process of conducting a very  
22 thorough evaluation of our mine safety  
23 and regulatory rules.  
24 In passing Senate bill  
25 247, a landmark piece of legislation,

Page 20

1 the legislature absolutely worked  
2 without any political involvement.  
3 They crossed party lines. They did  
4 something that needed to be done on  
5 behalf of all the miners in West  
6 Virginia, all of the miners in America,  
7 to make sure we took a step forward to  
8 make mining safer. And that bill, on  
9 January 23rd, I told them at the time  
10 that we were passing and working on  
11 that bill, we're not doing one thing to  
12 make mining safer at this juncture.  
13 What we're doing is making sure that if  
14 a miner is caught in a horrible tragedy  
15 such as the Sago, Alma or any other  
16 place in West Virginia, the chances of  
17 us being able to rescue them safely is  
18 greatly improved. Rapid response,  
19 electronic tracking, portable air  
20 station, supplies in mines, all of  
21 these things make so much common sense.  
22 And we and West Virginia now have the  
23 laws in place to do that.  
24 Working together with our  
25 partners, we took another significant

Page 21

1 step in our efforts to address mine  
2 safety with the development of amended  
3 emergency mine safety rules. For the  
4 industry which addresses breathable air  
5 stations, the use of rescue chambers  
6 and a development of a technology  
7 taskforce to evaluate new mine safety  
8 technology. We are now going through  
9 the process of working with the federal  
10 government and all of our mining states  
11 to assist with their ongoing efforts to  
12 improve mine safety.  
13 Bringing together experts  
14 from the mining and technology sectors,  
15 we assembled a global group to discuss  
16 ways that we can improve mine safety at  
17 the very first International Mine  
18 Safety & Health Symposium, which was  
19 held ten days ago. It was held in  
20 Wheeling, West Virginia, Wheeling  
21 Jesuit College, Davitt chaired and put  
22 the symposium, did a great job of  
23 putting that together. And then we had  
24 different exhibitors from all over the  
25 world coming in to show us the

Page 22

1 technologies and advancements of  
2 technologies they're making, that would  
3 make mining safer.  
4 It is imperative that we  
5 remain committed to properly seeing  
6 this joint and federal investigation to  
7 its conclusion. We understand the very  
8 delicate nature of this investigation,  
9 taking into account the heavy emotions  
10 that are involved while respecting the  
11 need to adhere to the guidelines  
12 associated with this effort.  
13 I am confident that if we  
14 work properly through the process and  
15 it is preserved, that we can attain the  
16 goals that we set and help these  
17 families with a true sense of closure.  
18 The upcoming days are going to be  
19 difficult for the families and everyone  
20 connected with this tragedy. In  
21 honoring the memory of the Sago miners,  
22 we must continue to take every step  
23 necessary to ensure that miners in West  
24 Virginia and everywhere in the nation  
25 are as safe as possible, and that they

Page 23

1 are equipped to do their work in an  
2 environment that is as safe as we can  
3 possibly make it.  
4 There's nothing that we  
5 do here today or tomorrow that's going  
6 to bring back our loved ones, not one  
7 thing, or any of the loss of miners  
8 that we've had over the years. But I  
9 truly believe --- I really truly  
10 believe that we can change the fate of  
11 mining, not only in West Virginia, but  
12 across this great nation of ours if we  
13 do it right and complete.  
14 So I thank you for your  
15 participation. My heart and my prayers  
16 are still with you every day. I really  
17 feel like I became part of most of all  
18 of your families. And this state will  
19 be with you for as long as we possibly  
20 can under the desires and wishes of  
21 each one of you. So again, thank you  
22 and God bless you.  
23 CHAIR:  
24 I would now like to  
25 introduce Ray McKinney, the

Page 24

1 administrator of Coal Mine Safety &  
2 Health enforcement at the Mine Safety &  
3 Health Administration, for a short  
4 opening statement.  
5 MR. MCKINNEY:  
6 Good morning. As Davitt  
7 indicated, my name is Ray McKinney, and  
8 I represent the Mine Safety & Health  
9 Administration at this hearing. I'm  
10 the administrator for Coal Mine Safety  
11 & Health, and in that position, I'm  
12 MSHA's senior career official in the  
13 Coal Mine Health & Safety division. I  
14 have over 36 years of mining  
15 experience. Thirty (30) years of that  
16 has been dedicated to mine safety &  
17 health. I personally participate in  
18 every aspect of mine rescue and  
19 recovery operations, including  
20 underground service with mine rescue  
21 teams.  
22 As noted earlier, this is  
23 a sad and solemn occasion because of  
24 the tragic death of the 12 miners at  
25 the Sago Mine on January 2nd. We at

Page 25

1 MSHA acknowledge the loss and grief of  
2 the families affected by this terrible  
3 tragedy, and we mourn with them.  
4 This public hearing  
5 should be as seen as part of the larger  
6 investigation process that is designed  
7 to find the causes of the explosion and  
8 the conditions that contribute to the  
9 loss of life.  
10 MSHA's investigation  
11 process began within hours of the  
12 completion of the rescue and recovery  
13 operation. And the investigation will  
14 continue well beyond this hearing. We  
15 have conducted formal interviews of 70  
16 witnesses, and we have more to go,  
17 including Randal McCloy and the experts  
18 who have been retained by ICG.  
19 Our goal is twofold.  
20 First, to learn lessons from this  
21 tragedy that can be passed on to the  
22 mining community to prevent future  
23 accidents. We will make a complete  
24 public report of our investigation  
25 findings. The accident report will be

Page 26

1 widely available to the mining  
2 industry. We will discuss it with our  
3 own managers and inspection personnel,  
4 and we will use it as a training tool.  
5  
6 The history of  
7 improvement in mine safety & health  
8 protection has advanced as we learn  
9 from tragic events at the Sago Mine  
10 explosion.  
11 Second, our goal is to  
12 enforce the provisions of the Federal  
13 Mine Safety & Health Act of 1977 and  
14 its regulations.  
15 If our investigation  
16 uncovers evidence that the requirements  
17 of the Mine Act and MSHA's safety  
18 standards have been violated, we will  
19 take appropriate enforcement action.  
20 The operator will be cited and a civil  
21 penalty will be assessed. If the mine  
22 operator disagrees with our enforcement  
23 action, it may seek review of our  
24 action, have a hearing before an  
25 administrative law judge of the

Page 27

1 Independent Federal Mine Safety &  
2 Health Review Commission.  
3 We've seen an alarming  
4 upturn in fatal mining accidents this  
5 calendar year, particularly in West  
6 Virginia. This is all the more  
7 distressing, because it follows  
8 successive years of record low mining  
9 deaths. We are here to learn what  
10 happened and why it happened, so that  
11 the lives may be saved in the future.  
12 Before we proceed, I  
13 would, again, like to express my  
14 sincere condolences for the families of  
15 the Sago Mine tragedy. They have  
16 suffered greatly and we share their  
17 grief. We also recognize the severe  
18 trauma suffered by the family of Randy  
19 McCloy. And while we celebrate his  
20 steady recovery, we know that his life  
21 was forever changed on January the 2nd.  
22 In fact, all of the survivors of the  
23 explosion and those who tried to rescue  
24 the 13 miners have been through a life-  
25 altering experience that will be with

Page 28

1 them forever.  
2 I hope this hearing will  
3 provide a basis to move forward with a  
4 more complete understanding of what  
5 happened and why. Thank you.  
6 CHAIR:  
7 Now, I would like to  
8 introduce James Dean, the acting  
9 director of the West Virginia Office of  
10 Miners' Health, Safety & Training.  
11 MR. DEAN:  
12 Thank you. Before I  
13 begin my remarks this morning, I'd like  
14 to recognize the members of the West  
15 Virginia Board of Coal Mine Health &  
16 Safety, and ask them to stand and be  
17 recognized, if possible.  
18 This board is composed of  
19 company and labor representatives, and  
20 it's charged by state statute to review  
21 all serious accidents, fatalities that  
22 occur within the West Virginia mining  
23 industry, and determine if additional  
24 regulation is  
25 needed in order to prevent their

Page 29

1 occurrence.  
2 I serve as a chairman of  
3 this board and will be asking questions  
4 on their behalf, in addition to the  
5 West Virginia Office of Miners' Health,  
6 Safety & Training today.  
7 The Office of Miners'  
8 Health, Safety & Training is committed  
9 to finding answers to what happened on  
10 January the 2nd at the Sago Mine, in  
11 order to ensure that solutions are  
12 developed to prevent such disasters in  
13 the future. We are determined to get  
14 answers to some very important  
15 questions. First, what is the truth  
16 about what happened before, during and  
17 after the explosion in the mine.  
18 Our investigation and  
19 partnership with the Mine Safety &  
20 Health Administration is still ongoing,  
21 and all of the team members are open to  
22 listen to what people are able to tell  
23 us and to consider all viable options  
24 about what happened.  
25 Throughout the past four



Page 30

1 months, we've interviewed many  
2 different people and looked at a great  
3 deal of information from within the  
4 mine, the company and agency records,  
5 and through testing. We are still  
6 obtaining additional information in  
7 almost all of these areas. Some of  
8 this information is clear, though at  
9 times we do have information that is  
10 often conflicting.  
11 It's part of our job to  
12 sort through all this and anything else  
13 we learn that can help us in order to  
14 find the truth. What is the ignition  
15 source that caused the explosion and  
16 what can be done to ensure that we're  
17 better prepared in the future, should  
18 we need to respond to such an event.  
19 And also, what steps can be taken to  
20 prevent the event in the first place.  
21 I assure you that the  
22 information we discuss in this hearing  
23 will become another important part of  
24 our investigation review. I hope the  
25 information we gather here today will

Page 31

1 shed additional light on the accident.  
2 More importantly, I hope it will help  
3 the families and others gathered here  
4 today to see that what happened on  
5 January the 2nd is very much in the  
6 forefront of what's happening in the  
7 Miners' Health, Safety & Training.  
8 We know that we need to  
9 find the answers to what happened and  
10 solutions that will honor the memory of  
11 the miners. To that end, I want to  
12 also assure you that our office is  
13 doing more than participating in the  
14 investigation. We've undertaken an  
15 extensive review of our office's  
16 organization, its attention to issues  
17 of safety, training, inspections and  
18 rescue operations. Every day, we're  
19 just not examining these issues, but  
20 also trying to act on them in a timely  
21 way.  
22 So far we have drafted a  
23 mine rescue improvement plan for the  
24 State of West Virginia. This plan  
25 addresses equipment, training and

Page 32

1 personnel needs for the Office of  
2 Miners' Health, Safety & Training in  
3 this area. I'm also working with  
4 Governor Manchin to begin to implement  
5 this plan once funding has been  
6 obtained.  
7 We're also in the process  
8 of an extensive industry review of  
9 storage of rescuers and moving forward  
10 through Senate bill 247, which was  
11 passed in law and mentioned earlier.  
12 This will give us an inventory of  
13 what's there and what mines need to  
14 take immediate steps for a better  
15 reserve.  
16 A six-member task force,  
17 the mine operators and miners and  
18 representatives from the UWMA is  
19 working diligently to develop  
20 recommendations for my consideration on  
21 issues surrounding emergency chambers,  
22 tracking and communication systems, as  
23 called for in Senate bill 247.  
24 The task force is  
25 committed to meeting its May 29th

Page 33

1 deadline for reporting to me. Today I  
2 want to tell you about another  
3 important step we are taking. Along  
4 with the Mine Safety & Health  
5 Administration, we are pursuing a four  
6 point plan to ensure that SCSRs used in  
7 our state are in good working order and  
8 that all employees in underground mines  
9 have the best training in their use.  
10 I'd like to also  
11 recognize the many hardworking  
12 professionals at the Office of Miners'  
13 Health, Safety & Training that I've  
14 worked with over the last ten weeks.  
15 They are truly committed to improving  
16 mine safety, and I appreciate their  
17 efforts.  
18 More than anything, I  
19 want you to know that what happened at  
20 Sago was a disaster that moved the  
21 mining industry regulatory agencies,  
22 mine operators and individual miners to  
23 an increased awareness of the  
24 importance of safety and communications  
25 in our mines. This tragic lesson is

Page 34

1 not and will not be forgotten as we  
2 move forward. Thank you.  
3 CHAIR:  
4 Our next speaker from the  
5 legislative panel is Senator Jeff  
6 Kessler, who chairs the Senate  
7 Judiciary Committee. Senator Kessler?  
8 SENATOR KESSLER:  
9 Thank you, Davitt,  
10 members of the panel, and particularly  
11 the families. We are here to find the  
12 truth, and that's what we expect to do  
13 over the next few days. There was a  
14 horrible, horrible tragedy that  
15 occurred in early January of this year.  
16 And I just want you all to know what  
17 the legislature is doing in order to  
18 address this horrible tragedy.  
19 Shortly after the  
20 disaster, the president of the Senate  
21 and Speaker of the House got together  
22 and commissioned a legislative panel, a  
23 bipartisan panel of democrats and  
24 republicans from the Senate and the  
25 House to have a legislative, a West

Page 35

1 Virginia legislature look into and  
2 examine this horrible incident. And  
3 what we can do as your policy makers in  
4 this state to keep that from occurring  
5 in the future.  
6 But it's also important  
7 to note that there are dual tracks,  
8 while the legislature has an ongoing  
9 investigation with the members of the  
10 legislature, who are here today, who  
11 will report to the legislature at the  
12 conclusion of our work. There's also a  
13 dual track ongoing with the federal  
14 Mine Safety & Health Administration  
15 with the state mine officials as well,  
16 who have a separate track based upon  
17 separate legislative federal  
18 requirements.  
19 So while the legislature  
20 is here today, we are separate and  
21 apart from what's going on with MSHA  
22 and its activities. We will, however,  
23 continue to address those issues as  
24 your legislature. But the most  
25 important thing that we have to do is

Page 36

1 to find the truth. I think we all  
2 share the --- we may have dual tracks,  
3 but we have a common purpose, and that  
4 is to find the truth.  
5 We have to determine the  
6 facts and uncover the truth, however  
7 harsh, painful or hard that may be. I  
8 think we all know many of the things,  
9 the who, what, when and where. We know  
10 what happened in January. But the  
11 question that lingers is why, and  
12 that's what we hope to find at the  
13 conclusion of our work. And why do we  
14 need to find the answer? It's simple.  
15 Our job as legislators is to enact  
16 public policy in the state that will  
17 prevent future tragedies from ever  
18 occurring again.  
19 So to the families, on  
20 behalf of the legislature, I pledge  
21 that we will work to find the truth and  
22 to share that with you and to enact and  
23 to enforce legislation in the state to  
24 make sure that our mines, which are so  
25 vital to the state, are the safest and

Page 37

1 most productive, as well as mines in  
2 the country and the world. Thank you.  
3 Thank you very much.  
4 CHAIR:  
5 Thank you. Our next  
6 speaker is Delegate Bill Hamilton of  
7 Buckhannon, who represents this  
8 district in the legislature. Delegate  
9 Hamilton.  
10 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
11 Welcome to Buckhannon and  
12 Upshur County, a community that bonds  
13 together to support and uplift each  
14 other in times of need or in times of  
15 jubilation. I would like to thank West  
16 Virginia Wesleyan College for hosting  
17 our public hearings today.  
18 West Virginia Wesleyan  
19 has always been supportive of our  
20 community, from opening their campus to  
21 visiting high school bands during our  
22 West Virginia Strawberry festival, to  
23 allowing the community to memorialize  
24 our fallen brothers. They have always  
25 been a leader in their support of our

Page 38

1 city and our county.  
2 I'd like to take this  
3 time to thank Governor Joe Manchin, III  
4 and First Lady Gail Manchin for their  
5 support and love in our most tragic  
6 times. Our governor did not have to be  
7 at the Sago Mine site in January. He  
8 could have said I have a legislative  
9 session to prepare for, but he did not.  
10 He came to Upshur County to be with us  
11 because he cared.  
12 Our First Lady, Gail  
13 Manchin, could have said I have too  
14 many duties as your First Lady, but she  
15 did not. Our First Lady spent her time  
16 supporting the McCloy's and the other  
17 families in their time of need. Our  
18 congresswoman, Shelley Moore Capito  
19 could have told us that her schedule  
20 did not permit her coming to Upshur  
21 County, but she did not.  
22 Many were there for moral  
23 support. Local drilling companies  
24 immediately brought equipment to lend a  
25 hand. The United Miner Workers' sent

Page 39

1 rescue teams. Other individuals and  
2 companies donated food, time and  
3 volunteers. On behalf of the citizens  
4 of Upshur County, I wish to express our  
5 heartfelt thanks to each one of you for  
6 your kindness and your caring.  
7 Four months ago, Governor  
8 Manchin appointed David McAteer to  
9 chair this panel today. The members of  
10 this committee were chosen by House  
11 Speaker Robert Kiss and Senate  
12 President Earl Ray Tomblin.  
13 Speaker Kiss appointed me  
14 along with my two House colleagues,  
15 Delegate Caputo and Delegate Frederick.  
16 Senate President Tomblin appointed  
17 three Senate colleagues, Senator  
18 Caruth, Senator Kessler and Senator  
19 Love.  
20 Davitt, I want to thank  
21 you for your efforts and leadership  
22 during that past four months. We  
23 really appreciate you and your staff  
24 and what you've done putting this panel  
25 together.

Page 40

1 I've been asked what our  
2 committee hopes to achieve, my answer  
3 is to leave no stone unturned. Let the  
4 evidence lead us to the cause of this  
5 mine disaster so that we can develop  
6 mine safety regulations whereby these  
7 tragic events will not be repeated in  
8 another mining community.  
9 Since the mine accident,  
10 I have spoken with mine industry  
11 representatives, mine safety  
12 inspectors, coal operators, coal  
13 miners, both union and non-union, and  
14 families of our Sago miners to gain  
15 input. From this input and other  
16 information that has thus far surfaced  
17 regarding the Sago Mine tragedy, I have  
18 questions to which I need answers.  
19 My understanding of our  
20 legislative committee's purpose in  
21 these proceedings is that we are to ask  
22 questions so that we can receive the  
23 answers that our miners' families so  
24 desperately need to obtain closure on  
25 this unfortunate disaster.

Page 41

1 I may not agree with our  
2 questioning procedure today, but I  
3 assure everyone here today that I am  
4 fully committed and determined to seek  
5 answers for our Sago miners' families.  
6 Answers, which I hope will lead to  
7 improvements in mine safety. We cannot  
8 bring back our fallen brothers, but we  
9 can work to make our mines safer for  
10 our current and future miners. Thank  
11 you.  
12 CHAIR:  
13 Delegate Eustace  
14 Frederick of Bluefield.  
15 DELEGATE FREDERICK:  
16 Good morning. I come out  
17 of a coal mining family, and I bring to  
18 you today my deepest sympathy with  
19 condolences to all of the families that  
20 had suffered this great tragedy.  
21 When I was in school,  
22 grade school in the '70s, and I  
23 remember time after time some of my  
24 classmates would be called out of class  
25 because their dads were killed. I never

Page 42

1 forgot that. What a huge tragedy it  
2 was then, what a huge tragedy it has  
3 been for you. And that's why we must  
4 find the cause of this accident and do  
5 what it takes to prevent it from  
6 happening again.  
7 Now, the overall record  
8 of the industry shows from the time  
9 --- I'm talking about in the 1930s, it  
10 goes way back, up in 2006 there have  
11 been huge improvements in coal mine  
12 safety throughout America. America's  
13 known as the safest coal mines in the  
14 world. But our record this year is  
15 totally unacceptable, and we've got to  
16 go at it with that in mind.  
17 It's been said and known  
18 that the safest mines are always the  
19 most productive mines, and none of us  
20 can rest until we stop all of the mine  
21 fatalities.  
22 Again, I've worked in the  
23 industry for over 40 years, I've  
24 studied for 40 years, and our number  
25 one goal, it's always been my goal,

Page 43

1 that there will be no mine fatalities  
2 in America's coal mines. I believe  
3 that is an achievable, doable goal.  
4 Now, we must not let any  
5 stone go unturned until we find the  
6 cause of this accident and do whatever  
7 it takes to prevent future accidents.  
8 Again, I offer my deepest sympathy, and  
9 I believe before this is over with,  
10 that we must find the cause and do what  
11 it takes to prevent future accidents.  
12 Thank you.  
13 CHAIR:  
14 Senator Shirley Love of  
15 Oak Hill.  
16 SENATOR LOVE:  
17 Thank you, Davitt.  
18 Methane gas explosions in coal mines  
19 have been frequent over the past 100  
20 years, but public hearings such as this  
21 one is very, very rare. The last one,  
22 to my knowledge, was held in the hard  
23 coal region of Pennsylvania, sometime  
24 in the early 1970s. But Governor Joe  
25 Manchin, he promised the families of

Page 44

1 the deceased miners that the State of  
2 West Virginia will hold its own public  
3 hearings. And today he's fulfilling  
4 that promise.  
5 Mine safety in West  
6 Virginia has successfully been  
7 accomplished through a series of  
8 layered regulations. And I mean by  
9 this, considering our tragic loss at  
10 the Sago Mine, there are requirements  
11 to prevent methane accumulation. There  
12 are requirements to control ignition  
13 sources. There are requirements to  
14 examine, to assure all is safe and  
15 there's requirements providing means  
16 for miners to escape should the other  
17 requirements fail.  
18 Why did all these rules  
19 fail the miners at Sago? Is the state  
20 and federal government doing enough to  
21 protect our coal miners from future  
22 tragedies? Are there enough  
23 inspectors? Are there enough  
24 resources, is the state and federal  
25 mine agency understaffed, under-funded,

Page 45

1 under-equipped?  
2 These miners and families  
3 only want to determine what went wrong  
4 to cause that explosion, and what could  
5 have been done to save the miners who  
6 survived that initial blast. And  
7 basically, the legislature wants to  
8 find out what went wrong at Sago, and  
9 what we, as a lawmaking body should do  
10 to minimize the chances of such a  
11 tragedy ever happening again. Thank  
12 you.  
13 CHAIR:  
14 Next is Delegate Mike  
15 Caputo from Fairmont.  
16 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
17 Thank you, Davitt. First  
18 of all, my heartfelt condolences to the  
19 family members of the Sago miners.  
20 Being a coal miner of 20 years, I guess  
21 when one coal miner hurts, we all feel  
22 a little bit of pain. And your  
23 nightmare was certainly thought out by  
24 every one of us. And I just want you  
25 to know from the heart, from me and my

Page 46

1 family, you have our warmest heartfelt  
2 condolences on your loss.  
3 And to Governor Manchin  
4 and your wonderful wife, Gail, thank  
5 you for leading these families through  
6 the tragic events of that horrible,  
7 horrible January 2nd eve. Gail was  
8 wonderful when --- and you come from a  
9 wonderful background, Governor, and a  
10 wonderful family, and it was just  
11 family to you. It was a family-  
12 oriented thing. And on behalf of my  
13 colleagues and the State of West  
14 Virginia, I want to publicly say thank  
15 you for what you've done for these  
16 families.  
17 But I think our mission  
18 here --- our mission here is to get to  
19 the truth, no matter what happens. No  
20 matter how hard it may seem to get the  
21 facts together in this case, the truth  
22 must be told, because that's the only  
23 way the mines will be made safer.  
24 That's the only way that miners will be  
25 assured that they can come home at the

Page 47

1 end of the shift. So I urge all  
2 company representatives and miners from  
3 the Sago operation to please be open  
4 and honest at these hearings, and that  
5 the investigation, hopefully, will  
6 unfold and bring together the total  
7 facts of this case, which brings me to  
8 my next couple points.  
9 While I'm very happy that  
10 Governor Manchin is fulfilling his  
11 promise to the families that we're  
12 going to have public and open debate,  
13 there's a couple parties that were not  
14 included in this debate, and one of  
15 those being the United Mine Workers' of  
16 America, which, for full disclosure, I  
17 am an employee of. But the reason I  
18 bring that up, it was UMWA members who  
19 were first on the scene and were  
20 members of the rescue teams that put  
21 forth those heroic efforts. And I  
22 think they should be a part of the  
23 testimony today, but for some reason  
24 the union, even though they are  
25 represented --- representatives of some

Page 48

1 of the miners and representatives of  
2 some of the families, they were left  
3 off today's agenda. And I raised  
4 objections to that earlier, and I want  
5 to make that noted publicly today.  
6 And I'm also very  
7 disappointed that our federal  
8 government, our MSHA, has refused to  
9 answer questions directed to them from  
10 legislators. I think the upper echelon  
11 of MSHA, for whatever reason, made that  
12 decision, and I think that is certainly  
13 the wrong decision. I don't think that  
14 I should have to pass notes back and  
15 forth to Mr. McAteer to get a question  
16 answered of a government agency that's  
17 supposed to represent each and every  
18 one of us. I don't think there's  
19 anybody here for political posturing.  
20 I don't think there's anybody here for  
21 political grandstanding. I think each  
22 and every one of my colleagues at that  
23 table are only here for one reason, to  
24 get to the bottom of this horrible  
25 accident and make sure that your loved

Page 49

1 ones did not die in vain. Thank you  
2 very much.  
3 CHAIR:  
4 And last you'll hear from  
5 Senator Don Caruth of Mercer.  
6 SENATOR CARUTH:  
7 Thank you, Davitt. Some  
8 of you may notice, if you look at the  
9 program, that I'm from Mercer County,  
10 and you probably will notice that other  
11 members of the legislative panel are  
12 from areas in West Virginia that aren't  
13 immediately in this area.  
14 From all of us, I think  
15 our special message to you is that  
16 people throughout the State of West  
17 Virginia share the sympathy for the  
18 family and friends of the Sago miners,  
19 and certainly recognize and appreciate  
20 the heroism involved in so many aspects  
21 of what took place in this tragic  
22 accident.  
23 You may wonder why we're  
24 taking this time for all of us to have  
25 a say this morning in opening this

Page 50

1 session that we're going to have for  
2 the next several days. In regard to  
3 that question, if it's in your mind, I  
4 think perhaps it's important for those  
5 of you who are here to know who we are  
6 on this legislative panel and what our  
7 function is. And I think it's equally  
8 important to know of our determination  
9 to get the right answers to the  
10 questions.  
11 All of the people who are  
12 on the legislative panel were picked  
13 for some particular reason. I am an  
14 attorney and I've had substantial  
15 experience in both surface and  
16 underground investigations and  
17 accidents. Other members of the panel  
18 have other experiences, either in  
19 investigations or directly in coal  
20 mining and coal mine related  
21 activities.  
22 Going back to the first  
23 statement made by Senator Kessler, we  
24 need to --- during the course of this  
25 investigation, we need to get some

Page 51

1 answers to a lot of questions.  
2 The first thing I'll  
3 remind you is, the investigation is not  
4 complete, so the outcome, I suspect, of  
5 the three days we will have here is not  
6 to answer all of the questions. I  
7 don't know that that's possible at this  
8 time. But hopefully, the process we're  
9 going through, the testimony that'll be  
10 offered and the questions that will be  
11 asked will be very helpful in resolving  
12 this process.  
13 There is a lot of  
14 information that's been --- certainly  
15 that has come to the attention of MSHA  
16 and the state --- the Miners' Safety &  
17 Health Administration. There's been a  
18 lot of information in the newspapers.  
19 There's a lot of speculation about what  
20 happened.  
21 What I hope that we can  
22 do while we're here is determine what  
23 of that information is true, separate  
24 fact from fiction, separate rumor from  
25 speculation and identify facts. And in

Page 52

1 addition to that, determine which of  
2 those facts are relevant and material  
3 to what we're looking at these three  
4 days. So that we can determine as a  
5 panel, as a legislative panel, and  
6 those of you who are here in your  
7 individual capacities and in your  
8 professional functions may determine  
9 what went wrong and what caused this  
10 accident. So that we can also review  
11 the rescue procedures and determine how  
12 the rescue techniques can be improved,  
13 how rescue equipment and apparatus can  
14 be improved in the future.  
15 All of this with the goal  
16 of improving miners' safety. So it's  
17 our function here today as a panel, and  
18 I think the function of all ---  
19 certainly all of the investigation  
20 groups to come to some conclusions  
21 based upon the facts, the relevant  
22 facts of what happened so that in the  
23 future, we can prevent such tragic  
24 accidents. So that we can ideally  
25 prevent any serious accidents in coal

Page 53

1 mining activities. So that we can  
2 incorporate new technologies, both in  
3 the coal mining function and in the  
4 rescue function, if rescues and ---  
5 they certainly will be, unfortunately,  
6 --- are necessary in the future.  
7 It's our hope that over  
8 these three days we can advance that  
9 effort. I hope that all of you here  
10 appreciate the fact that there's a lot  
11 of work to be done, and we're going to  
12 hear from a lot of separate and  
13 different people, and we're going to  
14 hear a lot of different views today.  
15 Our function here is to  
16 do the best that we can to receive that  
17 information, make some judgment about  
18 that information, and hopefully in the  
19 future, through a legislative process  
20 or rule-making process, do all that's  
21 possible to improve coal mining safety  
22 in West Virginia. Thank you.  
23 CHAIR:  
24 Thank you very much. All  
25 right. What I would like to do now is

Page 54

1 take a very brief break in order to  
2 allow us to have the first panel this  
3 morning, and that will be the  
4 representatives of the family for the  
5 men who lost their lives at Sago. And  
6 if we take five minutes to allow that  
7 panel to come up and then we can start  
8 it. And Celeste Monforton will be up  
9 here, right here for those family  
10 members who will be making statements.  
11 Thank you.  
12 SHORT BREAK TAKEN  
13 CHAIR:  
14 All right. If we could  
15 assemble again. We'll try to speak  
16 into the microphone for those in the  
17 back who are having a little trouble  
18 hearing. As we indicated to begin  
19 with, this is the first time for us  
20 doing a hearing of this nature, and  
21 therefore we'll --- if we have to make  
22 it up as we go. So some of the family  
23 representatives will come to the  
24 podium, and some would remain, would  
25 like to remain in their chairs. And we

Page 55

1 certainly will permit that and allow  
2 them to speak where they like. First I  
3 would like to call Peggy Cohen, who is  
4 the daughter of Fred Ware, Jr. Peggy.  
5 MS. COHEN:  
6 As I stated, my name is  
7 Peggy Ware-Cohen. I'm also speaking on  
8 behalf of my brother, Darrell Ware. We  
9 lost our dad, Fred G. Ware, Jr. on  
10 January 2nd, 2006. This has been and  
11 continues to be one of the most painful  
12 things we have ever endured. It is a  
13 terrible process to go through.  
14 We have difficulty  
15 eating, sleeping and even functioning  
16 every day. We sit and cry daily. All  
17 we want is our answers to our  
18 questions. We want the honest truth  
19 told to us.  
20 Our dad was a wonderful  
21 man who loved us and his grandchildren.  
22 He was a miner for over 40 years. Our  
23 dad loved being a coal miner, however,  
24 now that he has been taken from us, he  
25 won't be able to do the things he

Page 56

1 loved. We won't be able to go ride  
2 four-wheelers. We won't be able to see  
3 his pearly blue eyes and big smile,  
4 unless we're looking at pictures.  
5 Just seeing him smile and  
6 being so proud of everything, which  
7 made you feel so good. Our dad drove a  
8 1984 Chevy truck with over 400,000  
9 miles. He called it old blue. We used  
10 to pick on him about getting a new  
11 truck, and he had no intentions of  
12 getting a new one. He would say old  
13 blue is broke-in just right.  
14 Our dad loved flea  
15 markets and going to auctions. We used  
16 to go everywhere to them. One time dad  
17 bought a pair of skis, and while we  
18 were sledding, he decided to ski. He  
19 used broomsticks as the ski poles. We  
20 laughed so hard that dad actually did  
21 pretty good skiing, since he had never  
22 skied before.  
23 Dad loved playing  
24 practical jokes on everyone. Since our  
25 dad was taken away from us, we won't be

Page 57

1 able to joke and laugh anymore. We  
2 won't be able to go to dad's house and  
3 watch him tinkering with things trying  
4 to get them to work. I miss my daily  
5 phone calls from dad when he got home  
6 from work to tell me he was home. And  
7 then whether we got together that day  
8 or not, he would always call me every  
9 evening to tell me goodnight and he  
10 loved me. I miss those calls.  
11 Any time I have a  
12 question or needed to talk, he was  
13 there. Dad would always help us fix  
14 things that were broke. He loved  
15 hunting. Dad can't do any of those  
16 things anymore. We used to sit on the  
17 porch and watch humming birds and talk  
18 and laugh. He would play with the  
19 grandkids, always giving them treats.  
20 Dad can't do that anymore either.  
21 We all miss him so much.  
22 We won't get to be with our dad again  
23 until we all meet in heaven. Dad had  
24 so much life and energy in him that we  
25 miss so much. He was always willing to

Page 58

1 help anyone. Dad won't even be able to  
2 see his five grandchildren grow up.  
3 We have so many  
4 questions, especially after reading the  
5 transcripts. Is it coincidental that  
6 Mr. Jamison's fire boss notes got lost?  
7 Is it coincidental that Mr. Sam Kitts  
8 would not elaborate on how the  
9 conclusion was drawn it was caused by  
10 lightning, or how the lightning got in  
11 the sealed area? Is it coincidental  
12 that the CO alarms were going off in  
13 the dispatch office at 6:10 a.m.?  
14 Was the Two Left section  
15 properly fire bossed from Mr. Jamison?  
16 What is the proof if it was  
17 appropriately fire bossed? Is there  
18 documentation that our dad had updated  
19 training? Did our dad have his own  
20 SCSR? Were there enough supplies  
21 located in the mines for these men to  
22 build an appropriate barricade? Why  
23 did it take so long to rescue our dad  
24 and the other miners? Was this a  
25 preventable explosion? Did our dad

Page 59

1 have to die? These are just a few of  
2 the many questions I have. We can only  
3 hope that we get the answers.  
4 The one thing we must do  
5 is to make changes and make these mines  
6 safe for the other miners that continue  
7 to work. We must do something to  
8 prevent any more miners dying and their  
9 families having to endure this pain.  
10 This awful pain. My heart just goes  
11 empty.  
12 We hope that everything  
13 will be investigated thoroughly so we  
14 can get our answers. Please do not  
15 leave any stone unturned. Twelve (12)  
16 men, good family men lost their lives,  
17 and we deserve honest answers to our  
18 questions. We love our dad and miss  
19 him very much. We have to make changes  
20 in mine safety and update the  
21 technology.  
22 Our dad didn't deserve to  
23 die so young. Our prayers are with the  
24 miners that continue to work in this  
25 mine.

Page 60

1 CHAIR:  
2 Next, we'd ask Virginia  
3 Moore, fiancée of Terry Helms, and  
4 Amber Helms, daughter of Terry Helms to  
5 come forward.  
6 MS. MOORE:  
7 Hi, I'm Virginia Moore.  
8 Mine's not quite as long as what  
9 Peggy's was, but it all means the same  
10 and it gets to the point.  
11 I'm Terry Helms' fiancée.  
12 We was to be married this summer. He  
13 was one of the best things that ever  
14 happened to me. Our love for each  
15 other was the strongest you could ever  
16 imagine and ever feel. It was almost  
17 like being saved and accepting Jesus  
18 into your life. It's a wonderful  
19 feeling, and that's what our love felt  
20 like to each other.  
21 See, without Terry  
22 there's half of my heart gone, because  
23 he made it whole. And without with him  
24 here today, I'm sure all the family  
25 members, that there's a great piece

Page 61

1 that will never ever be filled again in  
2 our hearts.  
3 Since he is gone, we are  
4 here to ask you all for answers and  
5 hope that we may get some closure to  
6 this.  
7 MS. HELMS:  
8 My name is Amber Helms.  
9 And my father, of course, was Terry  
10 Michael Helms. He's also survived by a  
11 son, Nicholas Michael Helms, who  
12 couldn't make it today. Virginia  
13 Moore, his fiancée. His brother John  
14 Helms and his sister Judy Helms.  
15 Excuse me.  
16 My dad, in my eyes, was  
17 perfect. He was a fantastic role  
18 model, a devoted father, a loving  
19 companion and a reliable friend. To  
20 me, Terry Michael Helms was not just a  
21 father, he was that fantastic role  
22 model to me. He was a man who would  
23 stop in the middle of a rainy day to  
24 help someone change a tire, a man who  
25 would help even if he didn't have the



1 time because he would just simply make  
2 the time.  
3 My father taught me that  
4 I could do anything, and I mean  
5 anything. I remember one incident was  
6 mowing leaves and they kind of caught  
7 fire. And he ran to me, got me off and  
8 he stopped it. And of course, I didn't  
9 want to get back on, but he made me.  
10 He made me overcome my fears and he  
11 made me believe that I can do anything,  
12 and even if it was scary, I could do  
13 anything, and that's why I'm here  
14 today, because he made me believe in  
15 myself.  
16 He was that devoted  
17 father to me. He was always there for  
18 me and my brother. He wouldn't miss  
19 anything, unless he had to work, of  
20 course. And many times he would come  
21 straight from work to my track or cross  
22 country or basketball games, even if  
23 all he saw was me crossing the finish  
24 line or the last couple seconds in each  
25 ball game, but oftentimes he made it

1 for the beginning.  
2 One year I said I didn't  
3 think he was going to make it to the  
4 race, and halfway through I heard him  
5 yelling. All the rush that gave me, I  
6 think I came in first, at least in my  
7 eyes, because I wanted to do good for  
8 him. So no matter what it was, no  
9 matter what time of night, or morning  
10 hour, he was always there.  
11 He was that loving  
12 companion to me. Through college I was  
13 single, and oftentimes I'd call him up  
14 and I was crying and lonely, and he  
15 would make sure that I would know that  
16 everything will be okay. He would  
17 assure me that everything would work  
18 out, but last summer I spent at home  
19 with him, I decided that so long as I  
20 live near him, I could be single my  
21 whole life, because that's the kind of  
22 relationship we had. But shortly after  
23 I found the love of my life, who he  
24 highly approved of, so it was great.  
25 Terry was just one of

1 those men that anybody could just love.  
2 I recently had dinner with a friend  
3 who I used to play basketball with and  
4 track, and she made the comment that  
5 described him as the big teddy bear in  
6 the crowd. And she was definitely  
7 right. And he wasn't just a father to  
8 me, he wasn't just a father to my  
9 brother, he was a father to many of my  
10 friends. His nickname was Dad Helms on  
11 my basketball team, and he definitely  
12 was like a dad to all of them.  
13 And he was that reliable  
14 friend to me. And this could be the  
15 most important part of our  
16 relationship, and that was our  
17 friendship. We could talk about really  
18 anything. And he didn't look at me as  
19 just his daughter, he looked at me as a  
20 good friend that needed some good  
21 advice. If I needed an outfit for  
22 school, he would go and help me pick it  
23 out, and I must say he had some very  
24 good taste.  
25 And if I needed some

1 ideas for a project, he came up with  
2 the best ideas. And if there was  
3 anything I was unsure about with my  
4 actions, he was the first one that I  
5 called, because he knew me the best. He  
6 was my best friend.  
7 This is the man that I no  
8 longer have. I'm not sure anybody  
9 could understand how lonely I often  
10 feel. I'm so well at masking it. I  
11 can't ask his opinion on anything. And  
12 I can't even find out what his favorite  
13 singer is now, or his favorite cartoon,  
14 because we watched a lot of those.  
15 Most importantly, I can't talk to him  
16 and get a response, because believe me,  
17 I talk to him every day.  
18 Terry Michael Helms is  
19 why I'm here today. I hope that being  
20 here today and tomorrow, I can have  
21 several questions answered, such as  
22 that morning, did he call out? Who  
23 answered his call, and what was  
24 actually written in the books that we  
25 can't find, the fire boss books that we

Page 66

1 haven't found?  
2 And lastly, I would like  
3 to thank everybody who is here today,  
4 everybody that is here for trying to  
5 help the families better understand  
6 what happened that terrible day of  
7 January 2nd, 2006 that took our loved  
8 one's life. Thank you.  
9 CHAIR:  
10 Next, I'd like to have  
11 Pam Campbell, sister-in-law of Marty  
12 Bennett and Russell Bennett, his son,  
13 to come forward.  
14 MR. BENNETT:  
15 My name is Russell  
16 Bennett. I was employed at Sago Mines  
17 at the time of the accident. I am here  
18 today to represent my dad, Marty  
19 Bennett. I could spend the rest of the  
20 day telling you how good of a dad and  
21 how good of a friend he was, but I have  
22 that in my heart.  
23 I'm also here today to  
24 represent my co-workers and their  
25 families. I had the privilege of

Page 67

1 working with every one of these men,  
2 and they didn't have --- they don't  
3 make a better crew than what these men  
4 were.  
5 I hope the questions we  
6 ask today not only gives us resolution  
7 and helps us save the lives of present  
8 and future coal miners.  
9 There's many things that  
10 went wrong. The rescue efforts, or  
11 should I say recovery efforts. The  
12 response time was unacceptable. The  
13 decisions made to wait, not to go in  
14 because of CO in the returns, you know,  
15 that's unacceptable. And we turn  
16 around at the Aracoma Mines and we go  
17 right in knowing that we have a fire,  
18 knowing the conditions we had. And  
19 that's just unacceptable, but hopefully  
20 we'll have results.  
21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
22 My name is Pam Campbell.  
23 My sister Judy was married to Marty  
24 Bennett. They had this young man, who  
25 they were very proud of. And before

Page 68

1 January the 2nd, 2006, most of you,  
2 myself, didn't even know the name Tom  
3 Anderson, James Bennett, Marty Bennett,  
4 Jesse Jones, David Lewis, Terry Helms,  
5 Martin Toler, Jackie Weaver, Marshall  
6 Winans, Fred Ware, Junior Hamner, Jerry  
7 Groves and Randal McCloy. However, I  
8 did know one of these men. I knew Marty  
9 Bennett from the time I was 15 years  
10 old. He married my sister in 1973, 33  
11 years ago, and they had this wonderful  
12 young man, and they adored him.  
13 I would like to remind  
14 you that today is not about MSHA, today  
15 is not about ICG, the State of West  
16 Virginia. It's not about our governor,  
17 it's not about our politicians we have  
18 here. It's about these people and  
19 these people, and these gentlemen that  
20 you see behind you.  
21 The families have lost  
22 husbands, fathers, sons, brothers,  
23 brother-in-laws, and for my nephew, not  
24 only did he lose his dad, but he lost  
25 his very best friend in the whole

Page 69

1 world. And my sister lost her  
2 soulmate. It's about 12 men who died  
3 doing what they were trained to do.  
4 They tried to escape, and  
5 when they couldn't escape, they went  
6 back where they knew they had air, and  
7 they barricaded themselves the way they  
8 were taught. And as they shared  
9 rescuers amongst them, they beat on the  
10 roof bolts and nobody listened. They  
11 waited for the blast from the surface,  
12 and those blasts never came.  
13 Today, not only do I  
14 speak for my sister and my nephew and  
15 my entire family, I'm going to take it  
16 upon me to also speak for the rest of  
17 these families. We expect to get  
18 answers to these questions. And so far  
19 these answers have not come. Thank  
20 you.  
21 CHAIR:  
22 Next, I'd ask Samantha  
23 Lewis, the wife of Dave Lewis, to come  
24 forward.  
25 MS. LEWIS:

Page 70

1 Four months ago today my  
 2 husband walked out the front door  
 3 expecting to come home. He kissed me  
 4 goodbye, and he said I'll see you  
 5 tonight. It will be difficult for  
 6 myself and the three children of  
 7 David's to continue, but we will  
 8 continue, because we are survivors.  
 9 We will not let these men  
 10 let their death be in vain. We've  
 11 often heard the same while we've been  
 12 here today. We will leave no stone  
 13 unturned, and we will find the truth.  
 14 Well rest assured myself, as well as my  
 15 family and these other families will  
 16 not allow you to leave a stone unturned  
 17 or to let the truth go unheard.  
 18 We've heard the families  
 19 speak that they've lost their soulmate,  
 20 they've lost their best friend and  
 21 they've lost their everything. I  
 22 understand those words because I, too,  
 23 lost my everything.  
 24 I have great memories of  
 25 my husband and of our family together.

Page 71

1 Whether it was my husband's  
 2 competition with my mother on who had  
 3 the yard of the month and  
 4 David driving by with a yard of the  
 5 month sign in the truck so my mother  
 6 couldn't steal it out of our yard.  
 7 Our vacations and our  
 8 children, and the memories that we  
 9 have. To the families that have been  
 10 left behind, I hope you can find a way  
 11 to move on. I hope you can find a way  
 12 for healing, and I hope you can find a  
 13 way in your heart to make it through  
 14 the next two days, the next two weeks,  
 15 and the next two years, the next 20  
 16 years.  
 17 I will always be the wife  
 18 of David Lewis, just as all of you will  
 19 always be the son, the father, sister,  
 20 the daughter. Find a way in your heart  
 21 to continue.  
 22 Thank you to everyone  
 23 that has supported our families, the  
 24 community, the state, the nation and  
 25 the world. We are forever grateful for

Page 72

1 the cards, the prayer shawls, the  
 2 letters, the flowers and everything  
 3 that has been sent on our behalves. We  
 4 are greatly appreciative for  
 5 everything.  
 6 I could tell you all  
 7 about my husband. He has a great soul,  
 8 and he was a wonderful father and a  
 9 wonderful husband. The key term is  
 10 was, because he is gone. Those  
 11 questions need to be answered on why  
 12 our families are gone. Thank you.  
 13 CHAIR:  
 14 Christopher Toler, son of  
 15 Martin Toler, Jr.  
 16 MR. C.TOLER:  
 17 My name is Chris Toler.  
 18 I'm the son of Martin Toler, Jr. He  
 19 was the only one man that I truly trust  
 20 with everything that I have in my life.  
 21 And if it was not for that man, I  
 22 would have nothing in my life.  
 23 Our family wants to know  
 24 the answers to the explosion and what  
 25 happened that day, as well as the rest

Page 73

1 of the families. And we're all for all  
 2 the different safety measures that are  
 3 going to be made in the future because  
 4 of this. But no matter what safety  
 5 efforts that you make, we don't live in  
 6 a perfect world and accidents will  
 7 occur. It's a step that you make after  
 8 the accidents that provides life or  
 9 death.  
 10 West Virginia is home of  
 11 the best trained miners in the world  
 12 today. And for anyone to question  
 13 their training of the Two Left crew,  
 14 it's unacceptable. These men did what  
 15 they was trained to do. They donned  
 16 their SCSRs, they went down, tried to  
 17 escape, went up the intake and  
 18 barricaded theirselves all while in the  
 19 blind. So these men were trained quite  
 20 well.  
 21 They pounded on a bolt,  
 22 wasting precious air, and no one is up  
 23 above listening for them. And that's a  
 24 question that I want to know is why.  
 25 Instead of pointing

Page 74

1 fingers at the crew of Two Left and the  
2 training they have, MSHA is the one  
3 that needs to be doing some training on  
4 their own. To know how to get inside  
5 there and get the men out safely to  
6 their families.  
7 My father loved each and  
8 every one of those men that's on that  
9 crew. And out of all the things that  
10 could have happened to my father, I'm  
11 glad that he was with those men when he  
12 did go. Thank you.  
13 CHAIR:  
14 Next is Shelly Groves and  
15 John Groves, brother of Jerry Lee  
16 Groves and daughter of Jerry Lee  
17 Groves.  
18 MS. GROVES-ROSE:  
19 Good morning. I'm Shelly  
20 Groves Rose. Jerry Groves was my dad.  
21 On January 2nd, 2006, four months ago  
22 today, my family's lives were changed  
23 forever. That day, we lost a huge part  
24 of ourselves. My mom lost her husband,  
25 I lost my dad, and my three boys lost

Page 75

1 their grandfather. A son was lost, a  
2 brother was lost, an uncle was lost.  
3 My dad was one of the  
4 most import persons in my life. And he  
5 means more to me than I can ever stand  
6 up here and express in words. He was a  
7 wonderful man. He was kind and  
8 generous and loving and fun. He was  
9 dependable, honest, and he was a hard  
10 worker. He put all he had into his  
11 job. He rarely, if ever missed a day  
12 of work. Really, the only time he  
13 missed work was when he was on  
14 vacation. Other than that, he was at  
15 work faithfully every day.  
16 He was good at his job,  
17 and he was a dependable, safe coal  
18 miner. My dad has a very special place  
19 in the hearts of my three boys. My boys  
20 loved spending time with their pop-pop.  
21 And he loved being with them. He  
22 taught them to drive a four-wheeler,  
23 took my oldest on his first hunting  
24 trip just this past November and was  
25 looking forward to many more.

Page 76

1 We all miss him  
2 tremendously. And my boys talk about  
3 him all the time. For a long time  
4 after the disaster, my seven-year-old  
5 son, Zachary, would take a picture of  
6 pop-pop to bed with him and keep it by  
7 his pillow. And he still takes  
8 grandpa's wrist watch to bed and lays  
9 it on his pillow every day.  
10 Our hearts are broken.  
11 More than just broken. They've been  
12 ripped out of our chest and shredded to  
13 a million pieces. I know that time  
14 will slowly heal wounds, but there's a  
15 part of my heart that will never be  
16 healed. That's the part of my heart  
17 that was with my dad in that coal mine  
18 for 41 hours and the part that went on  
19 with him to eternity.  
20 My hopes and prayers  
21 today are that the testimony that we're  
22 going to hear over the next couple of  
23 days will help us find some peace. I  
24 expect that each and every person being  
25 questioned today and tomorrow show

Page 77

1 respect for our lost loved ones. We  
2 deserve the respect. Show respect,  
3 please, by answering our questions  
4 fully and completely, and most  
5 importantly truthfully.  
6 We all deserve the truth,  
7 and we deserve to know what happened on  
8 January 2nd. Thank you.  
9 MR. GROVES:  
10 Good morning. My name's  
11 John Groves. I'm the brother of Jerry  
12 Groves. I'd like to say that he was a  
13 loving and caring man. And he touched  
14 everybody that miss --- everybody that  
15 knew Jerry knew that he was in their  
16 lives, because he was a great man.  
17 He's going to be missed by everybody  
18 that knew him.  
19 Him and his wife, Debbie,  
20 would stop by our house often, maybe  
21 for a glass of my wife's homemade  
22 lemonade. That was one of Jerry's  
23 favorite things, was homemade lemonade.  
24 He would stop by. We'd sit around,  
25 we'd chat. Jerry's always a happy

Page 78

1 person. He's always willing to help  
2 anyone.  
3 You know, even though  
4 he's gone now, he's going to be helping  
5 people, because we're going to be,  
6 through him, working to make sure that  
7 a disaster like this never happens.  
8 And we assure you Mr.  
9 Politicians that we're not going to let  
10 this rest. We know in our hearts this  
11 can be corrected, and it needs to be  
12 done immediately. It needs to be done  
13 now. And it's on you --- it's on you  
14 to make the changes. You have the  
15 power to do so, and it's your  
16 responsibility to do it.  
17 Every day that goes by we  
18 have maybe another chance for another  
19 disaster. And if it happens without  
20 these changes implemented, remember you  
21 are the ones that are responsible,  
22 because you're responsible for making  
23 these changes. We can't do it. We have  
24 to have you do it for us. That's why  
25 you're there, is to make sure that it

Page 79

1 never happens again.  
2 And we ask you, please,  
3 from the bottom of our hearts to make  
4 for sure that this is done. To make  
5 for sure that this is done. We rely on  
6 you Senator. We rely on you to make  
7 for sure. It can't happen again.  
8 People's lives have been changed  
9 forever because of what's happened, and  
10 you can't let this happen again. No one  
11 needs to go through this ever again.  
12 And it's up to you to make for sure.  
13 January 2nd, all of us  
14 became families. We all waited inside  
15 of the church, a little country church  
16 in Sago, West Virginia. We all kindly  
17 came in as time went by. We all met  
18 each other and hugged each other and  
19 realized how much we all meant to each  
20 other.  
21 During that 40 hours, I  
22 feel that I experienced my brother's  
23 death with him. We sat there, and we  
24 could look over at the coal mine. And  
25 the pain and the hurt that was through

Page 80

1 everybody as we sat there and we  
2 waited, and we waited, as we waited for  
3 the answer to come, that they're okay,  
4 but that answer never come.  
5 This disaster has touched  
6 people from all over the world, and I  
7 would like to thank the people for all  
8 the cards they sent. Some of the cards  
9 that we got were from little children  
10 that took the time to tell us how much  
11 that they loved us, loved all of us.  
12 It was so heartfelt and touching, and  
13 I'm sure we all can remember reading  
14 those cards.  
15 We thank you for the love  
16 that you shared with us. I'd like to  
17 thank Governor Manchin for what he's  
18 done, by giving us the opportunity to  
19 be here, to be able to get some  
20 questions answered today.  
21 The governor assigned  
22 each of us families someone to help us.  
23 And I would like to thank Krista for  
24 everything that she's done. She's been  
25 very helpful with all of our families.

Page 81

1 I'd like to thank Davitt. Sir, we  
2 rely on you to get our answers for us  
3 today. And I know this is heartfelt  
4 for you, and I'm sure that you will.  
5 Celeste, I don't know  
6 where she is. She kind of stays behind  
7 the scenes, but she's been tremendous.  
8 Celeste has absolutely been tremendous  
9 in helping getting all of this stuff.  
10 There was times that my  
11 mother has some very bad days. The  
12 governor would call and want to know  
13 how Mother Groves is today. That's  
14 what the Governor called her Mother  
15 Groves. And I think a lot of you come  
16 to call her Mother Groves, because she  
17 meant so much to all of us.  
18 Mr. Crumrine has told us  
19 not to worry about what goes on behind  
20 those seals, it's not important. The  
21 federal and state officials have said  
22 it's not important, kind of just keep a  
23 close watch on what goes on back there,  
24 it's not that important. Well, we know  
25 now that they are, don't we? We know

Page 82

1 now that what goes on behind those  
2 seals is important.  
3 And I hope after what  
4 we've all went through and what we had  
5 to face, that we realize how important  
6 those seals are, and we need to make  
7 for sure that this doesn't ever happen  
8 again now that we know how important  
9 the seals are.  
10 Mr. Crumrine, ICG  
11 officials, government officials, state  
12 officials, we ask you to keep an eye on  
13 what goes on behind them seals, because  
14 if we don't, there's going to be  
15 another one of these someday.  
16 There's been disasters  
17 that's happened and it comes to the  
18 forefront, but I'd like to say that  
19 this is one time it's going to stay in  
20 the forefront. It's not going to be  
21 swept under the rug as years go by and  
22 time goes by and forgotten. And you  
23 gentlemen are responsible to make for  
24 sure of that. And if it's forgotten,  
25 you gentlemen are responsible the next

Page 83

1 time we come to the hearings.  
2 I really feel that in my  
3 heart, because we can't do it  
4 ourselves, you have to do it for us.  
5 And I know to have it in your heart,  
6 sir --- I know in your heart you've  
7 answered some tough questions for us in  
8 some of our meetings, sir, and I know  
9 this is heartfelt for you, too. And we  
10 just ask you that you get our answers  
11 for us.  
12 I'd like to thank Randal  
13 and Ann McCloy for sharing with us what  
14 happened. Randal, I'd like to tell  
15 you, sir, that it was a very heroic and  
16 commendable thing that you've done.  
17 And the other ones, I'm not sure how  
18 that went, so I'm not going to say  
19 much, but I just ---. Randal, to know  
20 that you shared with my brother trying  
21 to save his life by putting your own at  
22 risk tells us what type of men was in  
23 there. And I thank you.  
24 You know, we've talked  
25 about the training. These men put on

Page 84

1 their self-contain rescue units, it  
2 failed them. These men built a  
3 barricade like they were trained, and  
4 it failed.  
5 I had the privilege to go  
6 under the ground to see where my  
7 brother was found. You could see the  
8 roof bolts. I don't know if any of you  
9 know, but I'm sure a lot of you do.  
10 The roof bolt on the top of the ceiling  
11 where they took the sledge hammer,  
12 pounding for someone to help them, that  
13 failed, too.  
14 With over 200 years of  
15 training here, now they're telling us  
16 that failed them, too. No, I'm sorry.  
17 They did all they were trained to do,  
18 and they were the ones that were  
19 failed. They were the ones that were  
20 failed here.  
21 I would like to thank you  
22 on behalf of myself, my mother, Mother  
23 Groves, my sister Sandy Neal  
24 (phonetic), Becky Rogers, Geraldine  
25 Grusso (phonetic), Ronnie Groves, Bobby

Page 85

1 Groves, and Raymond Groves, and the  
2 rest of the Groves family. We thank  
3 you for this opportunity to find out  
4 our answers. And Davitt, we leave it  
5 up to you to get them for us. Thank  
6 you very much.  
7 CHAIR:  
8 Next I'd call on Debbie  
9 Hamner, wife of George "Junior" Hamner.  
10 MS. HAMNER:  
11 That's a picture of my  
12 husband there, fourth on the left, your  
13 left, the one with the Budweiser hat.  
14 You know, it's been reported that my  
15 husband was a private man, and I'd like  
16 to set the record straight right now.  
17 That information didn't come from me.  
18 In fact, the opposite is true. Private  
19 probably describes me better than it  
20 would him.  
21 Junior loved life and he  
22 enjoyed life. He had lots and lots of  
23 friends. And he was most happy when he  
24 was sharing good times with good  
25 friends. For instance, every year the

Page 86

1 hunting camp was at our farm. I assure  
2 you Junior Hamner was an intelligent  
3 man, and I know that he was an  
4 excellent coal miner. And I know that  
5 he struggled to do everything in  
6 his power to save himself and his  
7 fellow co-workers that morning of  
8 January 2nd. But instead, what he was  
9 going to do was going to share another  
10 time with friends, not a good time.  
11 Junior was my high school  
12 sweetheart and my best friend. I've  
13 been robbed of my best friend. Because  
14 of this tragedy, my life is never going  
15 to be the same. And the only peace  
16 that I may find is that if the real  
17 truth surrounding the Sago Mine  
18 disaster isn't uncovered. All I'm left  
19 with now are questions. Lightning,  
20 lightning.  
21 ICG says the explosion  
22 was caused by lightning. If that is  
23 true --- right on. If that is true,  
24 how did the lightning ignite an  
25 explosion underground? How did the

Page 87

1 electrical charge from lightning get  
2 behind the seals? Was the electrical  
3 system properly grounded and protected  
4 against lightning?  
5 I also would like to  
6 thank Randal McCloy for his letter.  
7 Randal McCloy reported that some of the  
8 self-contained self-rescuers didn't  
9 work that morning. I'd say Randal has  
10 to be the expert. MSHA says it tested  
11 those self-rescuers and they worked.  
12 Why would Randal report that they  
13 didn't if they did?  
14 The seals were built by  
15 inexperienced miners. That came out in  
16 the transcripts. Why weren't the  
17 miners who built the seals better  
18 trained in the proper way to conduct  
19 the --- to construct the seals? MSHA's  
20 interviews show that at least one miner  
21 was told to certify he had training  
22 that he never had. Why did this  
23 happen? And was this the only case of  
24 falsified training records?  
25 John Boni fire bossed

Page 88

1 that mine Wednesday before the  
2 explosion happened on Monday. He  
3 detected methane. He reported that to  
4 his supervisor, Carl Crumrine. Carl  
5 followed up on Thursday, and Carl  
6 confirmed that there was, indeed,  
7 methane escaping around the seals.  
8 What did management do to monitor the  
9 methane in the areas of the seals  
10 between Thursday and the explosion on  
11 Monday?  
12 There were two  
13 pre-shift fire bosses that morning of  
14 January 2nd. Terry Helms, who perished  
15 in the disaster, along with my husband  
16 and his co-workers, and also Fred  
17 Jamison. Now, Fred says his fire boss  
18 notes were stolen out of his jacket  
19 pocket that morning after the  
20 explosion. I find that hard to  
21 believe.  
22 Terry Helms called his  
23 report out to John Boni. Johnny says,  
24 Terry reported two small violations,  
25 but he can't remember what they were.

Page 89

1 My husband's dead. So there's no small  
2 violation to me.  
3 ICG received several  
4 citations before the explosion, and  
5 according to MSHA, many citations have  
6 been issued since the explosion. Why  
7 did this mine have so many safety  
8 problems?  
9 ICG seems to believe that  
10 this explosion was an unavoided  
11 accident. This explosion, I believe,  
12 was preventable. And I don't call this  
13 an accident, I call this a disaster.  
14 Is it really just a coincidence that  
15 the explosion occurred in a mine that  
16 had so many problems complying with  
17 mine safety laws? But I want to result  
18 throughout the next couple days is a  
19 fair and thorough hearing so that I as  
20 well as other family members of the  
21 fallen miners, may learn the real truth  
22 surrounding our loved one's death.  
23 I would like to bring  
24 public attention to the issue --- this  
25 issue in the hopes that better mine

Page 90

1 safety laws can be implemented and  
2 enforced so that we do not have to  
3 witness a tragedy of this magnitude  
4 again, and that no other miner has to  
5 give his life or her life to support  
6 their families.  
7 Maybe then, and only then  
8 will my husband's death and those of  
9 his co-workers not be in vain. Thank  
10 you.  
11 CHAIR:  
12 Charlotte Weaver, widow  
13 of Jackie Weaver.  
14 MS. WEAVER:  
15 As Davitt said, my name  
16 is Charlotte Weaver. My son Justin  
17 told me today he wanted to read this.  
18 And he wanted me to change a couple of  
19 things, which I did. And he said, mom,  
20 if you get through the first paragraph,  
21 you'll be okay. And I agree with him  
22 on that.  
23 I've been the wife of  
24 Jackie Lynn Weaver for a little over 13  
25 years. A lot of the coal miners have

Page 91

1 nicknames they go by. Everyone that  
2 worked with my husband called him  
3 Jackie, which is his real name. I knew  
4 him as Jack, and most of my family, his  
5 brothers called him Jack. And Becky and  
6 Justin called him dad. And Gavin and  
7 Dylan called him granddad.  
8 Jack was a good man, a  
9 good Christian, a good husband, a good  
10 dad, and a hunting and fishing buddy  
11 for Justin and Junior Hamner. And now  
12 Justin, who's 12 years old, tells me he  
13 wants to be a mine rescue worker so he  
14 can help save people so nobody has to  
15 go through what we've been through.  
16 And I've explained to him that being a  
17 mine rescue worker, you don't always  
18 get to save the guys that are there,  
19 and he understands that.  
20 Jack was my best friend.  
21 He was the answer to my prayer many  
22 years ago, and he's the love of my life  
23 and always will be. He loved his  
24 family. He loved the outdoors. He  
25 loved to hunt and fish. He was a good

Page 92

1 and experienced coal miner. So when I  
2 hear comments about not being well-  
3 trained, I know there was no one on  
4 that Two-Left crew that was not well-  
5 trained. And I knew he would have done  
6 everything that he possibly could have  
7 in order to return home to us that  
8 evening.  
9 My family and I would  
10 like to thank Governor Manchin and his  
11 staff for their support that they've  
12 given us since January 2nd, the date of  
13 the explosion. We also want to thank  
14 Davitt McAteer, Celeste and Debbie for  
15 being so helpful and considerate and  
16 providing us information and answers  
17 leading up to this point in the  
18 hearings today. We're also very  
19 grateful to Randal McCloy for the  
20 letter to the families to let us know  
21 some of the things that were going on  
22 underground that day.  
23 I know in my heart all of  
24 these men went to heaven to gather, and  
25 they're watching over us now.

Page 93

1 I want to especially  
2 thank Jeff Toler, Owen Jones, Dick  
3 Wilfong, Vernon Hofer and Al Schoonover  
4 for their efforts in trying to reach  
5 our men on the Two Left crew. They  
6 were so close, yet so far away. Also,  
7 thank you to the mine rescue crews that  
8 came to the scene and were prepared to  
9 put their lives on the line in order to  
10 save our loved ones. I believe that 98  
11 to 100 percent of these mine rescue  
12 workers would have risked their lives  
13 and gone into the mines to get our  
14 family members out of there if they had  
15 been given permission to do so.  
16 It is unacceptable to me  
17 and my family, and I'm sure many others  
18 that the rescuers were not allowed to  
19 enter the mine and do their jobs. To  
20 me, this is like calling out the fire  
21 department and having them respond to a  
22 house fire, and then standing and  
23 watching the house burn knowing there  
24 are people inside of the house.  
25 Something needs changed.



Page 94

1 If there's some kind of book or manual  
2 to go by for rescuers to go by, or for  
3 rescue operations to go by, that book  
4 needs to be put in the trash and start  
5 over. This system does not work.  
6 We know that our men were  
7 underground taking turns ---. We know  
8 that our men were underground taking  
9 turns beating on the roof bolts so  
10 someone on the surface would hear them  
11 and know their location, but guess  
12 what, nobody was listening. Again, the  
13 powers that be failed them. Our men  
14 were sent underground with one-hour's  
15 worth of oxygen, or air, and they were  
16 in there for over 40 hours.  
17 I do not believe that my  
18 husband gave his life in order for  
19 changes to be made in the mining  
20 industry. I don't think he had a  
21 choice in that matter. Nobody asked  
22 him. I do know that if the occasion  
23 ever arose and he was in a situation  
24 where he would have to lay his life on  
25 the line for his fellow men, he would

Page 95

1 do it in a heartbeat.  
2 I do think as a result of  
3 the deaths of these 12 good men, the  
4 very least we can do is to see that  
5 proper safety measures are taken so  
6 that no other family member has to  
7 endure what we have endured and will  
8 continue to endure for the rest of our  
9 lives.  
10 CHAIR:  
11 And last we'll hear from  
12 Ann Meredith, daughter of James  
13 Bennett.  
14 MS. MEREDITH:  
15 The first thing that I  
16 would like to read today and to let  
17 everybody know, the note that my dad  
18 left for my family. It says, Lily, I  
19 love you. If someone finds this,  
20 please give this to my wife. I love  
21 you. We have air right now, but the  
22 smoke is bad. Tell my mother I love  
23 her and my kids, love daddy. And he  
24 wrote that at 11:40 a.m.  
25 At 3:07, the air is bad.

Page 96

1 I don't know how long we can last.  
2 Call for 457-4412, Jim Bennett. At  
3 4:22 p.m. he wrote time is running out  
4 for us. We have not heard anything  
5 from the outside yet. And the last  
6 thing that he wrote was at 4:25 p.m. I  
7 love you. And he tried to write my  
8 name but could not finish.  
9 My name is Ann  
10 Bennett-Meredith, and I am the daughter  
11 of the late Jim Bennett, who was one of  
12 the 12 that perished in the Sago Mine  
13 accident. My dad was going to retire  
14 this past April in 2006, but he never  
15 got the chance to.  
16 He and my mom was going  
17 to do some traveling and grow older  
18 gracefully together. He was going to  
19 get to enjoy spending time with his  
20 seven grandchildren and two great  
21 grandchildren. Now the chance of that  
22 ever happening is gone, not only for my  
23 dad, but also for his grandchildren.  
24 Dad had a huge smile and  
25 a handshake for all he met. He had a

Page 97

1 great love for his wife and children  
2 and also for the Lord as well. I could  
3 call upon my dad for advice or for a  
4 shoulder to cry on, but now my dad is  
5 gone, and who do I call?  
6 Daddy was a good  
7 Christian man and very active in his  
8 church. He was the assistant Sunday  
9 school superintendent and would also  
10 hold some devotional services as well.  
11 It's hard for me to walk into our  
12 church and not find my dad standing at  
13 the door and greeting folks as they  
14 would come in with a smile and a  
15 handshake.  
16 When my husband and  
17 children and myself would walk through  
18 the door, dad knew he was going to get  
19 a big hug from me. He would say I'm  
20 glad to see you this morning Sis. And  
21 when he yelled after church, do ya'll  
22 want to come down to the house and  
23 watch a movie and spend the afternoon  
24 with your mom and me?  
25 We had our family

1 traditions, and just to mention a  
 2 couple. We would have the annual  
 3 family wiener roast in August and  
 4 making homemade ice cream on Christmas  
 5 Eve. But now our family traditions are  
 6 minus one last person now. That's my  
 7 dad. And it's just not fair.  
 8 I never got the chance to  
 9 see my dad at church on Sunday before  
 10 he died. I had the flu and wasn't able  
 11 to make it, so therefore I lost a  
 12 chance to get to spend that last day  
 13 with my father. After church he called  
 14 to see how I was doing. And the last  
 15 words that I got to hear my dad say to  
 16 me was, is Sis sick? And guess where I  
 17 took your mom and grandma to lunch  
 18 after church. Well, let me tell you  
 19 where I took them. He said, I took  
 20 them to Burger King. And he began to  
 21 munch chili cheese fries in my ear.  
 22 And he said, oh, yeah, and by the way,  
 23 you need to eat some chicken noodle  
 24 soup.  
 25 The very last words my

1 dad said to me was, Sissy, you know  
 2 daddy loves you. I never dreamed in a  
 3 million years those would be the last  
 4 words that I would ever hear my dad say  
 5 to me.  
 6 I kept thinking for my  
 7 dad to walk through the doors just any  
 8 time as if we were playing hide and go  
 9 seek like we did when I was a little  
 10 girl. Daddy really enjoyed life. I  
 11 remember one time when the Hecht's  
 12 Department Store was still in business,  
 13 my dad was telling jokes as we were  
 14 walking into the store through the  
 15 doors and his false teeth fell out on  
 16 the floor, and they started scooting  
 17 across the floor. My dad did a belly  
 18 flopper on the floor and went chasing  
 19 after his teeth. They went under the  
 20 ladies clothing rack, and he dives  
 21 right underneath and gets them. And he  
 22 looks up at the lady looking through  
 23 the clothes, and he says, excuse me,  
 24 ma'am, I lost my teeth. He spits on  
 25 them and wipes them off and then puts

1 them back in his mouth and just goes on  
 2 like nothing ever happened.  
 3 Good times like that will  
 4 always be in my heart, but my dad  
 5 should also still be here with us  
 6 having more of those good times. When  
 7 we were told that the miners were found  
 8 alive and would be coming over to the  
 9 church with their loved ones, I went up  
 10 the road --- I went up that road to see  
 11 and be as close to the opening of that  
 12 mine when they brought them men out,  
 13 because I knew my dad would be coming  
 14 out of there. And I knew the final  
 15 words I would --- or the first words he  
 16 would say, would be praise the Lord,  
 17 we're all out alive.  
 18 But I was heartbroken  
 19 once again and never got to hear my dad  
 20 say those words. When my husband and I  
 21 arrived at the Sago Baptist Church that  
 22 morning of the accident, I was going  
 23 there to face my fears, but instead got  
 24 nothing but one big nightmare. You  
 25 don't realize just how hard it was to

1 have to go back and tell our five  
 2 children that grandpa won't be coming  
 3 home, grandpa is in heaven now.  
 4 And I don't think you all  
 5 has realized just what was harder,  
 6 having our loved ones jerked away from  
 7 us again, after being told they were  
 8 alive and then being told later we had  
 9 a minor miscommunication, or having to  
 10 tell our five children.  
 11 You know, it was actually  
 12 a pretty close race there. I miss my  
 13 dad very much and he will be greatly  
 14 missed by family and friends alike.  
 15 And the reason that I'm here today is  
 16 to get some answers to some of the  
 17 questions that I have. For example,  
 18 what caused --- what really caused the  
 19 explosion, and why did it take so long  
 20 for the rescue crews to be called? And  
 21 where are the notes from the pre-shift  
 22 examination that Fred Jamison said that  
 23 he had done?  
 24 And I also want to make  
 25 sure that this doesn't happen again,

Page 102

1 that no other families have to  
 2 experience the pain and the heartache  
 3 of losing good loved ones to a mining  
 4 accident, like us 12 families have  
 5 endured.  
 6 And at this time, I have  
 7 something I want you guys to hear.  
 8 It's a song. And it means a lot to me  
 9 because it captures some of the  
 10 confusion, the heartache, the anger and  
 11 a tremendous loss that I and these  
 12 other families have had to experience.  
 13 SONG PLAYED  
 14 CHAIR:  
 15 Thank you. We'll take a  
 16 break and set up for the next panel.  
 17 Thank you.  
 18 SHORT BREAK TAKEN  
 19 CHAIR:  
 20 The panel we're going to  
 21 hear from now is the MSHA and the West  
 22 Virginia Miners' Health, Safety &  
 23 Training group, on the activities prior  
 24 to January 2nd. And we're going to try  
 25 to ask you to ask questions of this

Page 103

1 panel on that topic, prior to January  
 2 2nd. But first, let me ask Miranda  
 3 Elkins, the court reporter, to swear  
 4 the panel in, please. If you all would  
 5 stand.  
 6 -----  
 7 WITNESSES SWORN EN MASSE  
 8 -----  
 9 CHAIR:  
 10 The procedure calls for  
 11 Kevin Stricklin, the district manager  
 12 for MSHA, to make a presentation,  
 13 followed by Brian Mills, the inspector  
 14 at large for West Virginia, will make a  
 15 presentation. And they --- we will  
 16 then ask questions. Kevin.  
 17 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 18 Thank you, John. My name  
 19 is Kevin Stricklin. I'm the district  
 20 manager in Morgantown, West Virginia  
 21 for the MSHA District Three office.  
 22 I'm a mining engineer. I've been with  
 23 MSHA 25 years. In my time with MSHA  
 24 I've been involved in a large number of  
 25 mine emergencies, both explosions and

Page 104

1 mine fires. I've done everything from  
 2 monitor the gases at the mine site, to  
 3 be part of the investigation teams, to  
 4 be part of internal reviews, as well as  
 5 being the senior MSHA official on site.  
 6  
 7 I don't want to  
 8 disrespect any family member by saying  
 9 I know the pain you're going through,  
 10 because I don't. I'm still alive here.  
 11 I understand that. But what I can  
 12 tell you is, it's changed my life, and  
 13 it's changed the life of everybody that  
 14 works within MSHA and my district, and  
 15 I think it's changed the mining  
 16 industry.  
 17 I think coal miners are  
 18 bonded, and I want to let you know that  
 19 the date of the accident, when we were  
 20 at the site, there were many good  
 21 things said about your relatives that  
 22 died there. Not only from mine  
 23 management, but from my inspectors who  
 24 worked with your folks, worked with  
 25 your brothers, and who had a lot of

Page 105

1 admiration for what they did. So what  
 2 happened here, I can't say, and I don't  
 3 want to disrespect you by saying I know  
 4 what you're going through, because I  
 5 don't. But I can say that there's very  
 6 few moments in my life that I don't  
 7 think back in time and think about the  
 8 12 miners that died at Sago.  
 9 What I'd like to do  
 10 during this presentation is just go  
 11 through MSHA's enforcement actions and  
 12 comply to assistant actions at the  
 13 mine.  
 14 A little background on  
 15 Sago. Sago began operation in 1999,  
 16 and the mine changed ownerships from  
 17 BJM Coal Company to Anker and was  
 18 recently acquired by ICG in 2005. The  
 19 mine was idle for an extended period of  
 20 time between September 2003 and  
 21 December 2004. Our first initial  
 22 meeting with ICG was in May of 2005,  
 23 and it was a meeting that ICG requested  
 24 of MSHA. ICG was taking over Anker  
 25 properties, and they asked for a

Page 106

1 meeting with not only me, but the  
2 supervisors within the district to  
3 discuss all of ICG properties, wanting  
4 to know our honest opinion of each of  
5 the mines, what the conditions were at  
6 the mine and some of the things that  
7 they felt they wanted to address in the  
8 future.  
9 Our major concerns at  
10 that time was the accumulation of  
11 water, and the roof conditions in the  
12 mine. And we expressed that pretty  
13 openly with the mine, the mine folks  
14 that came in to meet with us on that  
15 day. I believe that first meeting was  
16 May the 2nd of 2005.  
17 Some of the information  
18 that we're going to talk about today  
19 deals with this mine map, and I know  
20 some of you are very intimate with the  
21 mine map, but I just want to show a  
22 picture of it and show you some of the  
23 areas that we're going to talk about.  
24 The mine portal or where the men would  
25 enter the mine. The One North sealed

Page 107

1 area, which is a larger sealed area  
2 than what we have in the Two North main  
3 sealed area. The One Left section, the  
4 Two Left section, and again the Two  
5 North main seals. You may hear some of  
6 the people talking today about the old  
7 Two Left seals. That's synonymous with  
8 the Two North main seals.  
9 And in yellow, it shows  
10 the highlighted area where the mine had  
11 been developed to when ICG took over  
12 operation of the mine. This is a  
13 pretty busy chart here, but basically  
14 it kind of tells a little bit of a  
15 story of our enforcement activities at  
16 the mine. There's three different  
17 colors that's shown. The bottom one  
18 that you may see in green is the  
19 national total incident rate. And what  
20 that is, it's an average of all the  
21 different mines in the United States  
22 and what the incident --- or injury  
23 rate is for the national average.  
24 In pink above that is the  
25 Sago Mine total incident rate. Above

Page 108

1 that in blue is the enforcement action  
2 that MSHA, District Three took into  
3 effect or used at the Sago Mine. As you  
4 can see, our numbers --- and it  
5 typically is the way we do our business  
6 here in District Three, we monitor  
7 trends, we look to see if accidents and  
8 injuries are occurring, and we  
9 basically use our enforcement as a tool  
10 to try to decrease the number of  
11 accidents and injuries as well as  
12 decrease the hazards that we see  
13 associated with the mines.  
14 You can see in the second  
15 quarter of 2005, the accident  
16 --- or the injury rate rose, as did the  
17 number of violations that we issued.  
18 And our violation total increased. And  
19 as you can see in the last quarter of  
20 2005, our numbers began to decrease.  
21 And it also falls in line with the  
22 incident rate that also began to  
23 increase.  
24 This shows the primary  
25 enforcement action that we took as an

Page 109

1 agency at the Sago Mine. You can see  
2 the second quarter of 2005 our  
3 violation totals increased, and it  
4 increased a little bit higher, about 25  
5 more violations were issued in the  
6 third quarter of 2005, and then it  
7 decreased. There's three different  
8 types of violations shown on this  
9 chart. One --- and the majority of  
10 them are in blue. It's 104(a)  
11 citation. The second one is a 104(d)  
12 order, in which it's a stronger  
13 enforcement action, and it basically  
14 would shut down an affected area of the  
15 mine until the miner operator corrected  
16 the conditions, and then the violation  
17 would be terminated. And the third is  
18 a 104(b) order, and there was only one  
19 of those issued where a mine operator  
20 did not take corrective action in the  
21 required amount of time, and a (b)  
22 order was issued, shutting down that  
23 area.  
24 One of the questions that  
25 we've been asked in the past, and I

Page 110

1 think this might be a good time to  
2 address it, is why didn't you shut down  
3 the mine for good? Well, we don't have  
4 the authority to totally shut a mine  
5 down. What we have the authority to do  
6 is shut down the affected area of a  
7 violation that existed until the mine  
8 operator would correct that condition.  
9 And we issued 18 orders, and that's a  
10 pretty good, strong enforcement. And  
11 each time the mine operator did correct  
12 that condition, and we terminated that  
13 order, allowing them to go back to  
14 mining coal.  
15 Besides our enforcement  
16 activities at the mine, we also tried  
17 to meet and use different areas of MSHA  
18 to assist the mine operator in making  
19 the mine a safer place. We had five  
20 top level meetings. And by top level  
21 meetings, I mean myself and the vice  
22 president of operation of ICG attending  
23 together. So while we were enforcing  
24 the law and will continue to enforce  
25 the law, we also wanted to have

Page 111

1 meetings --- have an open dialogue. I  
2 think we gave the mine operator an  
3 opportunity to tell us some of his  
4 concerns and vice versa. We talked to  
5 them some of our concerns.  
6 We made 18 supervisory  
7 visits to the mine. Two people down  
8 from me is Ken Tenney. Ken is the  
9 field office supervisor in the  
10 Bridgeport field office. We made a  
11 number of mine visits here with  
12 supervisory people, we just didn't send  
13 enforcement inspectors to the mine. I,  
14 myself, visited the mine, as did both  
15 my assisting district managers during  
16 the timeframe that ICG took over.  
17 So the point I want to  
18 make is, we were engaged at the mine.  
19 We were looking at numbers, we were  
20 talking with mine management, and we  
21 were working to try to come up with  
22 solutions to make this a safer mine.  
23 In addition, technical  
24 support had been working at the ICG  
25 properties to reduce injuries and

Page 112

1 illnesses. That was something that was  
2 requested at our first meeting in May.  
3 To utilize tech support to come in and  
4 look at the injuries and accidents that  
5 were occurring there, and how they  
6 could be better reduced. The technical  
7 support people talked not only to mine  
8 management, but they made a point of  
9 talking to all the miners that worked  
10 at the mine.  
11 In addition, toward the  
12 middle of December we had a meeting  
13 with ICG, and one of our concerns was  
14 the examination process that was taking  
15 place at the mine. And we had issued a  
16 number of violations and orders on the  
17 examination. And we offered a class on  
18 examinations so hazardous conditions  
19 could be observed and recorded in a  
20 book. And ICG was receptive to that  
21 idea, and unfortunately we didn't get  
22 to actually put that in place before  
23 the explosion occurred. But it was  
24 another tool that we were using besides  
25 enforcement to try to increase the

Page 113

1 safety at the Sago Mine.  
2 What do we think that we  
3 got out of working with ICG? Well, I  
4 do think the mine, as you can see by  
5 our number trends did seem to be  
6 improving in the fourth quarter of  
7 2005. There were less violations that  
8 were issued. It wasn't a perfect mine,  
9 but we were working to try to make it a  
10 better mine than what it was. We saw a  
11 better system in place to remove water,  
12 which was one of our big concerns. And  
13 we had a screened route of the primary  
14 escapeway, the track and the belt. And  
15 what that did was help hold up the roof  
16 better, help kept it from sloping off  
17 into the walkways, allowing people to  
18 have a better chance of getting out of  
19 the mine if that primary escapeway was  
20 needed.  
21 In addition, we saw  
22 better rock dusting applications. One  
23 of the things I want to mention, and it  
24 doesn't bring back the 12 miners that  
25 died. But one of the things that was

Page 114

1 done here was, 1,000 pounds of rock  
2 dust being put in front of each of the  
3 seals at the Two North main seals. We  
4 think that had a large effect on  
5 allowing the people that was at the One  
6 Left switch to be able to evacuate from  
7 the mine.  
8 I mentioned earlier, I've  
9 been associated with a number of  
10 explosions in the past. Some of them  
11 traveled the whole way out of the mine,  
12 the whole way out of the portals and  
13 blow buildings off the sides of a  
14 hillside. We didn't have that here.  
15 We had the ability for 12 miners who  
16 were at the One Left switch to come out  
17 of the mine. That doesn't bring back  
18 the 12 that died, but that did allow  
19 the 12 miners that were there to come  
20 out of the mine.  
21 And the other thing we  
22 were working on were better mine  
23 examinations. We really ---  
24 examinations are your first tool that  
25 you should use to make for a safe

Page 115

1 working environment. A good  
2 examination and a good recording of  
3 those examinations allows a lot of  
4 mistakes to be corrected before miners  
5 would get into the area.  
6 And ICG was willing to  
7 work toward better examinations. I  
8 think this is an appropriate time to  
9 mention our relationship with the State  
10 of West Virginia. We have a really  
11 good working relationship with the  
12 state inspectors, and that's ---  
13 because I think their heart and our  
14 heart is both in the same place, and  
15 that's to try to protect the miners.  
16 There were times when our inspectors  
17 would not be at the mine. We had other  
18 things going on, that we would make a  
19 phone call to the State of West  
20 Virginia, and they did the same thing  
21 with us, just say, hey, we're not going  
22 to be at the mines for a few days,  
23 could you have one of your state  
24 inspectors go over to the mine, just so  
25 we have some coverage of the mine.

Page 116

1 And I want to compliment  
2 the State of West Virginia on the way  
3 that we work together. With that,  
4 Davitt, I'll turn it back to you.  
5 CHAIR:  
6 All right. Thank you,  
7 Kevin. Next we'll hear from Brian  
8 Mills, who's the inspector at large for  
9 the West Virginia Miners' Health,  
10 Safety & Training. Brian.  
11 MR. MILLS:  
12 Mr. Chairman, panel  
13 members, Sago Mine families and other  
14 guests. I'm Brian Mills, inspector at  
15 large, Region I of the West Virginia  
16 Office of Miners' Health, Safety &  
17 Training. With me are John Collins,  
18 district inspector, John Scott,  
19 electrical inspector, and Doug Conaway,  
20 former director.  
21 CHAIR:  
22 Brian, can you speak  
23 closer into the mic, please?  
24 MR. MILLS:  
25 Better? The Region I

Page 117

1 offices, which is located in Fairmont  
2 is responsible for mining activity and  
3 are assigned 32 counties, this includes  
4 Upshur County, which Sago Mine is  
5 located.  
6 Mining in our region  
7 alone consists of 45 underground mines,  
8 56 surface mines, 19 low NOx  
9 preparation plants and 41 underground  
10 and surface boards. Our office staff  
11 consists of nine underground  
12 inspectors, three surface inspectors,  
13 three electrical inspectors, three  
14 safety instructors, one roof control  
15 inspector, two office assistants, one  
16 assistant inspector at large and  
17 myself.  
18 The West Virginia Office  
19 of Miners' Health, Safety & Training's  
20 purpose is supervisor of the execution  
21 and enforcement of the provisions of  
22 West Virginia code, Chapter 22(a),  
23 which deals with mining to see that the  
24 provisions are carried out.  
25 Our office is to give

Page 118

1 prime consideration to protection of  
2 the safety and health of the persons  
3 employed within or at the mines of this  
4 state and to protect and preserve  
5 property and connecting properties.  
6 Chapter 22(a) of the West  
7 Virginia code requires that each  
8 underground mine be inspected four  
9 times annually. Surface mines,  
10 preparation, plants and quarries are to  
11 be inspected twice annually. Once a  
12 year an electrical inspection is to be  
13 made of each mine. Other inspections  
14 that we conduct are those dealing with  
15 independent contractors, shackle/slope  
16 operations, roof control and accident  
17 investigations. We also devote time to  
18 safety training, testing and  
19 certification.  
20 I'll now focus my  
21 comments on our activities at the Anker  
22 West Virginia Mining Company, Sago  
23 Mine, during 2005. Four regular  
24 inspections were conducted in 2005.  
25 The first regular inspection concluded

Page 119

1 on March the 2nd, 21 notices of  
2 violations were issued during 11  
3 inspection shifts. The second regular  
4 inspection was concluded on April 22nd,  
5 36 violations were issued during ten  
6 inspection shifts. The third regular  
7 inspection was concluded on August 26th  
8 with 50 violations issued during 16  
9 inspection shifts. The fourth regular  
10 inspection was conducted on November  
11 the 2nd with 23 notices and violations  
12 issued during ten inspection shifts.  
13 A total of four  
14 inspections --- for the total of these  
15 four inspections, 130 violations were  
16 issued during 47 inspector shifts. The  
17 annual electrical inspection was  
18 concluded on March the 17th of 2005  
19 with three violations being issued  
20 during five inspection shifts.  
21 Also, during 2005, 19  
22 inspection reports were completed for  
23 accident investigations at the Sago  
24 Mine. These investigations were roof  
25 falls and injury-type accidents. Our

Page 120

1 records show that of the 41 accident  
2 injury reports submitted by Anker West  
3 Virginia for the Sago Mine, 21 were  
4 roof falls and 20 were  
5 injury-type accidents.  
6 Our roof control  
7 inspector submitted six inspection  
8 reports. Three were roof  
9 control-type inspections and three were  
10 roof fall inspections. One inspection  
11 report is also completed as part of an  
12 investigation into a complaint. Four  
13 inspection reports were also completed  
14 by safety instructors of such  
15 activities at the Sago Mine. Our  
16 records show that from 2005, a total of  
17 95 inspection shifts were dedicated to  
18 the mine.  
19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
20 Davitt, I can't  
21 understand him. I can't hear him.  
22 MR. MILLS:  
23 Also, during 2005 ---.  
24 CHAIR:  
25 I'm sorry, if you could

Page 121

1 try to --- we're having trouble on this  
2 side hearing you. So stay right on  
3 that mic.  
4 MR. MILLS:  
5 Also during 2005 five  
6 inspection reports were completed  
7 showing inspection of GMS mine repair  
8 and maintenance and independent  
9 contractor performing work at the Sago  
10 Mine. And I would like to discuss the  
11 roof control plan for the Sago Mine,  
12 submitted revisions and established  
13 testing areas.  
14 A review of the roof  
15 control plan for each mine is to be  
16 made at least every six months by an  
17 authorized representative. This review  
18 takes into consideration any falls of  
19 roof, face and ribs and the adequacy of  
20 support systems used at the mine.  
21 Our records also show  
22 that this type of roof review was  
23 conducted four times in 2005.  
24 Submittals for a revision  
25 to the roof control plan are forwarded

Page 122

1 to our office in a variety of ways.  
 2 Either by e-mail, mail hard copies and  
 3 delivered copies or by telefax. The  
 4 conversation or discussion with the  
 5 representatives of the operator usually  
 6 occurs if there are questions or  
 7 clarifications needed of the  
 8 submittals. Usually a review of the  
 9 request for revision is made with the  
 10 roof control inspector, the district  
 11 inspector and MSHA roof control  
 12 personnel before such submittals are  
 13 approved.  
 14 During 2005 approval was  
 15 granted for ten such submittals by  
 16 Anker West Virginia for the Sago Mine.  
 17 These ten approvals were either for  
 18 revisions to the plan or to establish  
 19 test areas for lower bench mining.  
 20 Submittals for a revision to the mine  
 21 ventilation plan usually followed the  
 22 same procedure as with the roof control  
 23 plan, as far as submittal, review and  
 24 approval. However, with the  
 25 ventilation plan revisions, the

Page 123

1 district inspector and the MSHA mine  
 2 ventilation personnel are contacted.  
 3 A revised up-to-date  
 4 ventilation for the Sago Mine was  
 5 approved on February 22nd, 2005. After  
 6 this date, seven revisions to the plan  
 7 were approved. One of these revisions,  
 8 on October 14th, 2005, was the approval  
 9 issued to add Omega block type seals to  
 10 their plan. The sealing plan for the  
 11 old Two Left mains was approved on  
 12 October 18th, 2005.  
 13 In the fall of 2003 Anker  
 14 West Virginia Mining Company submitted  
 15 to our office to change the name of the  
 16 mine from Spruce Number Two Mine to the  
 17 Sago Mine. The name change was  
 18 approved and issued on November the  
 19 12th, 2003.  
 20 Included in this  
 21 submittal was one for the name change  
 22 at the mines was a mine emergency  
 23 evacuation of firefighting program of  
 24 instruction and a letter stating that  
 25 mine rescue coverage at the mines would

Page 124

1 be provided by Barbour County Mine  
 2 Rescue Association.  
 3 I would like to introduce  
 4 John Collins, district inspector, and  
 5 John Scott for further comments.  
 6 MR. COLLINS:  
 7 Hello. I'm John Collins.  
 8 I'm a district inspector with the West  
 9 Virginia Office of Miners' Health,  
 10 Safety & Training. I've been employed  
 11 by the state for 24 years. I live in  
 12 Buckhannon. And I was --- I'm the  
 13 inspector that was assigned to inspect  
 14 the Sago Mine.  
 15 I inspected it for nine  
 16 months prior to the explosion, but I  
 17 hadn't inspected the mine prior to  
 18 that, and also Spruce Fork. Of the 12  
 19 miners, 10 of these miners I knew very  
 20 well.  
 21 I was assigned the Sago  
 22 Mine on April the 1st, 2005. Mr. Jeff  
 23 Bennett has conducted the first regular  
 24 inspection for 2005, so my first  
 25 inspection I made there this year would

Page 125

1 have been the second regular.  
 2 As Mr. Mills mentioned, I  
 3 issued 36 violations during 10 days of  
 4 inspection. The mine was basically a  
 5 one section coal mine then with the Two  
 6 Right section just attempting to start.  
 7 And for those of you that know the  
 8 history of the mine, that section  
 9 failed to make it and was stopped.  
 10 I conducted the third  
 11 regular inspection and issued 50  
 12 violations there in 16 days of  
 13 inspection, and in my opinion, this was  
 14 a rough inspection, and the mine was  
 15 not being properly maintained.  
 16 However, halfway through this  
 17 inspection Anker West Virginia changed  
 18 the management of the mine foreman and  
 19 superintendent and hired some new  
 20 safety people, and in my opinion, the  
 21 mine started turning around.  
 22 My fourth regular  
 23 inspection, I issued 23 violations  
 24 during 10 days, which definitely shows  
 25 a decline. I also investigated three



Page 126

1 serious accidents during 2005 at the  
2 Sago Mine. Daniel Westfall (phonetic)  
3 on January the 18th, 2005 was struck by  
4 a piece of falling roof. I  
5 investigated a serious accident of a  
6 Mr. Ralph Mitchell on August the 10th,  
7 2005. He was struck with a piece of  
8 falling roof. And I investigated an  
9 accident of Charles Bunigi (phonetic)  
10 on November the 7th, 2005, who was  
11 struck with a rib roll.  
12 All three of these  
13 accidents were very serious, and only  
14 Daniel Westfall returned back to work.  
15 I also conducted inspections of other  
16 --- two less reported accidents, roof  
17 falls reported and check inspections.  
18 A total of 144 violations was issued at  
19 the mine during the year 2005, 116 of  
20 those was issued by me.  
21 I worked a total of 52  
22 inspection days during 2005 at the Sago  
23 Mine. The violation rate --- our  
24 inspection day of 2.12 for me. The  
25 dates of the inspections, the type of

Page 127

1 inspections conducted and the area  
2 traveled are listed on an attachment  
3 that I'll submit to the committee.  
4 Four violations had not yet been abated  
5 on January the 2nd, 2006.  
6 Three were located in the  
7 intake escapeway, which had been  
8 corrected, but I had not abated,  
9 because I had not been back to the area  
10 to examine them. In the meantime, MSHA  
11 had issued a control order, an order on  
12 the intake escapeway, and Anker had  
13 changed it to a different entry and  
14 screened it. So I knew it had been  
15 abated, but I had not been back to the  
16 mine to abate those.  
17 The other non-abated  
18 violation was on the First Left section  
19 for the track not being maintained  
20 close enough to the face. The last day  
21 that I was in the mine, which was  
22 December the 9th when I checked the  
23 seals, I also went to the First Left to  
24 abate the violation on the track, and  
25 it wasn't installed close enough. They

Page 128

1 had provided a battery paragraph, but I  
2 did not abate the violation.  
3 The mine finished the  
4 year with a state frequency rate of  
5 9.75, based on 200,000 man hours  
6 worked, which is higher than the state  
7 average for 2005 of 4.21 for 2005, that  
8 had reduced from 17.28 in the year  
9 2004. So even though we were still  
10 high, the company was high, they had  
11 cut that in half over the last year.  
12 Again, I've been the  
13 inspector there for the last three  
14 quarters, and --- thank you very much.  
15 CHAIR:  
16 Thank you, John. Are  
17 there any other statements? If not, we  
18 have an opportunity now to ask  
19 questions. Let me start with Ray  
20 McKinney from MSHA.  
21 QUESTIONS OF PANEL  
22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
23 Thank you, Davitt. Mr.  
24 Tenney, there's been some discussion  
25 about a roof drilled hole that was

Page 129

1 bored into the mine roof and was  
2 liberating methane, some process that  
3 was addressed to take care of that. Is  
4 that something that's addressed in the  
5 roof control plan?  
6 MR. TENNEY:  
7 The drilling of test  
8 holes into the mine roofs are required  
9 by the roof control plan, and this coal  
10 seam is a methane liberating coal seam  
11 in some areas in the coal mines. And  
12 the roof and the floor, both are  
13 occasionally porous, and some of the  
14 methane liberates into the rock strata.  
15 And occasionally when we drill into  
16 it, we do encounter methane. It's  
17 unusual, but not rare. Typically,  
18 we encourage the roof bolter operator  
19 to just put an extra stick of glue in  
20 the hole as they install the roof bolt.  
21 This forces the glue out into the  
22 porous area and seals the methane from  
23 being liberated in the coal mines.  
24 Typically, it's a pretty high  
25 percentage of methane, but it's a real

Page 130

1 low volume. So the threat's very  
2 small. And it's still better just to  
3 see what back off though.  
4 MR. MCKINNEY:  
5 Thank you.  
6 CHAIR:  
7 Any questions?  
8 MR. CLAIR:  
9 Mr. Tenney, there's been  
10 a lot of discussion about the  
11 construction of the Omega block seals.  
12 Could you tell us about the plan for  
13 the construction and if any of your  
14 inspectors had any opportunity to  
15 either see or inspect the actual  
16 construction of the seals?  
17 MR. TENNEY:  
18 Yes. The Omega block  
19 seals are an alternate type of seals  
20 that's approved by the district  
21 manager. The company put a plan  
22 together and gave it to the district  
23 manager for approval, and it was  
24 approved. As far as the inspection of  
25 the seals go, I had an inspector, who

Page 131

1 had a trainee with him, that was at the  
2 seal construction area. And they had  
3 four seals completed and was building  
4 the fifth seal.  
5 He used the opportunity  
6 to do two things. Number one, to train  
7 the trainee that was with him as to the  
8 seal construction requirements and to  
9 review the process. The seal plan is  
10 incorporated in the ventilation plan,  
11 which he had with him. He took that  
12 ventilation plan, the seal part of it,  
13 and discussed with the crew that was  
14 building the seals, he opened the  
15 ventilation plan up and reviewed it  
16 both with the crew that was building  
17 the seals and with the trainee  
18 inspector as a training aid.  
19 At that time, he's  
20 testified that they were following the  
21 plan at a snapshot a time, what he  
22 could see. What he could see when he  
23 was there was a seal that was half  
24 constructed. They had one layer  
25 exposed. He reviewed the plan with the

Page 132

1 workers, then he observed them start to  
2 lay another block, and the joints  
3 didn't offset far enough to suit him,  
4 so he pointed it out to the workers,  
5 and they actually cut a block with the  
6 saw, moved it over, offset the joints  
7 like they were supposed to, and  
8 everything seemed to be kosher.  
9 He looked at the four  
10 completed seals, and when you look at a  
11 completed seal, the only thing you can  
12 --- the only thing you can see is a  
13 wall. It's plastered, it's covered.  
14 Those seals appeared to be effectively  
15 sealed.  
16 And after that period of  
17 time, after the seals were complete, I  
18 had another journeyman/inspector, the  
19 inspector's been inspecting coal mines  
20 for  
21 20-plus years. He looked at the  
22 finished product, but there, again,  
23 you're looking at just --- it's just a  
24 wall. And he did say that those seals  
25 appeared to be properly sealed to

Page 133

1 separate the air currents from the two  
2 sides.  
3 He also commented that  
4 the area around there was rock dusted  
5 better than any set of seals he had  
6 ever seen. The company had put bags of  
7 rock dust in front of them, and you  
8 know, I really believe that's the  
9 reason that the explosion did not  
10 propagate any further than there, was  
11 the efforts that was made there for the  
12 rock dusting after the fact.  
13 MR. MCKINNEY:  
14 Mr. Tenney, what type of  
15 training is required for the miners or  
16 the contractors that build or erect  
17 seals?  
18 MR. TENNEY:  
19 The training of the  
20 construction of the seals, that's the  
21 responsibility of the mine operator. He  
22 has to develop the plan --- there's two  
23 types of training. There's a plan ---  
24 there's a training for the annual  
25 refresher-type training where they

Page 134

1 cover the ventilation plan, roof  
2 control plan and all the numerous other  
3 plans. But in this instance there's  
4 also a task training that the mine  
5 operator's required to give very  
6 specific instructions as to the  
7 construction of the seals. And this  
8 was done by the mine operator totally.  
9 MR. MCKINNEY:  
10 Thank you.  
11 MR. DEAN:  
12 I had a question for  
13 Kevin Stricklin. I know you presented  
14 a total incident rate in the second  
15 quarter of 2005. It was about 55.  
16 What's your explanation for that? And  
17 I guess, did you look at the number of  
18 man hours worked during that quarter?  
19 Was there a low man hours worked, or  
20 was it a regular trend?  
21 MR. STRICKLIN:  
22 Well, in smaller mines,  
23 sometimes one accident will cause your  
24 incident rate to go higher. In this  
25 case, the hours seem to be pretty

Page 135

1 consistent, and there was a couple, as  
2 I heard John Collins mention earlier, a  
3 couple of group accidents, as well as  
4 slips, trips and falls, and that was a  
5 concern of ours with the amount of  
6 water that we saw in the mine. So we  
7 felt that was the reason for the  
8 increase in accidents at the mine.  
9 MR. DEAN:  
10 One other question.  
11 John, I know you've been interviewed,  
12 John Collins, and talked about your  
13 inspection of the seals, but perhaps  
14 you can describe that for us a little  
15 here today?  
16 MR. COLLINS:  
17 Okay. I was notified by  
18 the office to check the seals that had  
19 been installed across the Two Northeast  
20 mains, that the operator had completed  
21 those to a point where we could look at  
22 them, because we have to go behind  
23 them. So on December the 9th, I met  
24 Kenny Tenney, the MSHA supervisor at  
25 the mine, and we talked to another

Page 136

1 individual about an accident that I was  
2 investigating, and Kenny was helping  
3 another federal man investigate. So I  
4 had quite a bit to do that day, so we  
5 got in the mine real early, and I was  
6 accompanied by Marty Conrad, who is an  
7 employee of Anker West Virginia Mining  
8 Company. He was a mine foreman, I  
9 think, at Spruce Fork. And when it  
10 shut down, he came over and was working  
11 at the Sago Mine, and had been working  
12 on the seals.  
13 So we traveled to the end  
14 of Four track, went through a man door  
15 and went over up to the seals and  
16 started checking the front of the  
17 seals, went to the Number Nine entry,  
18 which is the Number Ten seal. The  
19 Number Ten seal was constructed up to  
20 about where the --- chest height or so.  
21 I can remember, because I had to  
22 bounce up on it to roll across. It was  
23 40 inches thick. It was not completed,  
24 because we had to look at the back  
25 side. There was a 20 feet of two-inch

Page 137

1 pipe that had been installed through  
2 the seal, and another 20-foot section  
3 was lying on the ground there to be  
4 connected to that. The first joint was  
5 --- had been supported by cribs. What  
6 this is for is for a gas pipe, which  
7 would be installed later on so that if  
8 you were ever going to breach the  
9 seals, you would check behind that  
10 before you breached the seals.  
11 Our law does not require  
12 that that valve be opened or that you  
13 check or monitor behind those seals.  
14 The two cribs that's required in by the  
15 seals by the requirements of the  
16 director were installed. We crossed  
17 over, turned left through the crosscut  
18 toward the Number Nine seal and the  
19 Number Eight entry. I observed that  
20 the roof screen had been cut away at  
21 all ten seals. I observed that the  
22 seals to have been mortared adequately.  
23 I came down behind the  
24 seals, and there had been Omega block  
25 stoppings built across --- behind each

1 one of those prior, because the mains  
 2 was ventilated by inducting air on the  
 3 left-hand side, crossing the waters  
 4 edge and on Two Left and coming back  
 5 down the right-hand side return. So  
 6 once these seals were completed, these  
 7 stoppings were no longer needed. And  
 8 one of our requirements is that they  
 9 remove the inby line of stoppings so  
 10 that if we ever decide to breach those  
 11 seals, our sample will give us a true  
 12 sample of what's behind those seals.  
 13 Some of those stoppings  
 14 only had a hole in them. And while I  
 15 was checking the seals, I would ask  
 16 Marty to knock a few of those Omega  
 17 blocks, which wasn't a big task, and he  
 18 did that. We traveled all the way  
 19 across. There was one seal, either in  
 20 the Four or Five entry that did not  
 21 have both cribs. One of them was built  
 22 and one of them was partially built. I  
 23 asked Marty --- there was cribs in  
 24 there, and I asked Marty to be sure and  
 25 complete that.

1 We traveled on across to  
 2 where the seals turned inby one break,  
 3 and we had to go up to a man door to go  
 4 through. I told Marty to be sure and  
 5 take that stopping out once the seals  
 6 were completed. We came back down to  
 7 the Number One seal. There was a water  
 8 trap in that seal, and it was also  
 9 approximately not quite chest high. I  
 10 stepped up  
 11 --- I got up on it and sat down, and  
 12 Marty and I sat there and actually ate  
 13 a package of crackers, and we talked  
 14 about the water trap, and to make sure  
 15 that he would put something over the  
 16 inby side so that one of the cribs that  
 17 was laying on the ground would not  
 18 float away.  
 19 I then came back across  
 20 the front of the seals, which some of  
 21 the cribs had not been completed. The  
 22 front of them had been mortared and the  
 23 seals appeared to have been built in  
 24 accordance with the approved plan at  
 25 the approved location.

1 I did ask them to perform  
 2 some housekeeping outby the seals,  
 3 because there was a lot of extra  
 4 blocks, and such. Paper bags. And I  
 5 mentioned to Marty that, you know,  
 6 someone would be coming looking at  
 7 these seals forever. The ventilated  
 8 change had not been completed yet. So  
 9 when I got outside, I issued a check  
 10 inspection cover sheet, giving the  
 11 company permission to close the seals.  
 12 CHAIR:  
 13 Thank you, John. And if  
 14 I might ask a follow-up question on  
 15 that. Would you say that your  
 16 recommendation to them was to --- that  
 17 all of the screening had been pulled  
 18 back and that the piping, the 30-foot  
 19 length pipes had been installed in the  
 20 seals, or did you suggest that?  
 21 MR. COLLINS:  
 22 No, I'm sorry. One of  
 23 our requirements, requirements by the  
 24 director for sealing is that 40 feet of  
 25 pipe be installed in a seal with

1 actually a quarter inch copper pipe put  
 2 on the inside. Anker used a half-inch,  
 3 but I felt that was adequate. There  
 4 was 20 feet of that pipe, which had  
 5 already been installed through the  
 6 seal, and about a foot of it was  
 7 extending out on the outby side.  
 8 That section of pipe was  
 9 also supported by cribs inby the seal.  
 10 The other jointed pipe, which would  
 11 make it 40 feet, was lying on the mine  
 12 floor inby the seals. Before the seals  
 13 would have been closed, this half-inch  
 14 pipe would have been installed inside  
 15 this  
 16 40-inch pipe, then the seal would be  
 17 closed. Forty (40) foot pipe.  
 18 During the investigation  
 19 it was clear that that did occur. Both  
 20 joints of pipe were there and a half-  
 21 inch pipe was inside.  
 22 CHAIR:  
 23 After the explosion and  
 24 during the investigation following the  
 25 explosion, where had those pipes been

Page 142

1 joined, or were they found together or  
2 separated?  
3 MR. COLLINS:  
4 They were found  
5 separated. There was testimony that --  
6 - this is just a protective pipe. The  
7 outer pipe is just a protective pipe.  
8 And there was testimony that as they  
9 attempted to twist those together, they  
10 didn't have a wrench or anything, and  
11 that just a few threads was used. That  
12 was testimony, of course, I was not  
13 there, but it appeared they were put  
14 together.  
15 CHAIR:  
16 And John, as to what the  
17 wire mesh for the screen, had you made  
18 a recommendation with regard to  
19 separating that ---?  
20 MR. COLLINS:  
21 No. I made an  
22 observation that they had. There's no  
23 metal, other than our required pipe  
24 passes through a seal. We take the  
25 track out to take the belt out. We

Page 143

1 take the roof screen. And I seen no  
2 roof screen that continued through the  
3 seal. There was two or three of them  
4 that had been cut, and the roof screen  
5 was poured down inby, and as I crawled  
6 between the seal and cribs that were  
7 built, that screen was aggravating.  
8 Of course, you know the  
9 position I know, that the seals were  
10 built from the outby side, so it  
11 probably didn't cause them as much  
12 trouble as it did me. But there was no  
13 screen passing through a set of seals.  
14 CHAIR:  
15 Now, if I can read this  
16 question. How many occasions prior to  
17 the Sago Mine explosion have Omega  
18 blocks been used to seal closed areas  
19 of mines, any mines, not just Sago?  
20 And I direct that to Kevin and to  
21 Brian, please?  
22 MR. STRICKLIN:  
23 Davitt, I can't speak  
24 nationally. I know they're used  
25 throughout the country. In my

Page 144

1 particular district, I think I have  
2 five areas that have been sealed off  
3 with Omega blocks that are in place  
4 today.  
5 CHAIR:  
6 Brian?  
7 MR. MILLS:  
8 Davitt, I recollect three  
9 mines.  
10 CHAIR:  
11 Three mines?  
12 MR. MILLS:  
13 Yes. Maybe more, but  
14 three for sure that I know of.  
15 CHAIR:  
16 And another question,  
17 should mine inspectors be re-assigned  
18 periodically to different mines to  
19 avoid a wetting system developing  
20 between mine inspectors and mine  
21 operators, why or why not? And I  
22 direct that to Mr. Stricklin and to Mr.  
23 Mills again.  
24 MR. STRICKLIN:  
25 We do do that, Davitt. We

Page 145

1 typically rotate inspectors to  
2 different mines. I think the rule of  
3 thumb --- there's regulations that say  
4 how often you can do it, but in the  
5 Bridgeport field office, the rule of  
6 thumb, I believe that Ken uses is two  
7 quarters, then you move to another  
8 mine.  
9 CHAIR:  
10 Mr. Mills, if you can  
11 answer that, please?  
12 MR. MILLS:  
13 Okay. Our situation is  
14 probably a little bit different. Our  
15 inspectors leave their homes and go to  
16 their mines. We've got a region that's  
17 32 counties, so the inspectors that  
18 live in the Wheeling area will  
19 basically inspect the area mines in the  
20 Wheeling area instead of driving two  
21 hours to get to a mine in the Upshur  
22 County. We do, though, try to rotate  
23 the local inspectors from mine to mine  
24 in normally a year max period.  
25 CHAIR:

1 Okay. And a question for  
 2 Mr. Stricklin. What system do you have  
 3 in place to identify mines where  
 4 problems or high numbers of violations  
 5 are occurring?  
 6 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 7 I'm not sure I know what  
 8 you mean by what system. And I know  
 9 someone handed you that question, so  
 10 it's going to be hard for you to answer  
 11 that for me. But we basically monitor  
 12 violations weekly in MSHA. We see how  
 13 many violations we have issued in a  
 14 mine, and we accumulate that total  
 15 through the quarter.  
 16 And at that time, we  
 17 basically decide what type of  
 18 additional manpower or additional  
 19 response we need to put to that place.  
 20 In other words, at Sago I mentioned  
 21 that one of our major concerns was roof  
 22 control. We focused some of our roof  
 23 control specialists to assist in the  
 24 inspection at that mine. In addition,  
 25 when we saw our numbers increasing, or

1 when Ken saw his numbers increasing,  
 2 that was the time that we would sit  
 3 down with the mine operator and tell  
 4 them we're having a problem here, we  
 5 need to try to work through this and  
 6 get these numbers going in the other  
 7 direction.  
 8 CHAIR:  
 9 Again, for Mr. Stricklin.  
 10 That five top level meeting that took  
 11 place with ICG management, could you  
 12 describe who was there, and are there  
 13 notes on the record of those meetings?  
 14 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 15 I'm sure there are notes.  
 16 In fact, I know on the internet there's  
 17 information available about my schedule  
 18 showing what the reason for the  
 19 meetings were. The first meeting was  
 20 held in May of 2005, the second meeting  
 21 was held in August of 2005 at Anker's  
 22 property, the second meeting was. The  
 23 third and fourth meetings in October  
 24 and November were in my office in  
 25 Morgantown. And the last meeting, I

1 believe it was December 15th was at the  
 2 Anker office in Buckhannon.  
 3 And there were --- at  
 4 least two of those meetings Anker had  
 5 each of their superintendents and their  
 6 safety directors at the mines. And at  
 7 each of the meetings that I had, I had  
 8 my assistant district managers as well  
 9 as the field office supervisors out of  
 10 Bridgeport who had authority at the  
 11 mines.  
 12 MR. CLAIR:  
 13 Excuse me, Davitt. I  
 14 have one more question about the Omega  
 15 seals.  
 16 CHAIR:  
 17 We got a question on the  
 18 seals.  
 19 MR. CLAIR:  
 20 This question is for Mr.  
 21 Stricklin and Mr. Mills. Were the ribs  
 22 at the locations for the Omega block  
 23 where the seals were built, were those  
 24 ribs chipped out instead of inside of  
 25 the rib lining?

1 MR. MILLS:  
 2 No. These were non-  
 3 hitched. The approval for non-hitched  
 4 40-inch thick seals.  
 5 MR. CLAIR:  
 6 I'm sorry, could you  
 7 repeat your first answer?  
 8 MR. MILLS:  
 9 I said, the approval for  
 10 this type of seal to be added to the  
 11 plan was for non-hitched Omega block  
 12 seals.  
 13 MR. CLAIR:  
 14 Were the blocks mortared  
 15 between the joints, or were they just  
 16 stacked and plastered?  
 17 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 18 The plan required them to  
 19 be mortared between the joints.  
 20 MR. DEAN:  
 21 I think the question is  
 22 were they?  
 23 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 24 I would have to refer  
 25 that one to the investigation team to

Page 150

1 make --- to give us that information as  
2 far as what they found underground.  
3 MR. MCKINNEY:  
4 The question may go to  
5 Mr. Collins when he observed the seals  
6 being built. Could you tell us if the  
7 blocks were being mortared?  
8 MR. COLLINS:  
9 I'm sorry, you  
10 misunderstood that. But I never  
11 observed them building the seals. Two  
12 through Nine were sealed --- were  
13 completed and plastered the mine inby  
14 roof to bottom. One and Ten were up  
15 about chest high, and they had mortar  
16 across the 40-inch part that you slid  
17 across, it was dry. I noticed, because  
18 I never got it on my clothes.  
19 You couldn't see the  
20 joints a lot, but I have been in on a  
21 lot of testimony, and I think there's a  
22 lot of testimony that a lot of the  
23 joints were mortared, but there's some  
24 testimony that some of those joints may  
25 be questionable. I can't recall who

Page 151

1 did that, but I'm sure that's available  
2 on the internet.  
3 MR. DEAN:  
4 I have one here. Is  
5 there any history of Omega blocks  
6 failing in other parts of the country?  
7 And this particular question comes  
8 from the audience that there was a fire  
9 at Drummond Shoal Creek Mine because of  
10 failure of Omega blocks, and a problem  
11 with their blocks. And the question  
12 goes, there was nothing left of them at  
13 Sago, shouldn't MSHA revisit this  
14 issue? And I don't know who on the  
15 panel to ask that.  
16 MR. STRICKLIN:  
17 I know of an explosion at  
18 the Shoal Creek Mine in Alabama. I do  
19 not know if they were using Omega block  
20 or not, but I think our agency is  
21 looking at the whole testing process to  
22 see how these seals are actually  
23 tested, whether it's Omega or any other  
24 alternate seal.  
25 CHAIR:

Page 152

1 I have one other  
2 question. And what I would propose,  
3 since there seem to be a number of  
4 questions, and in order to accommodate  
5 the cafeteria staff here, that we,  
6 after the next two questions, adjourn  
7 for lunch, but then ask the panel to  
8 come back so that we can complete the  
9 questions after lunch. And if we could  
10 return about --- I'd say --- let's say  
11 1:15 to 1:20, that would give us a  
12 chance to get this panel back.  
13 The question I have,  
14 though, as to the meeting that was  
15 scheduled for 12/15/05 at Sago, with  
16 ICG training supervisors on how to do  
17 examinations weekly and on-shift  
18 examinations. Is this an indication of  
19 problems with supervisors' training or  
20 supervisors' background? Mr.  
21 Stricklin?  
22 MR. STRICKLIN:  
23 Could you repeat just the  
24 last part of that? I missed the last  
25 two words.

Page 153

1 CHAIR:  
2 I'm sorry. Does this  
3 indicate a problem with supervisory  
4 knowledge and/or training related to  
5 examinations?  
6 MR. STRICKLIN:  
7 Well, we had issued a  
8 number of citations and orders on the  
9 examinations at the mine. And we  
10 wanted to make clear what we felt  
11 needed to be addressed when an  
12 examination took place. We discussed  
13 what hazards we expected to be recorded  
14 in the book and corrected. And we felt  
15 that a training of that information, we  
16 offered that training to the company,  
17 and they agreed to do that with their  
18 certified people.  
19 CHAIR:  
20 Any other questions up  
21 here? Debbie, do you want to wait  
22 until after? So why don't we adjourn  
23 now, return at 1:15, please. Thank  
24 you.  
25 LUNCH BREAK TAKEN

1 CHAIR:  
 2 During the lunch break, I  
 3 had some queries from the --- from  
 4 members of the media. We will try to  
 5 make people available to the media  
 6 during the breaks, because the media  
 7 doesn't want to be out of the room when  
 8 questions are being asked and so what  
 9 we'll try to do is to --- for the  
 10 media, during the breaks, we'll have  
 11 persons up in the media room, the  
 12 Governor was there and Cecil Roberts,  
 13 President of the United Mine Workers,  
 14 will be in the media room during the  
 15 next break. And as we go, we'll have  
 16 people made available to the media, so  
 17 we can do that.  
 18 Now, we're finishing the  
 19 questions for the Panel. I have been  
 20 asked to also ask folks to pull that  
 21 mic up because we're having trouble, a  
 22 little bit of trouble, hearing.  
 23 The next question that I  
 24 have is --- now, I'm making too much  
 25 noise. Why did the annual training of

1 miners on escape and evacuation  
 2 emphasize barricading more so than  
 3 other methods of escape. Kevin, if you  
 4 could try to do that?  
 5 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 6 Would it be okay for Mr.  
 7 Tenney to answer that question?  
 8 CHAIR:  
 9 Certainly.  
 10 MR. TENNEY:  
 11 Well, if it emphasized  
 12 barricading more than escaping the coal  
 13 mines, I'd be very disappointed. The  
 14 first action of a coal miner, and all  
 15 coal miners are trained that, is to  
 16 escape. That's a reason we put the  
 17 SCSR units on. It's to don the SCSR  
 18 and exhaust every attempt to exit the  
 19 coal mines. That's our --- that's the  
 20 only time we are safe is when we're on  
 21 the surface. That's the end. The  
 22 other action is --- you know, that's  
 23 kind of a last stand. And it is not to  
 24 be the first or the most predominant  
 25 action taken.

1 MR. DEAN:  
 2 I had a question from a  
 3 member here in the audience, and I  
 4 think the best person to answer that is  
 5 probably either Brian Mills or John  
 6 Collins. It's been stated earlier that  
 7 the violations were cut in half after  
 8 International Coal Group took over the  
 9 mine. Can you elaborate on the pre-ICG  
 10 and post-ICG safety conditions at this  
 11 mine?  
 12 MR. COLLINS:  
 13 Yes, it does appear that  
 14 during the third quarter regular, I  
 15 issued 50 violations and I was there 16  
 16 days. During the fourth quarter  
 17 regular, I issued 23 violations, but I  
 18 was only there 10 days. But the mine,  
 19 in my opinion, had improved during the  
 20 fourth quarter. And they had purchased  
 21 new shuttle cars, new continuous  
 22 miners. The rock dusting had improved.  
 23 The relationship with this mine  
 24 foreman was better as far as rock  
 25 dusting outby, getting things done. We

1 had a new superintendent that was  
 2 cooperative. The maintenance  
 3 department is very cooperative and  
 4 making an excellent attempt to reduce  
 5 violations. So during the fourth  
 6 quarter, my violations were less than  
 7 the third quarter.  
 8 And also a factor that  
 9 comes into that, I was inspecting at  
 10 the same time with a Federal inspector,  
 11 Marty Carver, who is a very good  
 12 inspector. And of course when you  
 13 follow him, then you don't find as many  
 14 violations, particularly I don't think  
 15 I issued a violation on the belt  
 16 conveyors during the fourth quarter.  
 17 But my opinion was that the mine had  
 18 improved during that fourth quarter.  
 19 MR. DEAN:  
 20 Thank you.  
 21 CHAIR:  
 22 Mr. Stricklin, did you  
 23 ever inspect to see if the electrical  
 24 system was properly grounded?  
 25 MR. STRICKLIN:



Page 158

1 That would be something  
2 --- that's something that our regular  
3 inspector would do as part of his  
4 regular inspection at the mine, yes.  
5 CHAIR:  
6 Was it an inspection for  
7 the electrical grounding?  
8 MR. STRICKLIN:  
9 I don't know if his notes  
10 would specifically say anything about  
11 it being grounded, but that's something  
12 that he would typically look at during  
13 his inspection.  
14 CHAIR:  
15 Could we make inquiry of  
16 that inspector to find out if he does  
17 have notes to that effect?  
18 MR. STRICKLIN:  
19 Yes. That's something  
20 that I'll forward to you when we get  
21 that information.  
22 CHAIR:  
23 That's fine. Thank you.  
24 In the area where the explosions  
25 occurred --- the explosion occurred

Page 159

1 when active mining was done ---?  
2 During the time active mining was done,  
3 what was the quality and the quantity  
4 of the methane, CH<sub>4</sub>, of the air in the  
5 last open break-through? And the same  
6 question as to the other active  
7 sessions during the past year? Mr.  
8 Stricklin first and then Mr. Mills.  
9 MR. STRICKLIN:  
10 Typically, the  
11 concentration that in a review of the  
12 notes and in discussion with the MSHA  
13 inspectors was about one-tenth in the  
14 last open crosscut. There was one time  
15 in this last quarter that we found .5  
16 percent methane in the area, but that  
17 was because curtains weren't in place  
18 to ventilate the face from methane.  
19 Even though .5 isn't a concern as far  
20 as an explosive limit of gas, it was a  
21 concern for us at this mine, because we  
22 typically have only one-tenth with our  
23 readings.  
24 CHAIR:  
25 Mr. Mills?

Page 160

1 MR. MILLS:  
2 I'm going to refer that  
3 to John Collins ---  
4 CHAIR:  
5 Okay.  
6 MR. MILLS:  
7 --- a District inspector.  
8 MR. COLLINS:  
9 Well, during the fourth  
10 quarter inspection, the fan was  
11 increased. And those amounts are  
12 available. I don't have them with me,  
13 but the fan was increased substantially  
14 to increase the air on the section.  
15 Normally at this mine, you did not have  
16 a problem providing air to the working  
17 face or the last open break,  
18 maintaining the minimum requirements of  
19 the ventilation plan. Methane  
20 liberation was a minimal amount in the  
21 faces while mining in the upper seam.  
22 However, when mining the bottom seam,  
23 retreating back, I did notice as much  
24 as seven-tenths methane while the  
25 continuous miner was in operation. The

Page 161

1 mine liberated very little methane in a  
2 24-hour period. I believe somewhere  
3 around 100,000 cubic feet of methane in  
4 24 hours.  
5 CHAIR:  
6 Okay. The question is,  
7 why is the Federal agency asking  
8 questions of Federal officials and  
9 visa-versa for the State agency asking  
10 questions to the State --- to State  
11 employees to other State inspectors? I  
12 think it goes to the question of how do  
13 we conduct these Federal investigations  
14 and State investigations. Mr.  
15 Stricklin?  
16 MR. STRICKLIN:  
17 The transcripts I thought  
18 that I reviewed indicated that both the  
19 State and the Federal both asked  
20 questions. And as far as my District  
21 personnel in this interview process, I  
22 think there were only three or four of  
23 our MSHA personnel that were actually  
24 interviewed as part of the  
25 investigation. But from what I recall,

Page 162

1 I believe the State and the MSHA  
2 official both asked the MSHA inspector  
3 questions.  
4 CHAIR:  
5 I think the question goes  
6 to this interview today, to this Panel  
7 today, as well as the questions as to  
8 the other individuals, or the witness,  
9 I'm sorry. The transcripts indicate  
10 the interviews. And the question here,  
11 I think, goes also to the process  
12 today.  
13 MR. STRICKLIN:  
14 I guess I'm unclear on  
15 what you're asking as far as who's ---.  
16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
17 Okay. Mr. Chairman, if I  
18 may? I think that any one of us here,  
19 the people representing the State and  
20 us, Ray and myself representing MSHA,  
21 feel that we can ask State or Federal  
22 employees any question. The overall  
23 format is a format that was agreed to  
24 between the Governor's Office and the  
25 Department of Labor. But certainly, I

Page 163

1 personally and I know Mr. McKinney  
2 feels no constraint about asking a  
3 State employee questions, and I would  
4 hope that you and Mr. Dean have no  
5 restraint at all in asking any Federal  
6 employee a question.  
7 CHAIR:  
8 I think I've actually  
9 already done so. I don't have any  
10 questions.  
11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
12 The next question is, why  
13 did the self-contained self rescuer  
14 devices fail the miners in Two Left and  
15 were the SCSRs for the Two Left miners  
16 tested and weighed every 90 days by  
17 mine management? And lastly, when was  
18 the last inspection of the SCSRs at  
19 Sago prior to January the 2nd? Mr.  
20 Stricklin?  
21 MR. STRICKLIN:  
22 I'm going to defer to Mr.  
23 Tenney for that one?  
24 MR. TENNEY:  
25 The records indicate that

Page 164

1 the SCSRs in question were, in fact,  
2 tested in the 90-day increments that  
3 they were required to. The exact date  
4 I do not know right off the top of my  
5 head what it was. The 90-day  
6 examination is the actual physical test  
7 where you shake --- use an instrument  
8 to shake the unit to see that it is  
9 still according to manufacturer's  
10 recommendation and passes that.  
11 CHAIR:  
12 The next question is what  
13 were the volume of area ventilating the  
14 seals, first at First Left and at  
15 Second Left? Let me repeat that. What  
16 were --- or what are the volume of area  
17 ventilating the seals in the First Left  
18 and Second Left?  
19 MR. STRICKLIN:  
20 I'll try to address it.  
21 There are no seals in the One Left  
22 area.  
23 CHAIR:  
24 Right.  
25 MR. STRICKLIN:

Page 165

1 But in the Two Left area,  
2 I believe the air reading taken after  
3 the air had passed the last seal was  
4 approximately 8 to 9,000 cfm of air.  
5 CHAIR:  
6 And for Mr. Stricklin,  
7 why was the Sago Mine not issued a  
8 104(c) pattern of violations' notice?  
9 MR. STRICKLIN:  
10 Well, we typically look  
11 at more than a couple of quarters when  
12 we look at a POV. We review that  
13 annually. Based on the fact that we  
14 saw a decrease in the number of  
15 violations in the fourth quarter, we  
16 still would have looked at it as one of  
17 our criteria's to look at, are the  
18 violations continuing to increase. I  
19 don't think that Sago at that time  
20 would have been considered for a POV  
21 based on what we have in place now.  
22 CHAIR:  
23 Any other ---? Any  
24 questions?  
25 MS. HAMNER:

Page 166

1 We're having difficulty  
2 hearing down on this end of the table,  
3 so if I ask a question you've already  
4 answered or if you've covered that in  
5 your speech, I do apologize. I did ask  
6 to have a copy of the Brian Mills'  
7 speech because I didn't hear any of it  
8 at all.  
9 This question is for  
10 Kevin Stricklin. When was the last  
11 inspection by MSHA of the Sago Mines?  
12 MR. STRICKLIN:  
13 And I guess I'm having  
14 the same problem you had, I couldn't  
15 pick up your question.  
16 MS. HAMNER:  
17 Thank you. When was the  
18 last inspection by MSHA of the Sago  
19 Mine?  
20 MR. STRICKLIN:  
21 The last inspection prior  
22 to the explosion, I believe was in the  
23 last week of December. We had an  
24 inspector at the mine site as part of  
25 the EO-1 inspection.

Page 167

1 MS. HAMNER:  
2 And this was what you  
3 called a regular inspection where you  
4 did inspect the electrical system?  
5 MR. STRICKLIN:  
6 The electrical inspection  
7 would be part of that regular  
8 inspection, yes.  
9 MS. HAMNER:  
10 Okay. Can you elaborate  
11 on Denver Wilfong's testimony where he  
12 says that the 25-foot separation that's  
13 supposed to be in the electrical system  
14 was not in there?  
15 MR. STRICKLIN:  
16 I did not review Mr.  
17 Wilfong's testimony. That might be a  
18 question that the investigation team  
19 for MSHA may be better suited to  
20 answer.  
21 MS. HAMNER:  
22 You don't know the answer  
23 to that?  
24 MR. STRICKLIN:  
25 No, I don't.

Page 168

1 MS. HAMNER:  
2 Well, can you tell us,  
3 generally speaking, what that would  
4 mean if it's not in there?  
5 MR. STRICKLIN:  
6 I would think that that  
7 --- it would be needed to be included,  
8 and that our inspector would typically  
9 look for that during his inspection.  
10 MS. HAMNER:  
11 You feel that it would  
12 need to be included?  
13 MR. STRICKLIN:  
14 I'm having a very hard  
15 time hearing you.  
16 MS. HAMNER:  
17 I know. I understand  
18 that. But you said that that would  
19 need to be included?  
20 MR. STRICKLIN:  
21 Any electrical  
22 requirements in the log, and I don't  
23 know the exact distance of this  
24 separation, but basically whatever's in  
25 the regulation would be inspected by

Page 169

1 our inspector during his regular visit.  
2 And if it wasn't in place, it would be  
3 his responsibility to issue a violation  
4 for that.  
5 MS. HAMNER:  
6 We understand that there  
7 were MSHA inspections in August that  
8 found inadequate ventilation. Five  
9 days later there was another inspection  
10 that found similar lack of fresh air.  
11 Can you tell us your major concerns  
12 about the ventilation system there at  
13 Sago? We know you had had prior  
14 meetings with ICG.  
15 MR. STRICKLIN:  
16 Well, our concerns over  
17 ventilation basically did with --- I  
18 think the violations were issued for  
19 how a stopping was built, the quantity  
20 of air that was delivered to the face,  
21 the locations of the curtains in the  
22 face area, as well as any examination  
23 in violation would be included under  
24 the quote, ventilation part of the  
25 regulations or the 300 series. So that

Page 170

1 was some of our major concerns,  
2 especially the examination part of it.  
3  
4 MS. HAMNER:  
5 Have they corrected  
6 everything that you had asked to be  
7 corrected? I mean, we understand that  
8 on December 20th, MSHA rejected the  
9 ventilation plan submitted by ICG.  
10 MR. STRICKLIN:  
11 I never rejected the  
12 entire plan. What I rejected was two  
13 submittals or addendums to the plan  
14 from the mine operator. They had  
15 requested to have three open crosscuts  
16 on the return side. And we denied both  
17 of those requests they submitted to us,  
18 because we didn't think that their  
19 request dealt with anything to do with  
20 safety for the miners at that time.  
21 MS. HAMNER:  
22 You thought ventilation  
23 was adequate?  
24 MR. STRICKLIN:  
25 The plan was adequate if

Page 171

1 they followed it, yes. What wasn't ---  
2 what I didn't think was adequate was  
3 approving three open crosscuts instead  
4 of the two that they were --- they had  
5 in place.  
6 MR. BENNETT:  
7 My question is, why do  
8 you only require 20 psi rating on your  
9 seals when there's been explosions over  
10 20 psis?  
11 MR. STRICKLIN:  
12 That's something that I  
13 think our agency is looking at right  
14 now to see if 20 psi is sufficient or  
15 not.  
16 MR. BENNETT:  
17 And when they blew the  
18 seals, they didn't hit it with direct  
19 force. I mean, why wouldn't you do  
20 that?  
21 MR. STRICKLIN:  
22 I'm not sure --- I'm not  
23 sure how the testing criteria was set  
24 up. That's something that NIOSH or  
25 another arm of the agency is involved

Page 172

1 in. And apparently their discussion is  
2 that a static pressure would be the  
3 same whether it's hit head-on or in a  
4 crosscut. But I think that is also  
5 something that is being re-evaluated  
6 now.  
7 MR. BENNETT:  
8 Where did the 20 psis  
9 evolve from?  
10 MR. STRICKLIN:  
11 I think that question  
12 might be better suited for --- there's  
13 another Panel where an individual that  
14 was involved in that will be able to  
15 discuss that with you.  
16 MR. BENNETT:  
17 And in the plan it stated  
18 put the seals ten feet inby the  
19 crosscut, or inby, so you can build a  
20 permanent seal outby. Why would you  
21 put that in there if you know --- I  
22 mean, you're building a permanent seal  
23 anyway, why put that in there?  
24 MR. STRICKLIN:  
25 I'm sorry. I didn't hear

Page 173

1 the total question there.  
2 MR. BENNETT:  
3 In the plan it states put  
4 the seal 20 feet inby a crosscut. Why  
5 would you build a permanent seal which  
6 you wouldn't have to build one outby?  
7 I mean, why have that in the plan?  
8 Unless you think the seal is going to  
9 fail one time or another.  
10 MR. TENNEY:  
11 Well, that's not  
12 necessarily expecting the seal to fail.  
13 You know, there's roof stresses in the  
14 coal mines and it's more apt that the  
15 roof, itself, would deteriorate to the  
16 point that we would have to go in and  
17 support and control. If we build it out  
18 to the very edge of the intersection  
19 and we had any type of roof control, we  
20 wouldn't have the opportunity to catch  
21 it. And the intersection is a weaker  
22 part of all roofs anyhow. So the  
23 further away from the intersection we  
24 require to be built the better --- the  
25 safer the seal would be. It's not to

Page 174

1 prevent seal failure, it's to protect  
2 that particular seal.  
3 MR. STRICKLIN:  
4 If you're referring to  
5 the stoppings that are outby the seals,  
6 that's basically something that the  
7 company did to allow a separate split  
8 of air to ventilate those to direct the  
9 air into the return. That would not  
10 --- the outby set is not considered the  
11 seals, it would just be permanent  
12 stoppings.  
13 MR. BENNETT:  
14 That is not what I'm  
15 referring to. In the plans it says to  
16 build them so you can build a permanent  
17 seal outby the Omega seals.  
18 MR. STRICKLIN:  
19 I don't recall seeing  
20 that in the plan, but we'll get that  
21 information after we review it. But  
22 our understanding is there would just  
23 be one set of seals. There would not  
24 be two sets.  
25 MR. BENNETT:

Page 175

1 Well, you signed them. I  
2 mean, you should know.  
3 MR. STRICKLIN:  
4 I'll review that again.  
5 MR. BENNETT:  
6 Okay. And the rescue  
7 teams, when they went in, they traveled  
8 the track entry; is that correct? They  
9 didn't go down the intake in other  
10 words?  
11 MR. STRICKLIN:  
12 They went down the intake  
13 originally and then they started  
14 traveling into the track entry.  
15 MR. BENNETT:  
16 And you elaborated on ---  
17 a little bit on the rescuers not  
18 working. Who tested the rescuers?  
19 MR. STRICKLIN:  
20 The rescuers are tested  
21 with NIOSH and MSHA involvement in  
22 those tests.  
23 MR. BENNETT:  
24 And they all were  
25 activated?

Page 176

1 MR. STRICKLIN:  
2 Are you talking about the  
3 SCSRs after the explosion?  
4 MR. BENNETT:  
5 Right.  
6 MR. STRICKLIN:  
7 I think that might be a  
8 better question for tomorrow, because  
9 we have a presentation on that for the  
10 investigation.  
11 MR. BENNETT:  
12 Okay. And as far as  
13 response time and all that, would there  
14 be a better time to go over that ---  
15 MS. HAMNER:  
16 Yeah.  
17 MR. BENNETT:  
18 --- as far as the rescuer  
19 efforts?  
20 MR. STRICKLIN:  
21 I believe tomorrow when  
22 we talk about the investigation or the  
23 recovery, it would be more appropriate  
24 if --- CHAIR, is that something  
25 that ---?

Page 177

1 CHAIR:  
2 I think that's what we're  
3 trying to do.  
4 MS. HAMNER:  
5 The self-rescuers that  
6 Russell was speaking about, they are in  
7 your possession, the ones that you  
8 found in the mines?  
9 MR. STRICKLIN:  
10 They're in the possession  
11 of the investigation team.  
12 MS. HAMNER:  
13 And can we have the model  
14 numbers, the serial numbers and the  
15 date of manufacture off of that?  
16 MR. STRICKLIN:  
17 I guess that's something  
18 that someone will have to make a  
19 decision on, but I don't see any reason  
20 why not.  
21 MS. HAMNER:  
22 Okay. We would like to  
23 have that information. Mr. Stricklin,  
24 can you tell us who Mr. McKinney is?  
25 MR. STRICKLIN:

Page 178

1 Mr. McKinney is the  
2 administrator for Coal Mine Safety &  
3 Health in our headquarters' office in  
4 Arlington, Virginia.  
5 MS. HAMNER:  
6 Why was a meeting  
7 scheduled with Mr. McKinney and ICG  
8 that first week in January?  
9 MR. STRICKLIN:  
10 I wasn't involved in  
11 setting up the meeting or I wasn't to  
12 attend the meeting, but my  
13 understanding is Mr. McKinney does the  
14 same thing on a national basis that I  
15 do on a district basis. And he looked  
16 over the numbers and he decided to have  
17 a meeting with ICG to discuss their  
18 numbers. Not Sago in particular, but  
19 all of ICG mines as a whole.  
20 MS. HAMNER:  
21 So he was seeing  
22 inadequacies there with ICG, the same  
23 as you'd seen them on the district  
24 level?  
25 MR. STRICKLIN:

Page 179

1 I can't speak of  
2 inadequacies, but I would think that he  
3 saw some trends that concerned him and  
4 he wanted to sit down with company  
5 officials at their level and talk about  
6 it.  
7 CHAIR:  
8 Since we have Mr.  
9 McKinney here, maybe he could answer  
10 the rest of that question.  
11 MR. MCKINNEY:  
12 Yes, it may be more  
13 appropriate for me to answer that  
14 question. Just as Kevin said, we're  
15 constantly looking at coal companies  
16 across the United States and in  
17 multiple, we're looking at safety,  
18 health, performance. And we're trying  
19 to draw profiles and see if we see a  
20 decline in safety and health in any  
21 area. As we profiled ICG mines, we saw  
22 some near misses; we saw some other  
23 things that had caused some concerns.  
24 I had contacted the company, spoke with  
25 their corporate safety director and

Page 180

1 asked if he could broker a meeting  
2 between their top officials and myself  
3 and my staff to look nationwide at  
4 their mines to talk about their safety  
5 and health performance and what  
6 mechanisms they had in place to address  
7 some of the perception --- or the  
8 perceived concerns that I had. And  
9 that was the purpose of the meeting.  
10 I spoke with Kevin along  
11 with the other district managers that  
12 had ICG operations in their district to  
13 get feedback from them about any  
14 particular concerns they may have also  
15 had.  
16 MS. HAMNER:  
17 I can't understand.  
18 Trouble hearing. Mr. Stricklin, you  
19 said MSHA inspected the mines the last  
20 week of December. And we know you've  
21 had ventilation concerns. Did you do a  
22 monitoring for methane at that time?  
23 MR. STRICKLIN:  
24 Any time our inspector  
25 would go underground, they're expected

Page 181

1 to take methane readings wherever they  
2 go. If they go to a section, we do  
3 what we call an imminent danger run  
4 across all the faces and we check each  
5 of the faces for gas. If we're in an  
6 outby area, such as the belt entry, we  
7 would be expected to use our methane  
8 detector in that area as well to assure  
9 that we don't have a buildup of any  
10 methane in any area of the coal mine.  
11 So, yes, we would have done --- used  
12 our methane monitors to check during  
13 not only the last week of December, but  
14 any day of the week, go into the mine,  
15 we will use that detector.  
16 MS. HAMNER:  
17 Did you detect methane?  
18 MR. STRICKLIN:  
19 I don't recall any exact  
20 numbers, but typically we saw one-tenth  
21 of methane when we visited the mine.  
22 And I told you the one thing that stood  
23 out in my mind, there was one day when  
24 an inspector measured five-tenths of  
25 methane. Typically other than that,

1 all I saw was one-tenth. If you don't  
 2 mind, I would refer the question ---  
 3 I'll let Ken Tenney respond to that as  
 4 well, because he was a lot closer and  
 5 there a lot more than I was.  
 6 MR. TENNEY:  
 7 The Sago Mine is a  
 8 methane-liberating mine, and all of our  
 9 inspectors check for methane  
 10 constantly. As to your ventilation  
 11 question and methane concerns, none of  
 12 my inspectors indicated that it was a  
 13 concern that we had excessive methane  
 14 buildup or inadequate ventilation. The  
 15 citations you're talking about, we do  
 16 cite when the curtain's not close  
 17 enough to the face, when the volume of  
 18 required air is not great enough in a  
 19 place that's being mined, that's a  
 20 citation for ventilation. And like  
 21 Kevin said earlier, some of the --- if  
 22 a stopping has a hole in it, that's a  
 23 ventilation citation, too. But the  
 24 ventilation system was not of great  
 25 concern. It was deemed to be adequate

1 by my guys.  
 2 MS. HAMNER:  
 3 I have trouble  
 4 understanding that, you know. You say  
 5 the ventilation is adequate and yet we  
 6 have this explosion and we have all  
 7 these ventilation concerns, you know,  
 8 clear back to August. When one checks  
 9 for methane, where is the monitor  
 10 placed to check the methane levels?  
 11 MR. TENNEY:  
 12 The regulations require  
 13 us to be at least 12 inches from the  
 14 roof rib or floor when we take a legal  
 15 methane test. Typically our guys will  
 16 check for methane at every face on any  
 17 working section and also in the  
 18 immediate return on a working section.  
 19 Our meters are constant monitor type  
 20 that we don't turn them on and off, so  
 21 in essence, we're checking for methane  
 22 continuously, regardless of where we  
 23 are. At the seals would be another  
 24 place that we would specifically test  
 25 for methane. It's a requirement.

1 MS. HAMNER:  
 2 Do you wear these  
 3 monitors on your body or ---?  
 4 MR. TENNEY:  
 5 Yes, we wear them on our  
 6 belts.  
 7 MS. HAMNER:  
 8 They're on your belts?  
 9 MR. TENNEY:  
 10 And when we test for  
 11 methane, we take them out and hold them  
 12 up 12 inches away from the roof or in  
 13 that area and test there.  
 14 MS. HAMNER:  
 15 Mr. Stricklin, were any  
 16 of your inspectors there watching  
 17 during the construction of the sealed  
 18 area?  
 19 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 20 Yes. I believe we  
 21 discussed that a little earlier. We  
 22 were there during the building of --- I  
 23 believe it was the fifth seal.  
 24 MS. HAMNER:  
 25 What percentage of time

1 do you feel that you had a inspector  
 2 there during the construction of the  
 3 seals?  
 4 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 5 It would have been a  
 6 small percentage.  
 7 MS. HAMNER:  
 8 One percent?  
 9 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 10 If we looked at the  
 11 entire time of his inspection, we'd  
 12 have to account maybe for 30 minutes of  
 13 that, so it may be less than one  
 14 percent even.  
 15 MS. HAMNER:  
 16 Less than one percent?  
 17 So those seals were actually  
 18 constructed with no inspector watching  
 19 99 percent of the time? Ninety-nine  
 20 (99) point plus percent of the time?  
 21 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 22 That is correct.  
 23 MS. HAMNER:  
 24 And same question for Mr.  
 25 Collins. How much time was an

1 inspector there watching the  
 2 construction of the seals?  
 3 MR. COLLINS:  
 4 There is no requirement  
 5 by State law for us to examine or check  
 6 those seals while they are being  
 7 installed. It's the responsibility of  
 8 the operator to install those seals in  
 9 accordance with an approved plan. I  
 10 personally never went by the seals  
 11 while they were being constructed.  
 12 MS. HAMNER:  
 13 Maybe I misunderstood  
 14 you. But you never were there while  
 15 they were being constructed?  
 16 MR. COLLINS:  
 17 That's true, ma'am.  
 18 MS. HAMNER:  
 19 So ---.  
 20 MR. COLLINS:  
 21 I did inspect the seals  
 22 prior to them closing the last two.  
 23 MS. HAMNER:  
 24 So if you were never  
 25 there during the construction, you

1 couldn't really see if the seals were  
 2 mortared correctly?  
 3 MR. COLLINS:  
 4 That's true, ma'am.  
 5 MS. HAMNER:  
 6 Yes, that's true. And we  
 7 understand from reading some of these  
 8 transcripts that mortar was actually a  
 9 soupy mix and that some of the mortar  
 10 had just been thrown in.  
 11 MR. COLLINS:  
 12 Yes, as a matter of fact,  
 13 I've heard that.  
 14 MS. HAMNER:  
 15 But you can't elaborate  
 16 on that, because you didn't inspect  
 17 them while they were being constructed?  
 18 MR. COLLINS:  
 19 No, ma'am. I did not.  
 20 Perhaps we need a law to require that.  
 21 We do not have a law to require that.  
 22 MS. HAMNER:  
 23 And maybe the law needs  
 24 changed. Can you tell me if the seal  
 25 --- well, maybe I'll ask Kevin, because

1 he's had an inspector there less than  
 2 one percent of the time.  
 3 Can you tell me if the  
 4 seals were built into the rib cage and  
 5 what did the plan require?  
 6 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 7 The seals were not  
 8 hitched into the rib, and the plan did  
 9 not require them to be hitched into the  
 10 rib.  
 11 MS. HAMNER:  
 12 So the plan didn't  
 13 require them to be extended into the  
 14 rib and if the mortar wasn't applied  
 15 properly, can I not go up and just push  
 16 that over?  
 17 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 18 No. It would be a lot  
 19 more substantial than you pushing it  
 20 over. If the seals were installed as  
 21 the plan required, they would match the  
 22 test that was done in our Lakeland  
 23 facility that was acted upon by the 20  
 24 psi pressure. It's not something that  
 25 you would just be able to push a seal

1 over with.  
 2 MS. HAMNER:  
 3 Do you know who --- and  
 4 this may be a question for another  
 5 Panel, but do you know who at ICG was  
 6 responsible for inspecting the  
 7 construction of the seals?  
 8 MR. STRICKLIN:  
 9 I do not know that.  
 10 MS. HAMNER:  
 11 Do not know. Mr.  
 12 Collins, you say the law didn't require  
 13 you to check the seals, but did you not  
 14 feel that you should be obligated to  
 15 check those seals?  
 16 MR. COLLINS:  
 17 Ma'am, our law requires  
 18 us to check them prior to close. For  
 19 me to be able to check everything in a  
 20 mine that an operator does --- and I  
 21 had no particular concern about these  
 22 seals, because I knew the men that were  
 23 building them --- and I'm not so sure  
 24 that we have determined that these  
 25 seals weren't proper either. That



Page 190

1 investigation is still being conducted.  
2 MS. HAMNER:  
3 Russell, did you have any  
4 questions? We need just a few minutes  
5 to collect our thoughts. Is that okay?  
6 OFF RECORD DISCUSSION  
7 MS. HAMNER:  
8 We pass. Go ahead.  
9 CHAIR:  
10 Thank you, gentlemen.  
11 That concludes the questions for this  
12 Panel. We appreciate your answers and  
13 if you would give me those bits of  
14 information, that would be nice of you.  
15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
16 Davitt?  
17 CHAIR:  
18 Yes, sir?  
19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
20 Can we have a copy of  
21 their ---?  
22 CHAIR:  
23 Yes. Do we have the  
24 Power Point --- a copy of the fire  
25 plan?

Page 191

1 MR. STRICKLIN:  
2 Yes, sir.  
3 CHAIR:  
4 Yes. Okay.  
5 OFF RECORD DISCUSSION  
6 CHAIR:  
7 Now, we'd like to ask for  
8 the ICG Panel, that is Panel Number  
9 Two, to discuss the explosion and the  
10 mine rescue --- I'm sorry, Panel Number  
11 Three, to discuss the explosion and  
12 mine rescue. If they would come  
13 forward, please.  
14 We'd like to begin now  
15 with Panel Number Three, and that is  
16 the presentation by the International  
17 Coal Group on the explosion of January  
18 the 2nd and the mine rescue efforts.  
19 We thank you gentlemen for coming, for  
20 appearing here today. We appreciate  
21 that. And I'll ask that you make your  
22 presentations and we'll hold questions  
23 until the end of the presentations.  
24 Let me begin by introducing Ben  
25 Hatfield. Ben Hatfield, who is ICG

Page 192

1 President and Chief Executive Officer.  
2 And before we start, I would ask that  
3 the witnesses be sworn by the court  
4 reporter. If you would stand to let  
5 the ---.  
6 -----  
7 WITNESSES SWORN EN MASSE  
8 -----  
9 CHAIR:  
10 Mr. Hatfield?  
11 MR. HATFIELD:  
12 Mr. Chairman, Panel  
13 members, miners and family members, I  
14 am Ben Hatfield, President and CEO of  
15 International Coal Group. I've agreed  
16 to appear today to address issues  
17 surrounding the tragic accident at our  
18 Sago Mine on January 2, 2006. Many of  
19 the people in this room are miners,  
20 their fathers were miners, their  
21 grandfathers were miners. It should be  
22 the goal of this forum, the mining  
23 industry, the State and Federal  
24 governments and International Coal  
25 Group to determine how the Sago

Page 193

1 accident happened, learn valuable  
2 lessons from it and implement the best  
3 available technology capable of  
4 minimizing and, indeed, preventing a  
5 similar recurrence and protecting  
6 future generations of miners.  
7 We are here today to  
8 present what we know about the events  
9 of January 2 through 4 and respond to  
10 questions. Unfortunately, as we all  
11 should know, some questions may never  
12 be fully answered. Other ICG managers  
13 joining me on the Panel today that will  
14 also be making brief statements include  
15 Jeff Toler, Sago Mine superintendent,  
16 Sam Kitts, Senior --- I'm sorry, Sam  
17 Kitts, our Senior Vice-president of  
18 Operations for the West  
19 Virginia/Maryland Region, and Charles  
20 Snaveley, our Vice-president of Planning  
21 and Acquisitions.  
22 Other ICG managers on the  
23 Panel today that are here primarily to  
24 address questions include Chuck Dunbar,  
25 General Manager of our Buckhannon

Page 194

1 Division, Tyrone Coleman, Manager of  
 2 Safety for the West Virginia/Maryland  
 3 Region, John Stemple, Assistant  
 4 Director of Safety and Employee  
 5 Development, Carl Crumrine, mine  
 6 foreman at Sago Mine and Fred Jamison,  
 7 Fire boss at the Sago Mine. We will  
 8 remain mindful of our time constraints  
 9 and will be respectful of the time  
 10 allotted for questions.  
 11 Even before ICG completed  
 12 its merger with Anker Coal Group that  
 13 consummated the acquisition of the Sago  
 14 Mine on November 18, 2005, we assumed  
 15 management oversight through a  
 16 consulting agreement effective June 1,  
 17 2005. Since that time, our company has  
 18 worked closely with Federal and State  
 19 regulators in an effort to make the  
 20 Sago Mine as safe as possible. One  
 21 example of this cooperation was our  
 22 June 2005 decision to invite MSHA's  
 23 Technical Support Group on Incident  
 24 Reduction to help implement a new  
 25 program to improve mine safety. We

Page 195

1 were told that ICG was the first coal  
 2 company to voluntarily work with MSHA  
 3 under the agency's Incident Reduction  
 4 Program. These efforts helped us to  
 5 dramatically reduce the loss-time  
 6 injury rate at the Sago Mine by nearly  
 7 60 percent from the first half of 2005  
 8 to the second half.  
 9 Much has been reported in  
 10 the press about the number of citations  
 11 at the Sago Mine in 2005. Numbers do  
 12 not tell the whole story. ICG did not  
 13 acquire full control of the Anker  
 14 operations until late in the year. In  
 15 the meantime, clear safety initiatives  
 16 were implemented, all citations were  
 17 promptly addressed and, most  
 18 importantly, none of the citations  
 19 played any part whatsoever in the  
 20 accident.  
 21 We believe that Sago's  
 22 miners know that ICG immediately took  
 23 steps to ensure that safety had its  
 24 rightful priority and that significant  
 25 expenditures were made to make their

Page 196

1 mine a better place to work.  
 2 I would like to briefly  
 3 summarize what we know about the events  
 4 of January 2, 3 and 4, 2006. At  
 5 approximately 6:00 a.m. on Monday  
 6 morning, January 2nd, after their  
 7 travel route and worksites had been  
 8 reported safe by the mine's fire  
 9 bosses, including Terry Helms, who  
 10 would later perish, two production  
 11 crews and mine support staff totaling  
 12 27 miners entered the mine.  
 13 Each production crew  
 14 needed to travel about two miles to  
 15 reach the two working sections, First  
 16 Left and Second Left where they were  
 17 scheduled to work. The Second Left  
 18 crew entered the mine on a rail manbus  
 19 that departed roughly ten minutes ahead  
 20 of a similar manbus carrying the First  
 21 Left crew. One of the certified safety  
 22 examiners had remained underground and  
 23 traveled to his normal workstation.  
 24 Therefore, a total of 28 miners were  
 25 underground.

Page 197

1 At 6:26 a.m. during a  
 2 violent storm with unusually strong  
 3 lightning strikes, the audible alarm of  
 4 the mine monitoring system signaled the  
 5 presence of carbon monoxide underground  
 6 and the mine conveyor belts went down.  
 7 As you may recall, we initially  
 8 reported that the mine's alarm sounded  
 9 at 6:31 a.m. based upon the mine's  
 10 computer clock. However, during the  
 11 post-accident investigation, State  
 12 inspectors did a precision time  
 13 correlation with an atomic clock and  
 14 found that the mine's computer was four  
 15 minutes and 56 seconds fast.  
 16 Shortly after the alarm  
 17 sounded, the supervisor of the First  
 18 Left production crew reported, via mine  
 19 phone, that his crew had just  
 20 experienced a very strong rush of air  
 21 with smoke and dust emanating from  
 22 deeper in the mine. Mine management  
 23 directed the First Left supervisor to  
 24 bring his crew out of the mine through  
 25 one of the primary escape ways.

Page 198

1 Repeated efforts by mine management and  
2 the First Left crew to contact the  
3 Second Left Crew via mine phone and  
4 underground walkie-talkie were  
5 unsuccessful.  
6 At this time, Jeff Toler  
7 will describe in more detail his  
8 efforts and the efforts of others to  
9 enter the mine and find the Second Left  
10 crew.  
11 MR. J.TOLER:  
12 My name is Jeff Toler,  
13 and I'm the mine superintendent at the  
14 Sago Mine. I've been a miner all my  
15 life. First at Brooks Run, where I  
16 worked with my uncle Martin Toler, Jr.,  
17 for 18 years. I continued at that mine  
18 after it was purchased by Alpha Natural  
19 Resources. I came to work at the Sago  
20 Mine in August of 2005 with the  
21 knowledge that ICG would be acquiring  
22 the Anker operation.  
23 CHAIR:  
24 Mr. Toler, if I can  
25 interrupt one second?

Page 199

1 MR. J.TOLER:  
2 Sure.  
3 CHAIR:  
4 The audience has  
5 indicated that there's a little trouble  
6 hearing. Perhaps you could use Mr.  
7 Hatfield's mic, which appears to be a  
8 little better.  
9 MR. J.TOLER:  
10 I'll begin again. My  
11 name is Jeff Toler, and I'm the mine  
12 superintendent at the Sago Mine. I've  
13 been a miner all my life. First at  
14 Brooks Run, where I worked with my  
15 uncle, Martin Toler, Jr., for 18 years.  
16 I continued at that mine after it was  
17 purchased by Alpha Natural Resources.  
18 I came to work at the Sago Mine in  
19 August of 2005 with the knowledge that  
20 ICG would be acquiring the Anker  
21 operations.  
22 Having worked with Sam  
23 Kitts at Brooks Run, I looked forward  
24 to participating in ICG's projected  
25 growth in this area. At that time, ICG

Page 200

1 was in the process of making numerous  
2 upgrades to the mine, such as upgrading  
3 the primary and secondary escape ways,  
4 investing in new mining equipment and  
5 implementing programs that Sam and I  
6 had seen used to good effect at Brooks  
7 Run, such as our performance group  
8 initiatives, which is an employment ---  
9 employee-involvement initiative. I was  
10 excited to be a part of that effort and  
11 to work with the miners there who were  
12 skilled and experienced men. It also  
13 gave me the opportunity to again work  
14 with my uncle, who died in this tragic  
15 accident.  
16 Junior Toler was a  
17 supervisor of the 12 miners on the Two  
18 Left Crew. That loss has been felt  
19 deeply by his family, which includes  
20 me. To the families of the men who  
21 died with my uncle, I extend my deepest  
22 sympathy. And I wish Randal McCloy the  
23 best in his continued recovery.  
24 At Sago, we operate two  
25 production shifts Monday through

Page 201

1 Thursday and conduct maintenance on the  
2 third shift. On Friday, Saturday and  
3 Sunday, we work one 13-hour production  
4 shift and a 13-hour maintenance shift.  
5 At the time of the accident, there were  
6 148 people employed at the mines. We  
7 produce coal in two sections with eight  
8 entries. We ventilate the mine using a  
9 blowing ventilation system. The roof  
10 is bolted typically using six-foot  
11 resin bolts, cable bolts and screens,  
12 depending on the condition of the roof.  
13 There are roof screens in the intake  
14 belt and track entries. We had focused  
15 on rock dusting since August. And in  
16 hindsight, I believe this effort helped  
17 keep the explosion from propagating  
18 throughout the mines.  
19 On the morning of January  
20 the 2nd, I arrived at the mine at my  
21 usual time, around 5:35 a.m. I was on  
22 the mine phone with the dispatcher when  
23 I heard the CO alarm sounding at his  
24 station. The CO system is an early  
25 fire detection system set to alarm at

1 ten parts per million of carbon  
 2 monoxide. Sometimes the system may  
 3 alarm when there's a defect in the  
 4 sensor that needs attending. At  
 5 exactly the same time the alarm  
 6 sounded, the dispatcher told me that he  
 7 had seen a serious lightning strike  
 8 through his window. My office has no  
 9 windows, but I did hear a very loud  
 10 thunder clap. My first thought was  
 11 that fuses had blown in the alarms.  
 12 And I told the dispatcher to radio the  
 13 crews that were in or out to the  
 14 sections and have them check the  
 15 alarms. Only the One Left crew  
 16 responded through its foreman, Owen  
 17 Jones. Owie's brother was also on the  
 18 Two Left crew.

19 Owie explained that  
 20 something had happened because a rush  
 21 of air had come from inby or further  
 22 into the mines and that there was smoke  
 23 in the air. I directed Owie to take  
 24 his crew immediately into the intake,  
 25 or fresh air, and to exit the mines.

1 Maintenance --- my maintenance foreman,  
 2 Dick Wilfong, safety director, Al  
 3 Schoonover and assistance maintenance  
 4 chief, Vernon Hofer and I started  
 5 underground in a manbus perhaps ten  
 6 minutes after we talked to Owen. We  
 7 first met Fred Jamison walking out of  
 8 the mines. He was not hurt and I told  
 9 him to continue on outside. We  
 10 continued into the mine where we also  
 11 encountered John Boni, a mine examiner,  
 12 near the old First Right panel. He was  
 13 also headed out of the mines as well on  
 14 foot and he also was not hurt.  
 15 As we continued down the  
 16 track, we passed the mine phone  
 17 somewhere around 25 or 30 block of  
 18 Number Four belt. And we stopped at  
 19 that phone to call to see whether  
 20 anyone had made contact with the Two  
 21 Left crew. As we were stopped, the One  
 22 Left crew had heard us coming up the  
 23 track and met up with us. We gave them  
 24 our manbus to continue out. We were  
 25 still not certain of what had happened.

1 So I called Johnny Stemple, our safety  
 2 person, and we agreed we may need to  
 3 start contacting mine rescue. Owen  
 4 Jones was not with the One Left crew at  
 5 this time, but rather further inby at  
 6 41 block at another mine phone, still  
 7 attempting to contact Two Left crew.  
 8 He was directed to join us.  
 9 Dick Wilfong and Vernon  
 10 Hofer took the One Left crew on our  
 11 manbus and took them outside. And Owen  
 12 Jones stayed with Al Schoonover and me  
 13 underground. I asked Owie to stay put  
 14 at the phone we were at and Al and I  
 15 walked up to 42 block to assess damage.  
 16 We observed stopping damage that the  
 17 One Left crew had told us about. I  
 18 went to the phone at 41 block and  
 19 called outside to ask Dick Wilfong and  
 20 Vernon Hofer to come back with  
 21 materials to repair ventilation  
 22 controls as we proceeded into the  
 23 mines. Al and I walked back to where  
 24 Owie was waiting by the phone. And  
 25 Dick and Vernon returned with the

1 ventilation material. We installed  
 2 curtains and trammed up to 42 block  
 3 where we started picking up carbon  
 4 monoxide with our alarms. We  
 5 de-energized the jeep and unplugged the  
 6 batteries and we proceeded on foot in  
 7 the intake air, keeping fresh air at  
 8 our backs.  
 9 At the 49 wall, the  
 10 stopping was blown down. And that is  
 11 the location where the belt breaks off  
 12 to the One Left section. Knowing there  
 13 was a telephone in the track entry at  
 14 this point, I stepped into the track  
 15 entry and moved the phone into the  
 16 intake and also moved the EMT supplies  
 17 from our station at that location into  
 18 the intake.  
 19 We proceeded up the  
 20 intake to the location where the belt  
 21 heads off to the Two Left section,  
 22 repairing damaged ventilation controls  
 23 as we went. As we installed the  
 24 ventilation curtains, we would wait  
 25 until the CO levels dropped and then

Page 206

1 move further into the mines.  
2 At this point, we started  
3 to notice it was taking longer for the  
4 CO levels to drop or for the fresh air  
5 to dissipate. And we observed that the  
6 velocity of the air behind us appeared  
7 to be dropping. This could indicate  
8 the ventilation controls behind us were  
9 damaged and perhaps we had missed  
10 something. I asked Owie and Vern Hofer  
11 to go outby and retrieve curtain and  
12 check to see if other ventilation  
13 controls were damaged and needed  
14 repaired. Dick, Al and I continued  
15 into the mines to about 57 block and  
16 put up a curtain.  
17 We walked to 58 block and  
18 observed that that stopping was also  
19 damaged. At this point, the smoke was  
20 dense and swirling. It appeared to me  
21 that it was not dissipating. We  
22 decided that if there was a fire inby,  
23 we should not direct further air to it.  
24 It was a difficult decision and we  
25 talked about it for a while before

Page 207

1 deciding the best course of action. I  
2 yelled toward any noise we heard,  
3 hoping to make contact. We gathered  
4 --- we decided that the safest course  
5 for the Two Left crew was for us to  
6 exit the mine and try to gather more  
7 information and consult with those more  
8 experienced in mine rescue than the  
9 three of us. Time throughout this day  
10 is a blur to me, but I believe we  
11 exited the mines at around 10:30 a.m.  
12 Again, I offer my deepest  
13 sympathies to the families. And I  
14 regret that mine conditions forced us  
15 to exit that day. I relive this  
16 nightmare in my mind many times over  
17 every day. Only in my mind, we saved  
18 them every time. Regrettably on  
19 January the 2nd, we did not. Ben?  
20 MR. HATFIELD:  
21 Meanwhile, on the mine  
22 surface, at about 7:00 a.m., the  
23 dispatcher called Johnny Stemple, who  
24 then contacted numerous parties,  
25 including rescue personnel, State and

Page 208

1 Federal --- State and Federal  
2 regulators and company safety managers  
3 not already onsite. These individuals  
4 were briefed on events at the mine.  
5 Following various communications  
6 between those safety managers and mine  
7 management onsite regarding immediate  
8 emergency procedures required, we began  
9 calling MSHA and State safety officials  
10 to report the accident at about 7:40  
11 a.m.  
12 Both MSHA and State  
13 safety officials were reached between  
14 7:56 and 8:28 a.m., and began arriving  
15 onsite soon thereafter. At 8:32 a.m.,  
16 MSHA inspector Jim Satterfield orally  
17 implemented an emergency mine closure  
18 order, also called the 103k order,  
19 prohibiting further entry to the mine.  
20 At about the same time,  
21 State mine inspectors began monitoring  
22 the air quality at the mine portal.  
23 High concentrations of carbon monoxide  
24 were found, indicating a significant  
25 risk of an active underground mine fire

Page 209

1 that could ignite an explosion. So  
2 State and mine --- State and Federal  
3 mine regulators onsite determined it  
4 was not safe for mine rescue teams to  
5 enter. This agonizing process of  
6 monitoring the carbon monoxide and  
7 methane levels in the mine air to  
8 confirm that it was safe to enter would  
9 continue throughout the day. Indeed,  
10 at various times in the morning and  
11 early afternoon, governmental officials  
12 seriously considered evacuating the  
13 mine office, because CO levels in the  
14 building itself were measurably high.  
15 After reaching a State  
16 official and while still trying to  
17 reach Federal authorities, at 8:04  
18 a.m., mine management began calling for  
19 rescue teams, with the first call being  
20 made to the Barbour County Mine Rescue  
21 Team. That team arrived onsite at  
22 approximately 10:40 a.m., and waited  
23 for State and Federal authorities to  
24 approve their entry into the mine.  
25 Other mine rescue teams were also

Page 210

1 contacted and continued to arrive at  
2 the mine throughout the course of the  
3 day, with eventual deployment of 13 to  
4 15 mine rescue teams by late afternoon  
5 on January 2nd.  
6 At this point, Sam Kitts  
7 will provide further detail on the  
8 rescue efforts.  
9 MR. KITTS:  
10 Thank you, Ben. Can you  
11 hear me?  
12 MR. HATFIELD:  
13 No.  
14 MR. KITTS:  
15 Hello?  
16 MR. HATFIELD:  
17 Try this one.  
18 MR. KITTS:  
19 Can you hear me? First  
20 I, too, would like to offer my  
21 condolences to the families that were  
22 affected by this terrible tragedy. I'm  
23 Sam Kitts, Senior Vice-president of  
24 Operations for West Virginia and  
25 Maryland Regions of ICG. And I've held

Page 211

1 this position for nearly a year. I have  
2 worked in the mining industry for 20  
3 years in various technical and  
4 operational positions. Immediately  
5 prior to joining ICG, I was president  
6 of Brooks Run Mining Company, as Jeff  
7 just alluded to.  
8 I am here to discuss with  
9 you what I know and what I have learned  
10 about the rescue effort, which  
11 consisted of advancing mine rescue  
12 teams into the mine and drilling  
13 boreholes from the surface in an effort  
14 to locate the missing miners. I will  
15 answer questions you may have regarding  
16 these efforts. Some of the information  
17 I am providing to you was learned from  
18 ICG personnel and other sources, as I  
19 cannot be directly involved in every  
20 aspect of the rescue operation. The  
21 times provided are approximations.  
22 The ICG personnel  
23 assigned to the following included  
24 Chuck Dunbar on my right, ICG  
25 Buckhannon General Manager. Chuck was

Page 212

1 involved in rescue coordination and  
2 command center operations. Tim Martin,  
3 who's not with us today, but is the ICG  
4 Corporate Director of Safety, who was  
5 involved in mine rescue team staging  
6 and coordination. Ty Coleman, who is  
7 on the Panel today, is the ICG Manager  
8 of Safety for West Virginia and  
9 Maryland areas, was involved in the  
10 command center and mine rescue team  
11 advancement. And also Joe Myers, ICG  
12 Buckhannon Chief Engineer, who is  
13 responsible for engineering support for  
14 creating the drill --- for the drilling  
15 rigs and producing mine maps for the  
16 rescue teams and the agencies. Many  
17 other ICG employees worked diligently  
18 throughout the rescue effort along with  
19 the regulatory agencies.  
20 I'm going to talk about  
21 the effort in two phases, the mine  
22 rescue team advancement into the mine  
23 and the drilling operations. First,  
24 the mine rescue team and agency  
25 notifications.

Page 213

1 On January 2, 2006, I  
2 received a call from Chuck Dunbar, ICG  
3 General Manager of the Buckhannon  
4 Business Unit, at approximately 8:30  
5 a.m., notifying me of a problem at the  
6 Sago Mine. The 103k order and  
7 equivalent State orders were in place  
8 when I arrived at approximately 11:45  
9 a.m. MSHA and State personnel were  
10 onsite. Family members were also  
11 present at the site when I arrived. I  
12 was in the command center and  
13 periodically participated in giving the  
14 families and friends updates on the  
15 status of the rescue operation. The  
16 first update being given at a Sago  
17 Baptist Church between 1:00 and 2:00  
18 p.m. on Monday afternoon.  
19 Johnny Stemple, who is on  
20 our Panel, was called at about 7:00  
21 a.m. and was briefed by the Sago Mine  
22 dispatcher about what he knew from  
23 communications he had had with those  
24 underground. He began calling for mine  
25 rescue teams about 8:00 a.m. in the

Page 214

1 morning of January 2nd. Stemple called  
2 for Chuck Dunbar, Raymond Coleman and  
3 Ty Coleman from the company. He also  
4 attempted to call the West Virginia  
5 State Mine Inspectors' Office in  
6 Fairmont, which was closed due to the  
7 holiday.  
8 He called the homes of  
9 State inspectors, Mark Wilfong, Brian  
10 Mills and John Collins. He also called  
11 Kenny Tenney of MSHA, MSHA's District  
12 Office in Bridgeport and Jeff Rice, as  
13 the Barbour County Mine Rescue Team  
14 between approximately 7:25 a.m. and  
15 8:05 a.m. Stemple then called the cell  
16 phone numbers for MSHA representatives  
17 Carlos Mosley, Bill Ponceroff and Kevin  
18 Stricklin between approximately 8:09  
19 and 8:13 a.m.  
20 John Collins, State  
21 inspector, returned the call at about  
22 7:56 a.m. Stemple called the MSHA  
23 Bridgeport office at about 8:25,  
24 obtained Jim Satterfield's number from  
25 the answering machine and called him at

Page 215

1 approximately 8:28. Mr. Satterfield  
2 issued a verbal 103k order at 8:32  
3 a.m., preventing anyone from entering  
4 the mine.  
5 Now staging of the mine  
6 rescue teams. Tim Martin coordinated  
7 the staging of the mine rescue teams  
8 for ICG. He developed a working  
9 rotation schedule to provide a constant  
10 supply of teams, a forward-moving team  
11 for exploration, and underground backup  
12 team positioned at the fresh air base,  
13 and also an outside backup team to  
14 support the fresh air base team that  
15 was underground, per established mine  
16 rescue procedure.  
17 The Barbour County Mine  
18 Rescue Team A arrived at the site at  
19 approximately 10:40 a.m. Ron White  
20 from MSHA contacted Consol's Mine  
21 Rescue Teams and ICG chartered a plane  
22 to bring ICG's Viper Mine Rescue Team  
23 from Illinois. They arrived at  
24 approximately 2:30 Monday afternoon.  
25 So two mine rescue teams, Barbour

Page 216

1 County, A and B, were at the mine and  
2 ready to enter at about noon on January  
3 2. Other teams would continue to  
4 arrive throughout.  
5 Air sampling at the mine  
6 portal was being done to establish a  
7 trend in the methane and carbon  
8 monoxide content of the air exiting the  
9 mine. Mine rescue team members, under  
10 apparatus, were assisting. The CO  
11 readings at the portal continued to  
12 rise throughout the morning and  
13 afternoon, eventually exceeding 2,300  
14 parts per million. At about 4:15 p.m.,  
15 the CO levels began trending downward.  
16 At approximately 5:10, the 103k order  
17 was modified, and the first mine rescue  
18 team entered the mine at 5:25.  
19 Okay. While this was  
20 going on, there was an effort to  
21 mobilize a drill rig in order to access  
22 the mine from the surface. Concurrent  
23 to the mine rescue team operations,  
24 drill rigs were being mobilized to the  
25 area overlying the mine beginning

Page 217

1 Monday morning around 11:00 a.m. The  
2 decision to drill from the surface near  
3 the face of Two Left was based on  
4 several factors. The estimated  
5 location of the Two Left crew at the  
6 time of the explosion, the need to  
7 determine the atmosphere ahead of the  
8 mine rescue teams, and the need to  
9 determine the extent of the explosion  
10 damage, which at this point was  
11 unknown.  
12 On the morning of January  
13 2nd, Chuck Dunbar contacted Mike Ross  
14 regarding obtaining drilling rigs as  
15 quickly as possible. Mr. Ross was able  
16 to mobilize three drills from Hyre  
17 Water well in Buckhannon, United  
18 Drilling from Jane Lew and Phoenix  
19 Drilling in Buckhannon. The Hyre Water  
20 Well drill was ultimately used to drill  
21 the first borehole into the Two Left  
22 face area.  
23 A V6 size dozer was  
24 delivered to the site at around 5:00  
25 p.m. The dozer constructed 1,600 feet

1 of road down a hillside to reach the  
 2 proposed drill site. It then excavated  
 3 a pad 200 feet long and 90 feet wide in  
 4 order to set up the drill. While the  
 5 road and pad were being constructed, a  
 6 survey had to be run for over two miles  
 7 away. Heavy cloud cover hindered use  
 8 of GPS surveying instruments. A  
 9 combination of conventional and GPS  
 10 surveying methods had to be improvised  
 11 to get the borehole locations staked on  
 12 the ground.  
 13 The surveyors arrived at  
 14 approximately 2:00 p.m. and after  
 15 overcoming several technical obstacles,  
 16 finished locating the borehole at 11:30  
 17 p.m. on Monday. It took another two-  
 18 and-one-half hours to modify the drill  
 19 pad to allow the drill to set up  
 20 exactly on the coordinate that it would  
 21 allow the borehole to penetrate a mine  
 22 opening and not a solid coal pillar.  
 23 The drill began sinking  
 24 the hole at 2:50 a.m. Tuesday morning  
 25 and penetrated the mine at 5:35 a.m.

1 The drill steel was sounded in hopes of  
 2 a response, but none came. Air samples  
 3 indicated 1,300 parts per million CO,  
 4 .04 percent methane and 20.7 percent  
 5 oxygen. Images from a down-hole camera  
 6 indicated no blast damage in the  
 7 vicinity of the section feeder.  
 8 Now, going back to the  
 9 mine rescue team advancement. As I  
 10 last mentioned, they had been cleared  
 11 to enter the mine, and did enter the  
 12 mine at 5:20 --- 5:25, excuse me, p.m.  
 13 on January 2nd. By 2:45 a.m. Tuesday  
 14 morning, the teams had advanced to  
 15 crosscut 34 of Number Four belt, or  
 16 9,400 feet from the portal, before  
 17 encountering an energized CO monitor  
 18 and being ordered to evacuate the mine  
 19 so the CO monitor battery backup could  
 20 be de-energized. Arriving outside at  
 21 3:40 a.m.  
 22 Now, there's a lot more  
 23 detail as to what the teams encountered  
 24 in this first push, but to be concise,  
 25 let's just say that the first team

1 entered the mine at 5:25 and were able  
 2 to go 9,400 feet into the mine due to  
 3 the CO monitor being de-energized at  
 4 3:57 a.m.  
 5 The teams were held  
 6 outside until the borehole penetrated  
 7 the mine at 5:35 a.m. The mine rescue  
 8 teams re-entered the mine at 6:20 a.m.,  
 9 along with the V2 search robot. The  
 10 teams advanced 2,000 feet to the mouth  
 11 of Two Left section by 4:21 p.m.  
 12 Tuesday afternoon.  
 13 At approximately 5:18, a  
 14 body was found, but not identified,  
 15 between 58 and 57 crosscut in the track  
 16 entry. It was later determined to be  
 17 Terry Helms.  
 18 Establishing the fresh  
 19 air base at the mouth of Two Left, the  
 20 teams advanced 400 feet to examine the  
 21 seals where they thought the seals ---  
 22 where they found the seals to be  
 23 destroyed, literally walking through  
 24 the seals without knowing it. Upon  
 25 closer inspection, it was determined

1 the seals were blown out from the force  
 2 originating in the previously-sealed  
 3 area. This was the first indication of  
 4 where the explosion originated. The  
 5 teams then advanced 1,900 feet between  
 6 7:12 p.m. and 11:46 p.m. up to Left  
 7 heading, extending the mine rescue team  
 8 communication chain well beyond normal  
 9 distances in order to expedite reaching  
 10 the face area where they found the  
 11 barricade.  
 12 The message heard in the  
 13 command center was that all 12 miners  
 14 were alive. The medical personnel were  
 15 immediately sent inside to assist the  
 16 mine rescue teams. At about 12:18 a.m.  
 17 on January 4, the mine command center  
 18 received a report that the mine rescue  
 19 team and survivors were leaving the  
 20 face. Then at 12:30 a.m., when the  
 21 team reached the fresh air base and  
 22 were no longer under breathing  
 23 apparatus, the command center was  
 24 informed that there appeared to be only  
 25 one survivor and the other 11 miners



Page 222

1 showed no vital signs.  
2 Randal McCloy's identity  
3 was not confirmed prior to being rushed  
4 to medical treatment from the site at  
5 1:00 a.m.  
6 CHAIR:  
7 Mr. Hatfield, if I might  
8 interrupt for one moment. The court  
9 stenographer needs to change her paper.  
10 If we could wait for her to do that,  
11 please?  
12 MR. HATFIELD:  
13 We'll certainly do that.  
14 BRIEF INTERRUPTION  
15 CHAIR:  
16 You can proceed.  
17 MR. HATFIELD:  
18 Thank you. As Sam Kitts  
19 described, just before midnight on the  
20 evening of January 3, a remaining 12  
21 missing miners were found. As a result  
22 of the extreme difficulties in  
23 communications hundreds of feet below  
24 the surface, while wearing special  
25 breathing apparatus, the now well-known

Page 223

1 miscommunication about the number of  
2 survivors occurred. As we all now  
3 know, at approximately 11:46 p.m., the  
4 command center received a message over  
5 the mine phone that 12 are alive.  
6 Cheers and joyful pandemonium erupted  
7 throughout the mine office. Rescue  
8 workers and company officials who had  
9 heretofore begun to lose hope sprang  
10 into a flurry of activity in  
11 preparation for bringing the miners to  
12 the surface. We knew that they would  
13 need immediate medical attention. No  
14 authorized company spokesman authorized  
15 --- no authorized company spokesperson  
16 announced what we had all heard, but  
17 the news still spread like wildfire.  
18 At 12:18 a.m., the  
19 command center received word that the  
20 mine rescue team and survivors were  
21 leaving the face. At 12:30 a.m., when  
22 the mine rescue team reached fresh air  
23 and was no longer operating with  
24 breathing apparatus, the mine command  
25 center was informed that there appeared

Page 224

1 to be only one survivor and the other  
2 11 miners showed no vital signs and  
3 appeared to be deceased. The elapsed  
4 time since the first call was roughly  
5 45 minutes. The immediate reaction in  
6 the command center was that this report  
7 of only one survivor may be erroneous.  
8 Many participants in the command center  
9 clung to the fervent hope that the  
10 other 11 miners may be in some sort of  
11 comatose state. We continued to  
12 believe that there was still hope.  
13 Another unfortunate  
14 circumstance that prevented quicker  
15 communication with the families was the  
16 simple fact that rescue workers had not  
17 checked the identity of the survivor  
18 before he was placed in the ambulance  
19 and rushed to the hospital. As Sam  
20 noted, we didn't learn Randal McCloy's  
21 identity until after 2:00 a.m.  
22 In short, we had learned  
23 that the information was probably not  
24 as hoped, but we were uncertain. We  
25 knew that one person was alive, but we

Page 225

1 didn't know who. We frankly didn't  
2 know what message to deliver to the  
3 families. We feared the pain and hurt  
4 that incomplete or incorrect  
5 information would have caused, and we  
6 searched for the right means to settle  
7 and communicate with the exuberant  
8 crowd.  
9 Somewhere around 1:45  
10 a.m., as we continued to search for  
11 answers, we attempted to send message  
12 to the families at the church through  
13 the State Police radio system. And  
14 officer was asked to relay word to the  
15 clergy that we have conflicting reports  
16 on survivors and the initial reports  
17 may have been too optimistic. As we  
18 now know, the State Police officers did  
19 relay that message, but it did not get  
20 communicated to the families.  
21 As soon as we learned the  
22 identify of the survivor and debriefed  
23 the mine rescue team members, who  
24 convinced the command center members  
25 that the others were, in fact,

Page 226

1 deceased, we immediately prepared a  
2 brief statement and headed to the  
3 church to deliver the terrible news to  
4 the families. That message was  
5 delivered around 2:30 a.m. on January  
6 4th.  
7 Those of us involved in  
8 the rescue effort suffered from the  
9 same fatigue and range of emotions that  
10 everyone in the church did. Everyone  
11 in the mine office was fully committed  
12 physically and emotional --- physically  
13 and emotionally to the rescue effort.  
14 Throughout this plus-40 hour ordeal, we  
15 sought to provide meaningful  
16 information on a timely basis to the  
17 families. Unfortunately, during the  
18 final stages, the combination of cell  
19 phone communications and lack of  
20 verified information to pass on to the  
21 families, converged to make the tragedy  
22 even worse.  
23 At this point, Charles  
24 Snavely will provide further detail  
25 regarding the events in the command

Page 227

1 center.  
2 MR. SNAVELY:  
3 Can you hear this all  
4 right?  
5 MR. HATFIELD:  
6 That's okay.  
7 MR. SNAVELY:  
8 My name's Charles  
9 Snavely. I'm the Vice-president of  
10 Planning and Acquisitions for  
11 International Coal Group. I joined ICG  
12 in June 2005 after having been a  
13 President of Bell County Coal  
14 Corporation for ten years. I was  
15 present in the command center at the  
16 Sago Mine from about eight o'clock on  
17 January the 3rd, Tuesday, until the  
18 conclusion of the rescue operation.  
19 Until then, I had been keeping up to  
20 date on the situation, and I came to  
21 Sago as the rescue drew on to relieve  
22 people who would be exhausted.  
23 The process of  
24 advancement of the teams was basically  
25 to move the fresh air base up so the

Page 228

1 teams could advance more quickly.  
2 There were 14 plans submitted by the  
3 company and approved over this 40-hour  
4 period for the rescue advancement. Any  
5 change in the plans required the  
6 approval of the company, MSHA and the  
7 State. And all the changes in the  
8 plans had to be requested in writing.  
9 All efforts were focused  
10 on the most important thing on Tuesday  
11 and that was getting the teams to Two  
12 Left section and rescuing the crew,  
13 while at the same time not endangering  
14 the rescue workers. The company, the  
15 State and MSHA had to balance these  
16 concerns because there have been  
17 situations in which the rescue teams  
18 have perished in the process of rescue  
19 when they encountered methane which  
20 ignited. We all knew that time was of  
21 the essence, but also recognized that  
22 the progress of the teams had to be  
23 methodical.  
24 The confusion over  
25 whether the men in the barricade were

Page 229

1 alive started underground. The persons  
2 who got to the barricade were relaying  
3 the information via walkie-talkie and  
4 orally to the fresh air base. As the  
5 word passed from person to person to be  
6 relayed to the command center, the  
7 message apparently was not understood.  
8 As has been mentioned, it was first  
9 believed that all were alive because  
10 that was what was called out from  
11 underground quite clearly. With all  
12 the people coming in and out of the  
13 command center, evidently people  
14 overheard this communication and  
15 reported that to the families at the  
16 church. There were also people,  
17 apparently, listening to the mine phone  
18 communication who were not in the  
19 command center.  
20 When you have that many  
21 people in a confined environment  
22 traveling in and out, it makes it  
23 difficult to control the disbursement of  
24 information. Besides, everyone wants  
25 to convey --- convey good news and

1 that's simply what happened. It was  
 2 not an intentional act of dispensing  
 3 misinformation. No one would do that  
 4 to these people who had waited and  
 5 prayed for 41 hours. However, once the  
 6 word was out, emotions ran high as one  
 7 might expect.  
 8 I spoke later with a  
 9 rescue team member who had been to the  
 10 fresh air base when Randal McCloy was  
 11 brought out. He also was expecting the  
 12 other 11 men to come out with the  
 13 rescue team at that time. And he was  
 14 surprised to learn that they were not  
 15 alive.  
 16 But as has been  
 17 mentioned, we did not know Mr. McCloy's  
 18 identity at the time; we just knew  
 19 there was one survivor. I was also  
 20 present when the rescue team captain  
 21 was debriefed after Randal McCloy was  
 22 brought outside. At the time, we still  
 23 didn't know Randal's identity because  
 24 he was rushed to the hospital when he  
 25 was brought out.

1 There was still  
 2 uncertainty among the command center  
 3 personnel as to whether the remaining  
 4 men may yet be alive. The team captain  
 5 who reached the barricaded area in Two  
 6 Left explained, after he had exited the  
 7 mine and was debriefed, that they had  
 8 diligently examined the other men for  
 9 vital signs and found none.  
 10 Because ICG did not want  
 11 to report any misinformation to the  
 12 families, we insisted on talking  
 13 firsthand with the person who had  
 14 reached the barricade at Two Left  
 15 before reporting any official word with  
 16 the families at the church. We, as  
 17 they, were devastated by the  
 18 confirmation. We could not begin to  
 19 imagine how the families would feel.  
 20 MR. HATFIELD:  
 21 Mr. Chairman, that  
 22 concludes our prepared statements for  
 23 this Panel. We will now take your  
 24 questions.  
 25 QUESTIONS OF PANEL

1 CHAIR:  
 2 What I propose to do is  
 3 ask a few questions now, then take a  
 4 break and then come back, accept  
 5 questions after a break, if that's all  
 6 right.  
 7 Mr. Toler, my question  
 8 for you is, after you exited the mine,  
 9 after the rescue effort, who did you  
 10 speak to in the command center and what  
 11 did you do to convey the information  
 12 that you had with regard to the  
 13 situation underground?  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 As I said earlier,  
 16 everything is kind of a blur to me  
 17 throughout that day, specifically once  
 18 I reached the surface. I don't recall  
 19 exactly who was in the command center  
 20 when I was debriefed. All the men that  
 21 were with me, we all went in the  
 22 command center, we were all debriefed  
 23 together. And we just conveyed the ---  
 24 what information we had on to the --- I  
 25 can't tell you who was actually in

1 there at that time.  
 2 CHAIR:  
 3 If you could tell--- and  
 4 I do appreciate the difficulty you're  
 5 having. But did you talk to the other  
 6 mine rescue teams or was there more  
 7 than one conversation? I guess that  
 8 was the question?  
 9 MR. COLEMAN:  
 10 Can you hear me?  
 11 CHAIR:  
 12 I can't hear you.  
 13 MR. COLEMAN:  
 14 Can you hear me now?  
 15 CHAIR:  
 16 Not quite.  
 17 MR. COLEMAN:  
 18 If I may interject?  
 19 During --- when, he came out with the  
 20 others, myself, along with other ---  
 21 other State and Federal officials. He  
 22 basically gave us information as to  
 23 what he encountered. And we got  
 24 first-person information from Owen  
 25 Jones who was inside at the time of the

Page 234

1 explosion.  
2 CHAIR:  
3 Since we are having a  
4 little trouble with the mic, if we  
5 could take a break now, perhaps we'll  
6 try to fix those mics and we'll get  
7 better answers. We'll take a short  
8 recess.  
9 SHORT BREAK TAKEN  
10 CHAIR:  
11 All right. If we can  
12 begin. What I'd like to do, is I'd  
13 like to get ten minutes of questions  
14 from the State and from MSHA and then  
15 turn it over to the Legislative body  
16 and to the families for questions, so  
17 that we can do it in that orderly kind  
18 of way. Ray?  
19 MR. MCKINNEY:  
20 Mr. Toler, can you hear  
21 me?  
22 MR. J.TOLER:  
23 Yes, sir.  
24 MR. MCKINNEY:  
25 Was a pre-shift

Page 235

1 examination called out from underground  
2 the morning of the explosion?  
3 CHAIR:  
4 They can't hear you.  
5 MR. HATFIELD:  
6 I'm sorry, we can't hear  
7 Ray now. Try it again.  
8 MR. MCKINNEY:  
9 Mr. Toler, was a  
10 pre-shift examination called outside  
11 the morning of the explosion?  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 Yes, sir.  
14 MR. MCKINNEY:  
15 What were the results of  
16 that examination?  
17 MR. J.TOLER:  
18 I'm sorry, sir, I don't  
19 --- I'm not aware right now.  
20 MR. MCKINNEY:  
21 Is there anybody on the  
22 Panel who does have that information?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 Mr. Crumrine may. No,  
25 I'm sorry, you weren't scheduled to

Page 236

1 work that day; were you, sir?  
2 MR. MCKINNEY:  
3 Would you be able to  
4 furnish us that information?  
5 MR. J.TOLER:  
6 Yes, sir.  
7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
8 As I understood your  
9 testimony ---  
10 MR. J.TOLER:  
11 If you could ---.  
12 MR. MCKINNEY:  
13 As I understood your  
14 testimony, you got some information  
15 again --- to go underground. Who did  
16 you speak with underground before you  
17 entered the coal mine?  
18 MR. J.TOLER:  
19 Owen Jones.  
20 MR. MCKINNEY:  
21 And could you tell me  
22 what that conversation was?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 It was just basically ---  
25 we were trying to notify the crews, you

Page 237

1 know, we heard --- we can tell the CO  
2 alarms was going off. And we were  
3 trying to notify the crews to check the  
4 alarms. And Owen was the first person,  
5 and only person, to get on a phone from  
6 underground. He just indicated --- he  
7 said something to the effect of, I'm  
8 not sure, but something from towards  
9 Two Left section, we had a big rush of  
10 air, don't know what's happened up  
11 there. I didn't drill him on questions  
12 because in --- my response to that was  
13 to get in there and investigate.  
14 MR. MCKINNEY:  
15 During the conversation  
16 with Mr. Jones, did he mention the word  
17 smoke to you?  
18 MR. J.TOLER:  
19 It's possible, though I  
20 don't recall.  
21 MR. MCKINNEY:  
22 I think I read the  
23 transcript and in that ---.  
24 MR. J.TOLER:  
25 He may have. I'm not

1 going to say he didn't. I just don't  
 2 recall.  
 3 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 4 If he did say the word  
 5 smoke and you had CO sensors going on  
 6 at that point in time, was it a  
 7 concern to try to get assistance to the  
 8 mine?  
 9 MR. J.TOLER:  
 10 The first thought in my  
 11 mind was to get inside, ascertain what  
 12 had happened, and to try to ascertain  
 13 the condition of all of my men. I had  
 14 28 men in harm's way at this point.  
 15 That was the only thought I had.  
 16 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 17 Did you leave directions  
 18 for anyone on the surface to make phone  
 19 calls to particular individuals?  
 20 MR. J.TOLER:  
 21 Not that I recall. I'm  
 22 not sure.  
 23 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 24 Do you know if phone  
 25 calls were made to other company

1 officials while you were underground to  
 2 make them aware?  
 3 MR. J.TOLER:  
 4 I'm not aware of any of  
 5 that. My first conversation with any  
 6 company official was --- while I was  
 7 underground, I didn't speak to Johnny  
 8 Stemple.  
 9 MR. HATFIELD:  
 10 I believe Johnny Stemple  
 11 may be able to help you with respect to  
 12 call sequence if you're interested in  
 13 that. MR. MCKINNEY:  
 14 Can Mr. Stemple answer  
 15 the question; please.  
 16 MR. STEMPLE:  
 17 Yes, I made several phone  
 18 calls that morning in a matter of  
 19 three-and-a-half hours, I either made  
 20 or received 47 phone calls in a three-  
 21 and-a-half hour period.  
 22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 23 At what point in time,  
 24 Mr. Stemple, did you believe an  
 25 explosion had occurred underground?

1 MR. STEMPLE:  
 2 When the mine rescue team  
 3 went to the Number Ten seal and saw no  
 4 evidence of the seal, that's when I  
 5 knew that we had an explosion.  
 6 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 7 So when you called the  
 8 authorities, the State and Federal  
 9 agencies, what information were you  
 10 sharing with them?  
 11 MR. STEMPLE:  
 12 I told them the exact  
 13 same thing that Bill Chisolm told me  
 14 when he phoned me. That we've had an  
 15 incident underground, I don't know what  
 16 has happened. The One Left crew called  
 17 out and said that they've noticed some  
 18 stopping damage and smoke and dust in  
 19 the air. There was a tremendous  
 20 lightning storm at the same time. We  
 21 had lost power in certain areas of the  
 22 mine. He didn't know what was going on  
 23 for sure. I asked where was Jeff  
 24 Toler? He said, underground. I asked  
 25 where was Al Schoonover, the safety

1 director. He said underground. I said  
 2 where was the maintenance foreman?  
 3 They all went underground.  
 4 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 5 Mr. Toler, as you  
 6 traveled through the mine, at what  
 7 point in time did you think a  
 8 significant event had occurred  
 9 underground, such as an explosion or a  
 10 mine fire?  
 11 MR. J.TOLER:  
 12 I would say the first  
 13 indication that I had was when I first  
 14 --- when I saw the first damage to  
 15 ventilation controls, which I think was  
 16 roughly at Number 32 wall of Number  
 17 Four belt.  
 18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 19 Did you have any contact  
 20 with people on the surface by the mine  
 21 telephone after you made that  
 22 determination?  
 23 MR. J.TOLER:  
 24 Yes, sir.  
 25 MR. MCKINNEY:

Page 242

1 What did you relay to the  
2 people on the surface?  
3 MR. J.TOLER:  
4 I don't recall. That may  
5 have even been around the time that I  
6 talked to Johnny, I'm not sure.  
7 MR. STEMPLE:  
8 Yes. At that time, Bill  
9 Chisolm patched the mine phone in to  
10 the land-line phone. I was currently  
11 at home. It was a holiday and I was on  
12 a day off. And he patched the  
13 land-line phone together with the mine  
14 phone. And I asked Jeff, I said, what  
15 do you have? He said I really don't  
16 know. He said, I talked to the One  
17 Left crew and there is some ventilation  
18 control damage, some stoppings that  
19 have been damaged. I said, have you  
20 been able to contact the Two Left crew  
21 yet? He said, no, I have not, but we  
22 have been trying to contact the Two  
23 Left crew. I said, is all of the One  
24 Left crew accounted for? He said, yes,  
25 and I've sent them toward the outside.

Page 243

1 I said, well, until we  
2 get ahold of the Two Left crew, you  
3 need to get in the intake, get what  
4 curtain and material that you can  
5 gather to replace any damaged  
6 stoppings, to re-establish the  
7 ventilation in the mine and work your  
8 way toward the Two Left section in an  
9 effort to communicate with them. As  
10 you get to different mine phones, try  
11 and continue to make communication with  
12 them. Keep the fresh air with you.  
13 Don't endanger your lives. If you get  
14 into any high concentrations of CO, you  
15 need to stop. Don't endanger your  
16 lives, but we do need to make an effort  
17 to communicate with the Two Left crew.  
18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
19 So based on that  
20 information, you're talking about high  
21 levels of CO, then smoke, things of  
22 that nature, did you think an explosion  
23 occurred underground?  
24 MR. STEMPLE:  
25 My personal opinion was

Page 244

1 that we may have --- since we had a  
2 large lightning strike outside that we  
3 may have had the high-voltage cable or  
4 a high-voltage cable plug or a power  
5 center that may have blew up or  
6 exploded. That was my opinion at the  
7 time with the information that I had.  
8 MR. MCKINNEY:  
9 Mr. Toler, I understand  
10 from your conversation with Mr. Stemple  
11 at that time, you felt like there may  
12 have been an explosion underground?  
13 MR. J.TOLER:  
14 No, sir. At that point  
15 in time when I talked to Mr. Stemple, I  
16 did not have a detector with me, so I  
17 couldn't --- I can't say that we were  
18 detecting carbon monoxide at that  
19 point. All I can tell you, at that  
20 point when I talked to Johnny, all I  
21 can tell you is we had damage to  
22 ventilation controls.  
23 MR. MCKINNEY:  
24 Did you get any type of  
25 carbon monoxide or methane readings as

Page 245

1 you entered the coal mine?  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 Initially when I entered  
4 the coal mines? As I said, I did not  
5 have a detector. When Mr. Wilfong and  
6 Mr. Hofer took the One Left crew  
7 outside via our manbus, Mr. Schoonover  
8 and I and Owen Jones stayed together.  
9 They got back --- when they got back,  
10 they brought ventilation supplies to  
11 repair the damage controls, plus  
12 several detectors with them. And it  
13 was at that point that we started  
14 repairing the controls and advancing  
15 into the mines.  
16 MR. MCKINNEY:  
17 So your conversation with  
18 Mr. Stemple was prior to you getting a  
19 detector?  
20 MR. J.TOLER:  
21 Yes, sir.  
22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
23 What were the readings  
24 that you obtained on your detector as  
25 you went underground?

1 MR. J.TOLER:  
 2 I don't know that I ever  
 3 held a detector to take a reading. I  
 4 was more concerned about hanging the  
 5 curtains, Ray.  
 6 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 7 Were the detectors going  
 8 off, sounding alarm?  
 9 MR. J.TOLER:  
 10 We repaired --- the first  
 11 damaged control that we found was at  
 12 --- I think at 32 wall. And we  
 13 repaired it and we advanced on in on  
 14 the track, which is in the neutral  
 15 split. And on a blowing system, the  
 16 airflow on a neutral split will course  
 17 toward the outside. When we got to 42  
 18 wall, was the next stopping that was  
 19 damaged. And when we repaired it, I  
 20 think that's when we initially started  
 21 getting some CO --- started getting  
 22 some alarms on our CO detectors. At  
 23 that point, we de-energized the machine  
 24 and unplugged the batteries and put our  
 25 ventilation --- our supplies in the

1 intake and started to advance on foot  
 2 in the intake, keeping fresh air to our  
 3 backs.  
 4 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 5 I think you indicated  
 6 that at some point in time, maybe 48 or  
 7 49 block, you stopped the exploration.  
 8 MR. J.TOLER:  
 9 At 49 block, I knew there  
 10 was a functioning telephone at that  
 11 point, because when Owen Jones called  
 12 outside immediately after the event,  
 13 that was the phone he was using. So I  
 14 was aware there was a functioning  
 15 telephone there. And so I stopped  
 16 there and I stepped over into that air  
 17 course to move that phone into the  
 18 intake, so that we would have some form  
 19 of communication in fresh air with us.  
 20 As I was doing that, it  
 21 dawned on me that our EMT station was  
 22 right at that location as well, so I  
 23 went ahead and put it in the intake as  
 24 well. I had no idea what or if we  
 25 would need anything. So I did all of

1 that at that point right there.  
 2 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 3 At what time --- point in  
 4 time during your exploration, did you  
 5 feel there had been an explosion  
 6 underground?  
 7 MR. J.TOLER:  
 8 Probably after we  
 9 advanced inby, that point right there.  
 10 I think we started noticing some soot  
 11 on the ribs, a lot of soot and that was  
 12 probably our first indication that it  
 13 was an explosion.  
 14 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 15 Can you recall what time  
 16 that would have been?  
 17 MR. J.TOLER:  
 18 I was not keeping any  
 19 kind of timeline at all at this point.  
 20 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 21 A range?  
 22 MR. J.TOLER:  
 23 A range? Probably  
 24 somewhere between eight and nine  
 25 o'clock, probably closer to the nine

1 o'clock area.  
 2 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 3 And did you communicate  
 4 that to the surface once ---?  
 5 MR. J.TOLER:  
 6 No. We had already  
 7 advanced inby where we put that phone  
 8 in fresh air.  
 9 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 10 Did you communicate with  
 11 the surface at all before you returned  
 12 to the outside?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 I think as we started  
 15 outside, I stopped and called and told  
 16 them that we were exiting the mines.  
 17 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 18 Did you share any other  
 19 information with them about what you  
 20 saw or thought had happened?  
 21 MR. J.TOLER:  
 22 I don't recall. I don't  
 23 recall. I'm not sure exactly who I  
 24 even talked to.  
 25 MR. CLAIR:

1 I just have one follow-up  
2 question for Mr. Stemple. And that is,  
3 you made, I believe you said, 27 phone  
4 calls. Were other people in the  
5 company making phone calls as well to  
6 either the State authorities or the  
7 Federal authorities? Had any of that  
8 been delegated?

9 MR. STEMPLE:

10 I stated that I made or  
11 received 47 phone calls. Number four.  
12 And to my knowledge, I wasn't aware of  
13 anybody else making any phone calls.  
14 Some of my phone calls, I asked others  
15 to make phone calls for me in an effort  
16 to help me. Many of my phone calls  
17 were made to answering machines and  
18 there was nobody on the other end to  
19 talk to.

20 MR. CLAIR:

21 And you were receiving  
22 updated information from the mine from  
23 the period from seven o'clock, when you  
24 were notified, until the time you left  
25 for the mine?

1 MR. STEMPLE:

2 Occasionally some of  
3 those phone calls were to the mine and  
4 some of those phone calls were from the  
5 mine, yes.

6 MR. CLAIR:

7 Okay.

8 CHAIR:

9 Mr. Toler, at 49 break or  
10 50 when you began to see the dust and  
11 the smoke, can you describe the color  
12 and density of it or the nature of it?

13 MR. J.TOLER:

14 At 49 and 50 wall, it  
15 wasn't a lot of smoke, but you did see  
16 some evidence of the soot. I would  
17 imagine as we were repairing the  
18 controls, we were probably pushing the  
19 smoke. The smoke that we really  
20 encountered was up around 57 to 58  
21 wall. At that point, the smoke was  
22 extremely dense ceiling to floor. It  
23 would be like trying to look through  
24 the curtain there in front of your  
25 table.

1 CHAIR:

2 Now, if we might, the  
3 families --- give the opportunity for  
4 the families to ask questions and then  
5 the Legislators.

6 MS. COHEN:

7 Mr. Jamison, what time  
8 did you arrive at work at the mine on  
9 January 2nd?

10 MR. JAMISON:

11 What was that?

12 MS. COHEN:

13 What time did you arrive  
14 at work on January 2nd?

15 MR. JAMISON:

16 2:30 a.m.

17 MS. COHEN:

18 Was Mr. Chisolm already  
19 there?

20 MR. JAMISON:

21 Was what?

22 MS. COHEN:

23 Was the dispatcher, Mr.  
24 Chisolm, already present?

25 MR. JAMISON:

1 Yes.

2 MS. COHEN:

3 Do fire bosses typically  
4 go underground without the dispatcher  
5 being present?

6 MR. JAMISON:

7 No, we don't do that.

8 MR. COHEN:

9 What time did you enter  
10 the mine?

11 MR. JAMISON:

12 What time did I get in or  
13 out?

14 MS. COHEN:

15 What time did you enter  
16 the mine to do your fire bossing?

17 MR. JAMISON:

18 It was --- I arrived at  
19 2:30 and it was a little bit after that  
20 Terry Helms, the other fire boss,  
21 arrived. We got dressed. And I asked  
22 him how he was going to do it. He  
23 said, you do your regular run, Two  
24 Left, I'll do mine in One Left. So we  
25 signed off on the books, got our lights



Page 254

1 and went down there underground. So it  
2 was probably around --- it was close to  
3 three o'clock.  
4 MS. COHEN:  
5 What was considered your  
6 regular run, because in your transcript  
7 you said this was the --- only the  
8 second time you had done the fire boss?  
9 MR. JAMISON:  
10 His regular run was from  
11 Four head in.  
12 MS. COHEN:  
13 What was your regular  
14 run?  
15 MR. JAMISON:  
16 From the outside into  
17 Three or Four head.  
18 MS. COHEN:  
19 And how long does it  
20 typically take to fire boss the  
21 section?  
22 MR. JAMISON:  
23 What, Two Left?  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 Uh-huh (yes).

Page 255

1 MR. JAMISON:  
2 It took about 25 minutes.  
3 MS. COHEN:  
4 Is that normal time to do  
5 a fire boss of the whole section?  
6 MR. JAMISON:  
7 Yeah. Across the face,  
8 yeah.  
9 MS. COHEN:  
10 Why were your notes lost?  
11 Where did you lay them down?  
12 MR. JAMISON:  
13 Well, they wasn't --- I  
14 had them in my shirt when we come  
15 outside. And there was a lot of  
16 confusion going on, the rescue squad  
17 was there, the mine rescue. So we was  
18 going up to the tippie where we took  
19 our clothes off and changed because I  
20 didn't want to get in my truck. And my  
21 clothes probably ended up in the hamper  
22 there, where they put them in and wash  
23 them.  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 So your notes were never

Page 256

1 found?  
2 MR. JAMISON:  
3 No. They're probably in  
4 the laundry.  
5 MS. COHEN:  
6 Did you call your fire  
7 boss report out to anybody or give it  
8 to anybody?  
9 MR. JAMISON:  
10 I carried it out.  
11 MS. COHEN:  
12 So no one received your  
13 fire boss report from the Two Left  
14 section?  
15 MR. COHEN:  
16 Yeah, I carried it out,  
17 because I had to bring the mantrip out  
18 so dayshift would have a ride in.  
19 MS. COHEN:  
20 But you're saying your  
21 notes were lost?  
22 MR. JAMISON:  
23 Yeah. Where I keep notes  
24 in a book. I keep notes in a book in  
25 my shirt pocket.

Page 257

1 MS. COHEN:  
2 On page 27 of your  
3 transcript --- Mr. Jamison, on page 27  
4 of your transcript, you said you were  
5 afraid of getting off the track by  
6 yourself. Why was that?  
7 MR. JAMISON:  
8 Well, if you get a  
9 mantrip off the track, you can't get it  
10 back on.  
11 MS. COHEN:  
12 When was the last time,  
13 prior to January 2nd, that you fire  
14 bossed at Sago?  
15 MR. JAMISON:  
16 At Two Left?  
17 MS. COHEN:  
18 Just any fire bossing in  
19 general. When was the last time ---?  
20 MR. JAMISON:  
21 Well, I fire boss every  
22 day. But the last time I was on Two  
23 Left was after Christmas.  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 Can you tell me what you

Page 258

1 did in your pre-shift examination, and  
2 what you reported out to the surface  
3 from Two Left?  
4 MR. JAMISON:  
5 Well, I didn't write  
6 anything down because the section  
7 looked good, but I checked the pocks,  
8 depth, and make sure all the curtains  
9 were up and the air was good.  
10 MS. COHEN:  
11 So did you initial the  
12 things you're supposed to initial?  
13 MR. JAMISON:  
14 Do what?  
15 MS. COHEN:  
16 Did you initial things?  
17 And I understand there is things  
18 throughout the section that ---?  
19 MR. JAMISON:  
20 Oh, yeah, I initialed  
21 them. My name is all over that  
22 section.  
23 MS. COHEN:  
24 Where is your report? Is  
25 that something you guys turned over?

Page 259

1 MR. HATFIELD:  
2 There is a lot of  
3 reverberation on your mic. He's having  
4 a little trouble understanding your  
5 words. Where was your report?  
6 MR. JAMISON:  
7 It's in the fire boss  
8 book.  
9 MR. HATFIELD:  
10 You entered it?  
11 MR. JAMISON:  
12 Yeah, it's in the fire  
13 boss book.  
14 MS. COHEN:  
15 Okay. The 25 minutes it  
16 took you to fire boss the face, did  
17 that include getting in and out of the  
18 mine from outside of the face?  
19 MR. JAMISON:  
20 No, that's not from  
21 outside.  
22 MS. COHEN:  
23 So you actually spent the  
24 25 minutes on the section?  
25 MR. JAMISON:

Page 260

1 Just on the section.  
2 MS. COHEN:  
3 Can you describe to me  
4 what you mean by it looked good?  
5 MR. JAMISON:  
6 Well, if it's scooped and  
7 dusted and all the curtains were hung.  
8 MS. COHEN:  
9 And at one point in your  
10 transcript, you stated that we came  
11 out. Who were you referring to? Did  
12 Terry come out with you?  
13 MR. JAMISON:  
14 No. I didn't say we came  
15 out. I came out.  
16 MS. COHEN:  
17 In the transcript it says  
18 we came out.  
19 MR. JAMISON:  
20 Well, I was the only one  
21 that came out.  
22 MS. COHEN:  
23 Why didn't you keep your  
24 notes on you? You said you had to ---  
25 you changed clothes. But why didn't

Page 261

1 you just keep your notes with you?  
2 MR. JAMISON:  
3 I always leave them in my  
4 shirt. I couldn't get in my locker,  
5 because they had tables set up there  
6 for the guys when they brought them  
7 out. At that time, they was planning  
8 the rescue. So we just laid our  
9 clothes down. I mean, it's nothing out  
10 of the ordinary.  
11 MS. COHEN:  
12 When was the last day  
13 that you worked prior to January 2nd?  
14 MR. JAMISON:  
15 I couldn't tell you. I  
16 was off on --- I really don't know. I  
17 had three or four days off before.  
18 MS. COHEN:  
19 You mentioned talking to  
20 Runyon, and I --- on page 45 of your  
21 transcript. When and where was this?  
22 Was this after you come out of the  
23 mine?  
24 MR. JAMISON:  
25 Yeah.

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 2 I have a question for Mr.  
 3 Kitts. Why were some of the blocks,  
 4 the Omega blocks that were used in the  
 5 seal, according to James Scott's  
 6 testimony, why were they green? Why  
 7 were they ---?  
 8 MR. KITTS:  
 9 I'm sorry? Why were they  
 10 what?  
 11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 12 Why were the blocks, the  
 13 Omega blocks, that were used in the  
 14 seals --- according to the testimony of  
 15 James Scott, he reported that he had  
 16 placed green blocks in the seal?  
 17 MR. KITTS:  
 18 I don't know the answer  
 19 to that. I had no firsthand  
 20 involvement in the construction of  
 21 those seals. But if Jeff Toler has any  
 22 knowledge, I could pass it to him. I  
 23 don't know.  
 24 MR. J.TOLER:  
 25 I can only assume that

1 what Mr. Scott is saying when he uses  
 2 the term green at this point, is they  
 3 are new.  
 4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 5 Are the Omega blocks  
 6 anything like concrete? You know how  
 7 when concrete cures, it shrinks and it  
 8 expands? Do they --- since you're the  
 9 expert on the Omega blocks, because you  
 10 had used them in other mines --- you  
 11 and Joe Myers, I believe, had previous  
 12 experience with that?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 Yes, ma'am.  
 15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 In your opinion, can you  
 17 give me ---?  
 18 MR. J.TOLER:  
 19 I'm not aware of any  
 20 instance where a block would, say,  
 21 shrink when it cures, if that's what  
 22 you're asking. I don't ---.  
 23 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 24 Well, I mean, in Mr.  
 25 Scott's testimony, he said that he used

1 green blocks. They were heavier and  
 2 they were easier to cut.  
 3 MR. J.TOLER:  
 4 Again, as I say, when  
 5 he's referring to green, he's --- they  
 6 are relatively new. Why they're easier  
 7 --- why he says they're easier to cut,  
 8 I don't know.  
 9 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 10 This is another question  
 11 for Mr. Toler. You and Dick Wilfong  
 12 and Vern Hofer and Al Schoonover made  
 13 it to the Two Left switch?  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 We made it to --- at that  
 16 point in time, it was me, Dick Wilfong  
 17 and Al Schoonover. Vernon and Owen had  
 18 headed outby to assess if we had any  
 19 damage up there, but the three of us  
 20 made it to 57, between 57 and 58 block.  
 21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 22 And how far is that from  
 23 the Two Left switch?  
 24 MR. J.TOLER:  
 25 That is parallel to the

1 Two Left switch, ---  
 2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 3 Okay.  
 4 MR. J.TOLER:  
 5 --- 60 feet away.  
 6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 7 Do you --- do you feel  
 8 that the mine rescue could have started  
 9 there since you and the other men  
 10 safely got in there without --- or let  
 11 me put it this way, were you under  
 12 apparatus?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 No, ma'am. I was air  
 15 based. We actually never felt that we  
 16 were in an environment that would  
 17 require apparatus. To answer your  
 18 question, I can only --- I can only  
 19 speculate, as this is my first  
 20 go-around with any incident like this.  
 21 Not knowing what mine rescue --- if  
 22 there is a mine rescue protocol in an  
 23 instance like this, in my mind, yes,  
 24 they could have, but I'm not --- I've  
 25 never been involved in any kind of

1 rescue effort, so I don't know.  
 2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 3 Is it possible that you  
 4 can show me where you got to up there?  
 5 I mean, is that possible or not?  
 6 MR. J.TOLER:  
 7 I think they're putting a  
 8 pointer right there now. If you can  
 9 see the mouth?  
 10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 11 Uh-huh (yes). Right here  
 12 on the map?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 Yeah.  
 15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 Okay.  
 17 MR. J.TOLER:  
 18 Right there, yeah.  
 19 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 20 All of you got right  
 21 there, you still had pretty good air?  
 22 MR. J.TOLER:  
 23 Yes, ma'am.  
 24 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 25 And you were not under

1 apparatus?  
 2 MR. J.TOLER:  
 3 Yes, ma'am.  
 4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 5 And that is approximately  
 6 how many feet from where the miners  
 7 were found?  
 8 MR. J.TOLER:  
 9 Roughly about 2,000 feet.  
 10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 11 2,000 feet? Mr. Toler,  
 12 when you found out --- found that there  
 13 were stoppings out, why did you decide  
 14 not to call MSHA once you found those  
 15 stoppings were out?  
 16 MR. J.TOLER:  
 17 When I found the  
 18 stoppings were out, I had had my  
 19 conversation with Johnny Stemple.  
 20 Johnny's more than capable of notifying  
 21 the authorities. I felt my efforts  
 22 would be better served doing what I was  
 23 doing, which was making an effort to  
 24 --- a rescue effort.  
 25 MS. CAMPBELL:

1 What were the violations  
 2 that Mr. Helms reported on his fire  
 3 boss ---?  
 4 MR. J.TOLER:  
 5 I'm sorry, ma'am. I'm  
 6 not aware of what they were. They are  
 7 --- those records have been turned over  
 8 though.  
 9 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 10 Does anyone on the Panel  
 11 know what Mr. Helms called out on his  
 12 fire boss report?  
 13 MR. HATFIELD:  
 14 It's my understanding  
 15 that the fire boss books are in the  
 16 possession of Mine Safety & Health  
 17 Administration, so I don't think we  
 18 have them to use as a reference.  
 19 MS. COHEN:  
 20 But you didn't review  
 21 them before you turned them over?  
 22 MR. HATFIELD:  
 23 Pardon?  
 24 MS. COHEN:  
 25 You guys didn't review

1 your fire boss reports before turning  
 2 the books over?  
 3 MR. HATFIELD:  
 4 Again, I don't ---  
 5 perhaps the MSHA people could speak to  
 6 that. I don't know.  
 7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 8 I would think that you  
 9 have a copy. Normally when we take  
 10 those books, there's copies made and  
 11 you keep a copy on hand.  
 12 MR. HATFIELD:  
 13 Sam, do we have a copy?  
 14 I don't know anything about that.  
 15 MR. KITTS:  
 16 Yes, I do think we have a  
 17 copy, but we don't have it up here with  
 18 us. We can get you an answer to that  
 19 question.  
 20 MR. HATFIELD:  
 21 Apparently, we do have a  
 22 copy and we'll get you a response on  
 23 that. We just don't have it at this  
 24 time.  
 25 MS. CAMPBELL:

Page 270

1 Mr. Toler, I guess this  
2 is your day for me, so I'm still with  
3 you. Since you had the responsibility  
4 of the seal plan, of showing the men  
5 how to build the seals, why were the  
6 First, Second and Third seals recessed?  
7 Why not straight across?  
8 MR. J.TOLER:  
9 It was a ventilation  
10 issue. The One, Two and Three seals  
11 were constructed in the places they  
12 were to allow us to sweep a separate  
13 split of air around the seals and thus  
14 take them off of what is our intake or  
15 fresh air split going into the mines.  
16 MS. CAMPBELL:  
17 So would that recessed  
18 area have been an area for gas to  
19 accumulate?  
20 MR. J.TOLER:  
21 No, ma'am. All the seals  
22 were properly ventilated on the outby  
23 side.  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 I have a question then.

Page 271

1 You sent the miners in there and no one  
2 reviewed the fire boss reports before  
3 you sent my dad in that mine, to make  
4 sure it was safe? Is that what you  
5 guys are telling me?  
6 MR. J.TOLER:  
7 Both foremen, Martin  
8 Toler and Owen Jones, reviewed the fire  
9 boss reports before they went  
10 underground.  
11 MS. COHEN:  
12 But you didn't? You were  
13 there?  
14 MR. J.TOLER:  
15 No, ma'am, I did not.  
16 No, ma'am.  
17 MS. COHEN:  
18 As the superintendent,  
19 that's not part of your job to make  
20 sure your mines are safe before you  
21 send workers in?  
22 MR. J.TOLER:  
23 I have people that  
24 examine the mines and tell us that it  
25 is safe.

Page 272

1 MS. COHEN:  
2 Mr. Jamison, I have a  
3 question for you. On page 90 of your  
4 transcript, you said --- you refer to  
5 the seal as a bomb. What did you mean  
6 by that?  
7 MR. JAMISON:  
8 What did you say?  
9 MS. COHEN:  
10 On page 90 of your  
11 transcript, ---  
12 MR. JAMISON:  
13 Uh-huh (yes).  
14 MS. COHEN:  
15 --- you guys were having  
16 a discussion about the seals. You  
17 referred to the seals as a bomb. What  
18 did you mean by that? I'd be glad to  
19 bring a transcript tomorrow.  
20 MR. JAMISON:  
21 The seals?  
22 MS. COHEN:  
23 Uh-huh (yes).  
24 MR. JAMISON:  
25 They are like a bomb.

Page 273

1 MS. COHEN:  
2 Can you elaborate on that  
3 for me, please?  
4 MR. JAMISON:  
5 Well, I mean, that's what  
6 they built --- the way they're built.  
7 They hold gas, but that don't mean  
8 they're going to explode.  
9 MS. CAMPBELL:  
10 Mr. Hatfield, could you  
11 bring those documents or those copies  
12 tomorrow with you that we ---  
13 MR. HATFIELD:  
14 Copies of the ---?  
15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
16 --- previously talked  
17 about before?  
18 MR. HATFIELD:  
19 You're talking about the  
20 fire boss ---?  
21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
22 The fire boss, yes.  
23 MR. HATFIELD:  
24 If we have a copy, I  
25 don't have a problem sharing that. I

1 didn't know we had a copy, but if we  
 2 do, I will bring it tomorrow.  
 3 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 4 Mr. Toler, how far were  
 5 you from Mr. Helms when you stopped?  
 6 MR. J.TOLER:  
 7 Probably about 50 to 60  
 8 feet away.  
 9 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 10 Fifty (50) feet?  
 11 MR. J.TOLER:  
 12 Sixty (60), 60 feet away.  
 13 I had no idea he was there.  
 14 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 15 This question's for Mr.  
 16 Crumrine. John Boni testified that he  
 17 detected methane in the area of the  
 18 seals on Wednesday before the  
 19 explosion, and that he reported that  
 20 finding to you. Was that the first  
 21 time methane had been detected in the  
 22 area after the seals had been  
 23 completed?  
 24 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 25 Yes, it was. And the

1 methane content was two-tenths of one  
 2 percent, which is well within the  
 3 allowable range.  
 4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 5 When did John Boni make  
 6 that report to you?  
 7 MR. J.TOLER:  
 8 He called me and told me  
 9 Wednesday evening.  
 10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 11 Were there any records  
 12 made of his findings? Is there ---?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 Yeah. He would have put  
 15 it in the fire boss book.  
 16 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 17 Were those records  
 18 provided to MSHA and the State?  
 19 MR. J.TOLER:  
 20 Yeah. They locked up the  
 21 records that day and then they took the  
 22 records on Friday, I believe it was.  
 23 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 24 You also testified in  
 25 your interview that you also found

1 methane in an area of the seals the  
 2 following day, the Thursday before the  
 3 explosion?  
 4 MR. J.TOLER:  
 5 Yes, ma'am. Since he had  
 6 reported this and it was the first time  
 7 we had received any report of any  
 8 methane around the seals at all, I  
 9 walked the intake escapeway all the way  
 10 into the Two Left section. And on my  
 11 way in, I went by the seals and checked  
 12 the seals. And I also had two-tenths,  
 13 but it was not --- you know, it was  
 14 well within acceptable levels and ---  
 15 it was within acceptable levels.  
 16 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 17 Did you check --- you  
 18 checked all the seals?  
 19 MR. J.TOLER:  
 20 Yes, I did.  
 21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 22 Did you report that to  
 23 anyone?  
 24 MR. J.TOLER:  
 25 Well, I told Jeff, I

1 believe, when I come out that I just  
 2 had two-tenths there. You're required  
 3 to --- you're required by the State to  
 4 check those weekly.  
 5 MS. COHEN:  
 6 Why, when you all found  
 7 out that the miners were really  
 8 deceased, why did you wait so long to  
 9 tell us and why was the rescue workers  
 10 debriefed before the families?  
 11 MR. HATFIELD:  
 12 As I noted in my written  
 13 statement, we did not know which  
 14 information to believe. We had  
 15 conflicting information, two different  
 16 reports 45 minutes apart. And we  
 17 continued to believe that there was a  
 18 strong possibility that the 11 miners  
 19 were in a comatose state and may not be  
 20 dead.  
 21 MS. COHEN:  
 22 What was done to monitor  
 23 the methane through the weekend, from  
 24 Thursday to Monday? Was there any  
 25 crews working?

1 MR. J.TOLER:  
 2 There were --- we  
 3 produced coal on the Friday. We did  
 4 not produce coal on Saturday or Sunday.  
 5 But my recollection is, I had men  
 6 working --- I think I had men working  
 7 both days, Saturday and Sunday.  
 8 MS. COHEN:  
 9 Okay. Because in your  
 10 testimony, Mr. Toler, you said that you  
 11 usually started your shift outby  
 12 reviewing timesheets and you think you  
 13 had men working over the weekend. Were  
 14 their timesheets on your desk from the  
 15 weekend crew?  
 16 MR. J.TOLER:  
 17 Yes, ma'am.  
 18 MS. CAMPBELL  
 19 Mr. Stemple, I have a  
 20 question for you. Did you ever submit  
 21 a plan to store any rescuers  
 22 underground?  
 23 MR. STEMPLER:  
 24 I did not submit ---.  
 25 MS. CAMPBELL:

1 At Spruce. I'm sorry.  
 2 MR. STEMPLER:  
 3 I did not submit a plan.  
 4 I discussed it.  
 5 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 6 So you did not submit it,  
 7 you suggested it?  
 8 MR. STEMPLER:  
 9 I discussed it in  
 10 meetings with MSHA representatives.  
 11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 12 And what kind --- what  
 13 are they storing now underground? Are  
 14 they storing those rescuers underground  
 15 now?  
 16 MR. STEMPLER:  
 17 At the time I had those  
 18 meetings with MSHA, a person-wearable  
 19 self-contained self rescuer was not  
 20 allowed to be stored underground.  
 21 There was no provisions, a person-  
 22 wearable self-contained self-rescuer to  
 23 be stored underground. At that time,  
 24 the technology was new and MSHA would  
 25 not allow cached plans in seam heights

1 of over 48 inches. So I could not get  
 2 a storage plan so I didn't waste my  
 3 time typing it up after the meeting.  
 4 And then --- that was in 1997. And  
 5 then in the year 2002, I had a  
 6 discussion again with an MSHA  
 7 representative and asked again to store  
 8 person wearable self-contained  
 9 self-rescuers underground and was told  
 10 that I was wasting my time.  
 11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 12 Mr. Toler, when the CO  
 13 monitor showed 26 parts per million at  
 14 6:10 a.m. on January 2nd, what was ICG  
 15 required to do pursuant to the Mine Act  
 16 and regulations? Or whoever's in  
 17 charge of that.  
 18 MR. COLEMAN:  
 19 Ty Coleman. I'm the  
 20 Manager of Safety.  
 21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 22 I'm sorry, I can't hear  
 23 --- I can't hear you.  
 24 MR. COLEMAN:  
 25 Ty Coleman, Manager of

1 Safety, ICG West Virginia and Maryland.  
 2 Pursuant to our program of instruction,  
 3 2,600 parts per million, you would  
 4 --- that is an alert symbol and you  
 5 verify the alert and initiate an  
 6 evacuation once you've verified it.  
 7 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 8 I'm back to you now, Mr.  
 9 Crumrine again. So you detected  
 10 methane at the seals. And I believe  
 11 you testified in your interview that  
 12 you felt that methane was coming from  
 13 the sealed area; correct?  
 14 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 15 That would be my guess,  
 16 that would be where it was ---.  
 17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 18 Did you check the seals  
 19 on Thursday?  
 20 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 21 Excuse me?  
 22 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 23 Did you check those seals  
 24 on Thursday?  
 25 MR. CRUMRINE:

1 Yes, it was Thursday I  
 2 checked those seals.  
 3 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 4 You checked them on  
 5 Thursday?  
 6 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 7 Yes.  
 8 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 9 Okay. And did you check  
 10 them on Friday?  
 11 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 12 No, ma'am. I'm only ---  
 13 I don't --- I wouldn't even had to have  
 14 checked them on Thursday. We're  
 15 required to check the seals once a  
 16 week. That is a weekly check made by  
 17 John Boni. However, I did go in and I  
 18 checked the seals on Thursday, because  
 19 I wanted to make sure, number one, that  
 20 John's meter wasn't off. And number  
 21 two, that there wasn't anything  
 22 breached around the seal. And I, you  
 23 know, examined the seals and didn't  
 24 find anything, you know, a crack in the  
 25 --- the roof or anything like that.

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 2 So the last time the  
 3 seals were checked would have been on  
 4 Thursday? So they would not have been  
 5 checked Friday, Saturday or Sunday, ---  
 6 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 7 No, ma'am, they would  
 8 not.  
 9 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 10 --- by anyone, other than  
 11 yourself?  
 12 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 13 No, ma'am, they wouldn't  
 14 have been.  
 15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 And I'm not sure who gets  
 17 this question, but I'll just put it out  
 18 there and somebody take it, whoever's  
 19 responsible for it. Have all the  
 20 electrical inspection records been  
 21 produced to MSHA and the State?  
 22 MR. STEMPLE:  
 23 The records that they've  
 24 asked for have been produced, yes.  
 25 MS. CAMPBELL:

1 Just the ones they've  
 2 asked for, not all of them?  
 3 MR. STEMPLE:  
 4 That is correct. The  
 5 ones they've asked for have been  
 6 produced.  
 7 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 8 We're back on the CO  
 9 monitoring, so it's probably going to  
 10 be you, Mr. Toler. Was it appropriate  
 11 for the company to use the CO monitor  
 12 system as a paging system for the  
 13 miners? Do you know what I'm talking  
 14 about?  
 15 MR. J.TOLER:  
 16 I think I know what  
 17 you're talking about, but personally  
 18 I'm not aware that it was being done.  
 19 It's possible that it was being done,  
 20 but I'm not aware of it.  
 21 MR. KITTS:  
 22 Let me follow-up to that.  
 23 There was reporting in the testimony  
 24 that that was a past practice. And,  
 25 no, we do not feel that is an

1 appropriate use of the CO monitor  
 2 system. And subsequently ICG performed  
 3 a daylong dispatcher training session  
 4 with all of our dispatchers to make  
 5 sure that that didn't happen again.  
 6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 7 I was just going to get  
 8 to Mr. Chisolm's testimony, that there  
 9 was no way for miners inside the mine  
 10 to tell the difference between a real  
 11 alarm and an alarm sounded to notify  
 12 miners of a call, such as an example  
 13 Mr. Chisolm gave about someone's mother  
 14 calling that they used the CO  
 15 monitoring system to alert the miners  
 16 in the mine.  
 17 MR. KITTS:  
 18 Yes. And we do not  
 19 condone that practice. I'll say it  
 20 again. And in order to address the  
 21 problem, the mine phones were changed  
 22 out so that there is a visual signal on  
 23 the mine phone now that would serve the  
 24 same purpose as they were improvising  
 25 with, with the CO monitoring system.



1 So we think we have it corrected now.  
 2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 3 What was happening at  
 4 6:10 a.m. when the CO alarm went off at  
 5 26 parts per million, Mr. ---?  
 6 MR. KITTS:  
 7 Let me speak to that,  
 8 Jeff.  
 9 MR. J.TOLER:  
 10 Go ahead, Sam.  
 11 MR. KITTS:  
 12 You're referring to the  
 13 article in the paper and the testimony.  
 14 The mine --- let me be clear, first of  
 15 all, that when a CO monitor alarms, it  
 16 is not required to evacuate the mine.  
 17 The procedure is that someone goes to  
 18 the next outby location of a CO sensor  
 19 and checks it. Then they advance up to  
 20 where the faulty alarm is with a gas  
 21 tester and they do a gas check. If  
 22 there's no problem, in other words, if  
 23 there's no fire or anything --- any  
 24 other problem, they are required by  
 25 procedure to stay there and monitor the

1 situation until an electrician can come  
 2 repair the sensor.  
 3 Contrary to what was  
 4 reported in the press, what happened  
 5 Monday morning was the dispatcher saw  
 6 an error flag on the computer, a  
 7 malfunction flag, that then went to CO  
 8 alarm. He did what he was supposed to  
 9 do. He notified the electrician on the  
 10 One Left crew that there was a sensor  
 11 showing a fault. So then when the One  
 12 Left crew went inside, the electrician  
 13 obviously never made it up there to the  
 14 section on that day due to the  
 15 explosion.  
 16 But what was reported in  
 17 the press is not correct. The  
 18 dispatcher did what he was supposed to  
 19 do. He notified a maintenance person  
 20 who was then able to go up and check  
 21 the sensor before they would have  
 22 advanced onto the section. So again,  
 23 every time you get a fault on a CO  
 24 monitor, it's not necessary to evacuate  
 25 the entire mine.

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 2 Where were those CO  
 3 sensors located?  
 4 MR. KITTS:  
 5 The particular one that  
 6 faulted --- Chuck, if you'll point it  
 7 out, was at the tailpiece of Number One  
 8 Left. So it was all the way up in the  
 9 face. There would have been, I  
 10 believe, three additional sensors  
 11 between that point and the mouth of  
 12 that section. So that was completely  
 13 removed from the area of the seals.  
 14 Back to that detail.  
 15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 Who would have been in by  
 17 the sensor at 6:10 a.m.?  
 18 MR. KITTS:  
 19 No one.  
 20 MR. J.TOLER:  
 21 No one at that time.  
 22 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 23 No one? So if I  
 24 understood you correctly, when a CO  
 25 monitor goes off, a miner has to go

1 check to make sure that it is working  
 2 properly, that there's not a fire or  
 3 not --- did I understand that  
 4 correctly?  
 5 MR. KITTS:  
 6 Yes.  
 7 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 8 Okay. So when a mother  
 9 or somebody calls you in and somebody  
 10 sets the CO monitor off, a miner still  
 11 has to go check that CO monitor;  
 12 correct?  
 13 MR. KITTS:  
 14 Yes.  
 15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 Why did the dispatcher  
 17 keep turning the CO monitor off?  
 18 MR. KITTS:  
 19 Because it was showing a  
 20 fault. It was showing a malfunction.  
 21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 22 Well, obviously it wasn't  
 23 malfunctioning. There was an explosion  
 24 in the mine.  
 25 MR. KITTS:

Page 290

1 The explosion hadn't  
2 occurred at this time.  
3 MS. CAMPBELL:  
4 Well, it was about to  
5 occur because it was telling you that  
6 something was wrong in the mine;  
7 correct?  
8 MR. KITTS:  
9 The other sensors were  
10 not showing any kind of an alarm at  
11 this point. This is 6:10. In rough  
12 time, we're talking 20 minutes until  
13 the explosion occurred. So as he was  
14 going through his checks, he had one  
15 sensor malfunctioning. All the other  
16 ones were good.  
17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
18 Well, how did he know  
19 that it was a malfunction?  
20 MR. KITTS:  
21 He testified that the  
22 sensor on his computer screen would  
23 flash malfunction and then go to alarm.  
24 Just for a second, it would flash  
25 malfunction and then it would show an

Page 291

1 alarm, which is the typical response  
2 that you get through the computer  
3 system when you have a sensor that's  
4 gone bad.  
5 MR. STEMPLE:  
6 Can I clarify something  
7 on that? The CO monitor system is  
8 never turned off. It's not turned off.  
9 What the dispatcher will do is on his  
10 keyboard is he'll push a button so that  
11 it doesn't alarm right there in his  
12 face, as far as the siren going off.  
13 It's very shrill, very loud siren so  
14 that it gets his attention. He never  
15 turns that off. Whenever he would use  
16 that system to get ahold of the  
17 section, it's called a visual and  
18 audible alarm system. It's a very loud  
19 siren and it's a set of strobe lights  
20 that flash off and on at the same time.  
21 That way if there's someone in the  
22 area, they will hear it and they will  
23 come to it. It is never turned off,  
24 it's still activating. It's still  
25 checking for carbon monoxide 16 times a

Page 292

1 second, which is considered a  
2 continuous check for carbon monoxide.  
3 This system is the best  
4 on the market. It's like your cell  
5 phone. At times you gain signal, at  
6 times you lose signal. This particular  
7 sensor lost signal. He silenced the  
8 alarm so he didn't have to listen to  
9 the alarm. It showed malfunction and  
10 then it cleared itself. He still went  
11 ahead and notified the crew, when you  
12 get up there, check that sensor just to  
13 make sure that everything is okay.  
14 The belt line for that  
15 section had not been operating, I'm  
16 going to say, for probably two days.  
17 So there was no --- there was nothing  
18 there that could have caused a fire,  
19 nothing there that could have caused  
20 any heat. That was the section belt,  
21 which was turned off at the section  
22 tailpiece. So there was nothing there  
23 to show or signal any type of an alarm  
24 or anything that would make you want to  
25 investigate really any further.

Page 293

1 However, he did go ahead  
2 and notify the crew, when they got up  
3 there, to go ahead and check that  
4 sensor to make sure everything was  
5 okay. Have the electrician open the  
6 box, check the fuses. Sometimes a fuse  
7 will be loose, it causes a sensor to  
8 loose signal for just a split second.  
9 And if that sensor loses the signal  
10 for a split second, it goes into  
11 malfunction mode. He silenced it,  
12 cleared the alarm and it was back to  
13 zero. That let's you know that  
14 everything is okay.  
15 The other sensors that's  
16 in line with that sensor outby with the  
17 way the air flows, had there been a  
18 true problem, those other sensors would  
19 have alerted and would have picked up  
20 the CO as well. And by having  
21 experience with the system, the  
22 dispatcher learns that. Anytime  
23 they're doing any welding or cutting in  
24 the mine, they will call him prior to  
25 doing any welding or cutting, and say,

1 we're at the One Left tailpiece, we're  
 2 going to cut some flights out of the  
 3 feeder. That way when it goes off,  
 4 when the alarm --- I'm saying goes off,  
 5 it doesn't turn off. When the alarm  
 6 alarms and signals, he knows what's  
 7 going on in that area, because they've  
 8 alerted him. And then you can  
 9 physically watch the CO levels on the  
 10 other sensors outby raised. And when  
 11 they call out that they're done, you  
 12 can watch them fall. So that he  
 13 doesn't have to sit there and listen to  
 14 that system alarm and that siren alarm  
 15 in his ear, he goes ahead and pushes  
 16 the silencer button.

17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 18 So do you guys have a lot  
 19 of faulty CO alarms?

20 MR. STEMPLE:  
 21 It happens, yes.

22 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 23 A lot?

24 MR. STEMPLE:  
 25 It happens.

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 2 A lot?  
 3 MR. STEMPLE:  
 4 I don't know what a lot  
 5 is, but it happens.  
 6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 7 Maybe you should look  
 8 into your CO alarm system and maybe it  
 9 needs replaced or something. And Mr.  
 10 Stemple, what kind of rescuers did you  
 11 say that you were storing underground  
 12 now?

13 MR. STEMPLE:  
 14 We wear a person-wearable  
 15 self-contained self-rescuer. Right now  
 16 we're storing those rescuers  
 17 underground.

18 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 19 The same ones that ---

20 MR. STEMPLE:  
 21 Yes.

22 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 23 --- these men ---

24 MR. STEMPLE:  
 25 --- relied on to save

1 their lives?

2 MR. STEMPLE:

3 Yes, ma'am.

4 MS. CAMPBELL:

5 So you haven't upgraded  
 6 to maybe a three-hour or a four-hour  
 7 supply? It's still the same one that  
 8 malfunctioned, according to Randal  
 9 McCloy? Four of them did not work.

10 MR. STEMPLE:

11 If there's a three-hour  
 12 or a four-hour that's available, I'm  
 13 not aware of it, ma'am.

14 MS. CAMPBELL:

15 Well, I mean, this is the  
 16 21st Century, I'm sure somebody can  
 17 make one. Randal McCloy, in the family  
 18 letter, stated that one-third of the  
 19 rescuers did not work.

20 MR. STEMPLE:

21 Yes, I read that also.

22 MS. CAMPBELL:

23 And how do you --- what  
 24 do you feel about that? Would you want  
 25 to rely on one of those rescuers if you

1 were underground?

2 MR. STEMPLE:

3 The rescuers will provide  
 4 oxygen at a certain rate. And you can  
 5 overbreathe those rescuers. You can  
 6 breathe faster than they can provide  
 7 oxygen. If you're in a mode where  
 8 you're moving very fastly, very  
 9 quickly, you can overbreathe those  
 10 units. You have to slow your breathing  
 11 rate down or slow your pace down to  
 12 allow those units to produce oxygen at  
 13 --- or to allow your body to take in  
 14 the oxygen as fast as a unit is  
 15 producing the oxygen. It's not a unit  
 16 that provides pressure, so when you  
 17 activate the unit, there's not oxygen  
 18 coming out of it. You have to breathe  
 19 into it and breathe out of it, or suck  
 20 out of it, to get oxygen. And you can  
 21 outbreathe those units.

22 MS. CAMPBELL:

23 So in your opinion, are  
 24 you --- or not in your opinion, but are  
 25 you trying to tell me that 100 years of

1 experience amongst these miners, that  
 2 they didn't know how to use those  
 3 rescuers?  
 4 MR. STEMPLE:  
 5 They knew how to use  
 6 those rescuers, ma'am. Yes, they did.  
 7 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 8 So Randal McCloy has  
 9 nothing to gain by telling us that  
 10 one-third of those rescuers didn't work  
 11 underground and that they had to share  
 12 while they were beating their brains  
 13 out on the bolts and trying to get  
 14 somebody on the surface to listen ---  
 15 to hear them, to put up flags, so that  
 16 they would know that somebody was  
 17 looking for them. I mean, does anybody  
 18 have an opinion on that, other than  
 19 myself? Because I think that's not  
 20 very ---.  
 21 MR. HATFIELD:  
 22 I can share an opinion.  
 23 Again, the truth is we don't know the  
 24 answer. I think all of us at this  
 25 table believe that Randy McCloy has

1 described accurately what he believes  
 2 to have happened. We don't know the  
 3 rest of the story. But Johnny was  
 4 simply describing to you what is  
 5 sometimes a common problem, even with  
 6 experienced miners. In a traumatic  
 7 emotional situation, sometimes people  
 8 overbreathe, and that's just what he  
 9 was describing as something that  
 10 sometimes makes people think that it's  
 11 not working.  
 12 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 13 Well, Mr. Hatfield, this  
 14 is the 21st Century, and you should not  
 15 have to worry about whether you're  
 16 breathing too hard, too slow, too fast  
 17 or whatever you're doing. You should  
 18 have a rescuer that you push a button  
 19 and it gives you air if you're trapped  
 20 in a coal mine.  
 21 MR. HATFIELD:  
 22 I would be the first to  
 23 agree with you that we can do better,  
 24 the industry can do better. That  
 25 technology hasn't advanced in over a

1 decade, and I fully believe that as a  
 2 result of what we've learned in this  
 3 tragic accident that it will improve.  
 4 MS. COHEN:  
 5 Some of the SCRSs have  
 6 been recalled for defects. Are you  
 7 guys aware of that?  
 8 MR. HATFIELD:  
 9 I don't think we have any  
 10 information on that that pertains to  
 11 the units we've received.  
 12 MS. COHEN:  
 13 Mr. Kitts, I read your  
 14 testimony, or your transcript, I should  
 15 say. Do you think the seals failed?  
 16 MR. KITTS:  
 17 Do I think the seals  
 18 what?  
 19 MS. COHEN:  
 20 Failed.  
 21 MR. KITTS:  
 22 Failed?  
 23 MS. COHEN:  
 24 Uh-huh (yes).  
 25 MR. KITTS:

1 Well clearly, the seals  
 2 failed in the sense that they're  
 3 demolished. The question is, for this  
 4 investigation, we have to determine  
 5 what forces were applied to those  
 6 seals.  
 7 MS. COHEN:  
 8 Okay. And then in your  
 9 transcript, you said your perspective  
 10 that time went by very quickly when the  
 11 miscommunication happened and it was  
 12 corrected. Was that quickly for you?  
 13 Because when I was sitting there  
 14 waiting to hear whether my dad was dead  
 15 or alive, it wasn't quickly for me.  
 16 MR. KITTS:  
 17 That was from my personal  
 18 perspective, yes.  
 19 MS. COHEN:  
 20 What is the model number  
 21 and serial numbers and the manufacture  
 22 dates of the self-rescuers that you  
 23 guys currently have? Do you know or  
 24 can you provide that to us?  
 25 MR. KITTS:

1 I think Johnny could  
 2 describe the model number. I don't  
 3 think we have the serial number  
 4 information. Could you describe it,  
 5 Johnny?  
 6 MR. STEMPLE:  
 7 The model is the CSCSR  
 8 100. And each individual unit has its  
 9 own serial number, and we have over 300  
 10 of them at the mine.  
 11 MS. COHEN:  
 12 Okay. Mr. Toler, in your  
 13 transcript, you were talking about  
 14 walkie-talkies that the miner operators  
 15 carry. Well, my dad was the miner  
 16 operator for Two Left. Did he have a  
 17 walkie-talkie and did you guys ever try  
 18 to contact them on that walkie-talkie?  
 19 MR. J.TOLER:  
 20 To the best of my  
 21 knowledge, there would have been five  
 22 of those units with that crew. The  
 23 range is probably limited to 300 to 500  
 24 feet. Sadly, I did not even --- I  
 25 didn't even think to take a radio with

1 me. I'm not sure that --- I have no  
 2 reason to believe that given the  
 3 distance we were apart, that we would  
 4 have communicated. But it's another  
 5 part of my nightmare that I didn't have  
 6 it to try. I apologize to you for  
 7 that.  
 8 MS. COHEN:  
 9 But you ---.  
 10 MR. HATFIELD:  
 11 I believe it's true,  
 12 though, that Owie Jones tried  
 13 repeatedly on his walkie-talkie to  
 14 reach the crew.  
 15 MR. J.TOLER:  
 16 That was --- yeah, that  
 17 was when we were farther outby, yes.  
 18 MS. COHEN:  
 19 Mr. Jamison, what time  
 20 did you come out and find your fire  
 21 boss book?  
 22 MR. JAMISON:  
 23 Probably around 5:30.  
 24 MS. COHEN:  
 25 And you said you --- when

1 you came out, it was chaotic and you  
 2 came in contact with rescue workers.  
 3 The accident hadn't happened yet.  
 4 MR. JAMISON:  
 5 No.  
 6 MR. HATFIELD:  
 7 I think he's describing  
 8 that he went out and then went back in.  
 9 Do you want to explain that better?  
 10 MR. JAMISON:  
 11 I really couldn't hardly  
 12 understand. What did she say?  
 13 MR. HATFIELD:  
 14 She was asking what time  
 15 you came out?  
 16 MR. JAMISON:  
 17 Oh, it was around 5:30,  
 18 and then I went back in.  
 19 MR. HATFIELD:  
 20 That's the point that she  
 21 was missing.  
 22 MR. JAMISON:  
 23 Yeah, I went back in at  
 24 six o'clock.  
 25 MS. COHEN:

1 Okay. And then you came  
 2 back out when? After six o'clock when  
 3 you re-entered --- I mean, when you  
 4 re-entered, what time did you come back  
 5 out for the second time?  
 6 MR. JAMISON:  
 7 Well, it was probably  
 8 about 7:30. It was after it blowed.  
 9 MS. COHEN:  
 10 Where did you meet Mr.  
 11 Toler and them coming into the mines?  
 12 MR. JAMISON:  
 13 They was coming in the  
 14 track.  
 15 MS. COHEN:  
 16 How far out were you?  
 17 MR. J.TOLER:  
 18 Fred --- I encountered  
 19 Fred, he was probably just two or three  
 20 breaks underground in a --- doing a  
 21 mental timeline, if the explosion  
 22 happened at 6:30, I think we were ready  
 23 to go --- we had started underground  
 24 within 10 to 15 minutes after that.  
 25 And it probably wasn't two minutes

1 after we started underground that I  
 2 passed Fred. So Fred's probably  
 3 looking between 7:40 --- 6:45 and ---  
 4 excuse me, 6:50, in that range that I  
 5 passed Fred.  
 6 MS. COHEN:  
 7 What were you doing when  
 8 you were in there prior to ---  
 9 obviously you weren't on Two Left. So  
 10 where were you during this time between  
 11 when you re-entered at six o'clock and  
 12 the explosion?  
 13 MR. JAMISON:  
 14 I was at Two head waiting  
 15 on them to run coal.  
 16 MR. KITTS:  
 17 Just a minute, I'll see  
 18 if I can get you a location.  
 19 MS. COHEN:  
 20 So how did you make it  
 21 out?  
 22 MR. JAMISON:  
 23 Do what?  
 24 MS. COHEN:  
 25 If you were --- how close

1 --- so you're saying you were on Two  
 2 Left waiting for them to run coal or  
 3 One Left?  
 4 MR. JAMISON:  
 5 No, I was just ---.  
 6 MR. KITTS:  
 7 He said Two head. If  
 8 you'll look at the pointer.  
 9 MS. COHEN:  
 10 Okay. I'm sorry.  
 11 MR. KITTS:  
 12 Look at the pointer, it's  
 13 on the map.  
 14 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 15 I'm back to you, Mr.  
 16 Toler.  
 17 MR. J.TOLER:  
 18 Yes, ma'am.  
 19 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 20 Let me find my notes.  
 21 Sorry. In your testimony, you and Joe  
 22 Myers --- do I have that correct?  
 23 MR. J.TOLER:  
 24 Yes, ma'am.  
 25 MS. CAMPBELL:

1 You said you had  
 2 experience at another mine with the  
 3 Omega block seals?  
 4 MR. J.TOLER:  
 5 Yes, ma'am.  
 6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 7 And the plan that Joe  
 8 Myers submitted, I know I kind of hit  
 9 on this before, but I wanted to bring  
 10 it up because I didn't have my notes in  
 11 front of me. Joe Myers submitted a  
 12 plan. Basically, it's a plan you and  
 13 he had used at another mine; is that  
 14 correct? Is that ---?  
 15 MR. J.TOLER:  
 16 Yes, ma'am.  
 17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 18 How does the mine that  
 19 you and Joe worked at before compare to  
 20 Sago Mine conditions? Not all mines  
 21 are alike. How do you know that the  
 22 Omega blocks could withstand the Sago  
 23 conditions?  
 24 MR. J.TOLER:  
 25 Any seal that is approved

1 is approved to withstand --- it's  
 2 approved by MSHA and it's just a matter  
 3 of what type of seal you want to ---  
 4 you know, you want to construct. With  
 5 my experience with the Omega seal in  
 6 the past, I was very comfortable with  
 7 that seal.  
 8 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 9 And you personally have  
 10 constructed Omega block seals?  
 11 MR. J.TOLER:  
 12 Yes, ma'am.  
 13 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 14 Did you ever use green  
 15 blocks?  
 16 MR. J.TOLER:  
 17 Well, going by Mr.  
 18 Scott's definition, if a load of block  
 19 was just delivered today and I took  
 20 them inside and used them today, I  
 21 could probably use that terminology.  
 22 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 23 From what I got from Mr.  
 24 Scott, and this is just my opinion, the  
 25 blocks were wet, they hadn't cured,

Page 310

1 they hadn't set up. That's my opinion  
2 of a green block. What is your opinion  
3 of a green block?  
4 MR. J.TOLER:  
5 My opinion wouldn't be  
6 that it's wet to the effect that it  
7 wouldn't --- that it wasn't set up.  
8 They couldn't deliver this block to us  
9 if it wasn't --- if it hadn't been  
10 cured enough to --- if it hadn't been  
11 cured to use.  
12 MS. CAMPBELL:  
13 So if you got a load of  
14 block that you felt were green blocks,  
15 would you construct them in a seal, or  
16 would you reject those?  
17 MR. J.TOLER:  
18 I have no reason not to  
19 use them.  
20 MR. STEMPLE:  
21 Can I interject here?  
22 Green --- what James Scott's referring  
23 to as a green block is a new block, as  
24 opposed to a used block. A lot of  
25 times stoppings will be knocked down

Page 311

1 and hand-carried or use a wheelbarrow  
2 to carry them up to move them to a  
3 different location, and they're  
4 re-used. That would not be a green  
5 block. That would be a block that had  
6 been previously used or a used block.  
7 The Omega blocks were all constructed  
8 out of brand new blocks, meaning green.  
9 MS. COHEN:  
10 Okay. Talking about the  
11 Omega blocks, Mr. Toler, when did the  
12 construction begin on the seals? And  
13 were the blocks left outside for any  
14 period of time before they were taken  
15 into the mine?  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 As best I can recall, the  
18 blocks were delivered somewhere around  
19 October the 25th or 26th. And the  
20 first load that came was immediately  
21 taken underground. And I think we  
22 started seal construction immediately  
23 after that, within the next day or so.  
24  
25 MS. COHEN:

Page 312

1 So how did you guys  
2 choose the men who constructed these  
3 seals and why were there so many  
4 different people involved in the  
5 construction of these seals?  
6 MR. J.TOLER:  
7 At that time, we had  
8 several projects going on outby in the  
9 mines. And it was just these --- the  
10 men that were available to do this  
11 construction were the men that were  
12 doing it. That's the best answer I can  
13 give you on that, I'm sorry.  
14 MS. COHEN:  
15 Did all the men that were  
16 constructing the seals --- were they  
17 all trained properly on how to do it?  
18 And who did that training? I think at  
19 one point in your transcript, you  
20 weren't sure who did it. Then later  
21 on, I think I read that you said you  
22 thought you did it.  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 I'm sure I reviewed the  
25 construction process to all the

Page 313

1 supervisors that were working on that.  
2 All the supervisors that were working  
3 in that area were provided with a copy  
4 of the seal construction plan as well.  
5 All of them seemed to have a very good  
6 grasp on how they were to be  
7 constructed.  
8 MS. COHEN:  
9 And why did you never  
10 examine the seals? Page 140 of your  
11 transcript, you said that you never  
12 examined the seals.  
13 MR. J.TOLER:  
14 I never examined the  
15 seals after construction was complete,  
16 However, when --- during construction,  
17 if I was underground in the area, I  
18 went by to check on them to see how  
19 they were doing.  
20 MS. COHEN:  
21 Did you check to make  
22 sure that the mesh was removed from  
23 that sealed area, the wire mesh?  
24 MR. J.TOLER:  
25 I didn't actually check

1 every one of them to see if the mesh  
2 was removed, but I did instruct them to  
3 remove the mesh.  
4 MS. COHEN:  
5 So did anybody check  
6 that? Is it documented that the wire  
7 mesh was removed from the seal area?  
8 MR. J.TOLER:  
9 I think John Collins  
10 testified to that a little earlier,  
11 that the mesh had been removed.  
12 MS. COHEN:  
13 On page 131 of your  
14 transcript, you were talking about the  
15 BlocBond, ---  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 Yes, ma'am.  
18 MS. COHEN:  
19 --- BBond. Do you check  
20 each bag or do you just go by the color  
21 of the bag? I understand there are  
22 some in two different color bags.  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 Yes, ma'am. There's a  
25 green bag that is labeled as BBond, and

1 a blue bag labeled as BlocBond. The  
2 seal plan is specific to use the blue  
3 bag, BlocBond.  
4 MS. COHEN:  
5 And you signed the  
6 requisition, if I read your transcript  
7 correctly, when they ordered those?  
8 MR. J.TOLER:  
9 Yes, ma'am.  
10 MS. COHEN:  
11 Do you review what's on  
12 there, so you know what they're  
13 ordering? How did the confusion  
14 happen?  
15 MR. J.TOLER:  
16 The confusion --- I'm not  
17 sure how the confusion happened. I  
18 will sign the requisition. The order  
19 is placed from our purchasing  
20 department. I'm not sure how the  
21 confusion happened, but some --- there  
22 were a few pallets of the green bag  
23 delivered, and we do utilize the green  
24 bag in some places in the mine. It's  
25 okay to use on a stopping.

1 MS. COHEN:  
2 Okay. Also in your  
3 transcript, you said you weren't  
4 familiar with the evacuation procedure  
5 and that you hadn't reviewed the fire  
6 and evacuation plan. Is there a reason  
7 why you hadn't?  
8 MR. J.TOLER:  
9 I had reviewed the plan.  
10 I don't recall --- I just was drawing a  
11 blank recalling details on it. Yes,  
12 ma'am, I ---.  
13 MS. CAMPBELL:  
14 Do you recall them now?  
15 MR. J.TOLER:  
16 Looking right at you, no,  
17 I don't. But ---.  
18 MS. CAMPBELL:  
19 So you're the  
20 superintendent of the mine; correct?  
21 MR. J.TOLER:  
22 Yes, ma'am.  
23 MS. CAMPBELL:  
24 I would think you should  
25 know those, and I suggest that you

1 learn them.  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 Ma'am, I know the  
4 procedures, but I apologize for being  
5 just a little nervous here.  
6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
7 Mr. Hatfield, you said  
8 that technology hadn't advanced in 20  
9 years. I don't really think that's  
10 true. I think it's just become a  
11 little bit more expensive. Do you ---  
12 I mean, you're going to have to put out  
13 some money to update your equipment, so  
14 that this --- these men have better  
15 self-rescuers and that they don't have  
16 to rely on rescuers that are outdated.  
17 MR. HATFIELD:  
18 Yeah. Again, what I was  
19 saying there is that that is the  
20 state-of-the-art in the industry. And  
21 I believe the industry needs to raise  
22 the standard. But the CSC (sic)  
23 rescuers that were used in the  
24 barricade are the same ones that I  
25 carry on my belt, the same ones the



1 State mine inspectors and Federal mine  
 2 inspectors carry on their belt when  
 3 they come to the mine. That is the  
 4 most commonly used self-rescuer in the  
 5 industry. But I continue to believe  
 6 that it can and should be significantly  
 7 improved.  
 8 MS. COHEN:  
 9 Mr. Toler, how often do  
 10 you go underground to check things out?  
 11 Do you make routine trips underground  
 12 every day?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 Not every day, no.  
 15 MS. COHEN:  
 16 So how often do you do  
 17 it?  
 18 MR. J.TOLER:  
 19 It can vary week by week.  
 20 Yeah. On a good week, I'll go under  
 21 three or four times in the week.  
 22 Obviously this week, I won't.  
 23 MS. COHEN:  
 24 And Mr. Jamison, did  
 25 anyone inform you of the gas, the

1 methane gas, that had been leaking  
 2 around the seal before you went to do  
 3 your fire boss? Were you aware that  
 4 they were finding levels of methane  
 5 around the seal?  
 6 MR. JAMISON:  
 7 No.  
 8 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 9 Davitt, I have one more  
 10 question, and this is for Ray McKinney.  
 11 Mr. McKinney, how long does it take to  
 12 fire boss the face of a section --- or  
 13 the section?  
 14 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 15 I think that's depending  
 16 upon the number of faces that you have  
 17 in the section.  
 18 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 19 The section, how long  
 20 would it take Mr. Jamison --- should it  
 21 take Mr. Jamison to fire boss that  
 22 section?  
 23 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 24 Again, it depends upon  
 25 the heighth (sic) of the coal. You're

1 talking about the section in Sago that  
 2 he made there? Me, personally, when I  
 3 used to fire boss coal mines, to fire  
 4 boss a section was about 40, 45  
 5 minutes. That's to make a six-entry  
 6 section, to make all the faces, to  
 7 check my ventilation and get my last  
 8 open crosscut, area.  
 9 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 10 So would that --- 45  
 11 minutes, would that have been an area  
 12 of about how much Mr. Jamison would  
 13 have been fire bossing that day or more  
 14 or less or ---?  
 15 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 16 I don't really know what  
 17 Mr. Jamison did that day. I'm trying  
 18 to give you a ---.  
 19 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 20 We don't either. Sorry.  
 21 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 22 I'm trying to give you an  
 23 answer of personal experience that I  
 24 had when I fire bossed and that's about  
 25 what it was for an average section for

1 me.  
 2 CHAIR:  
 3 If I could ask for a  
 4 break just a moment? We'll take a  
 5 five-minute break, and then come back  
 6 to ask more questions. Thank you.  
 7 SHORT BREAK TAKEN  
 8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
 9 Mr. Chairman, before we  
 10 begin, may I enter two documents into  
 11 the record? We have the pre-shift  
 12 examination report from Mr. Jamison and  
 13 from Mr. Helms. And I'd just like to  
 14 enter those into the record. And also  
 15 note that I have given a copy to the  
 16 Groves family and they are available  
 17 for inspection.  
 18 CHAIR:  
 19 It is my opinion that the  
 20 ICG has also made a copy available for  
 21 --- has made a copy available today.  
 22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
 23 Yeah. As a matter of  
 24 fact, Mr. Chairman, I would just send  
 25 that over to the family members. What

1 I have in front of me are copies of the  
 2 pre-shift mine examiner's report from  
 3 both One Left and Two Left on the  
 4 morning of January 2nd, as well as the  
 5 outby or belt report and the weekly  
 6 examination for the prior week. So  
 7 we'll make those available, all four of  
 8 them, to the family. These are from  
 9 our copies.

10 CHAIR:  
 11 Thank you very much, sir.

12 Now I'd like to ask the legislators  
 13 for questions. We have about one  
 14 microphone, which we'll have to ask  
 15 them to pass around. But let me turn  
 16 to Senator Kessler to open with the  
 17 questions. And since I can't see you  
 18 from here, maybe you fellows can handle  
 19 it.

20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 21 Mr. Chairman, we spent a  
 22 lot of time talking about the amount of  
 23 time required for a fire boss run.  
 24 Could I ask that Fred Jamison be given  
 25 the opportunity to explain what his

1 view of how long it should take? It  
 2 will just take a moment to clarify that  
 3 point.

4 CHAIR:  
 5 Certainly. Mr. Jamison,  
 6 if you'd like to speak to the time it  
 7 takes to make a fire boss. Speak into  
 8 the microphone.

9 MR. JAMISON:  
 10 On that 25 minutes, if  
 11 you don't have a violation, a curtain  
 12 to hang, everything's in good shape, it  
 13 don't take long to run a face.

14 CHAIR:  
 15 Bill Hamilton?

16 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 17 I have one comment.

18 CHAIR:  
 19 You go ahead.

20 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 21 Fred, what about that  
 22 pump that you were messing with in  
 23 there, trying to get it restarted, was  
 24 that included in your ---?

25 MR. JAMISON:

1 That what?

2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 3 The pump that you were  
 4 working with, you said that there was a  
 5 pump down and that you couldn't get it  
 6 to kick on.

7 MR. JAMISON:  
 8 Oh, that wasn't at the  
 9 face. That was out by the face.

10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 11 So you were already on  
 12 your way out by then?

13 MR. JAMISON:  
 14 Yes.

15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 So that wasn't included  
 17 in the 25 minutes?

18 MR. JAMISON:  
 19 No. No.

20 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 21 Thank you.

22 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 23 Mr. Stemple, what was the  
 24 time span between the explosion and the  
 25 initial call to the Upshur County

1 Communication Center?

2 MR. STEMPLE:  
 3 The call that was made to  
 4 the Upshur County Communication Center  
 5 was made at 7:54.

6 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 7 And why was that --- that  
 8 was roughly --- the explosion was 6:30?

9 MR. STEMPLE:  
 10 Yes, sir.

11 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 12 Okay. Why was that time  
 13 an hour and some minutes between the  
 14 initial --- the explosion and the call  
 15 that was made to the com center? Why  
 16 did it take that long?

17 MR. STEMPLE:  
 18 We had no clue that we  
 19 had an explosion at that time.

20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 21 There's been --- I don't  
 22 know if I want to call it substantiated  
 23 information, but the mine was --- my  
 24 knowledge is the mine was shut down for  
 25 four days. You were not producing

1 coal, but you did have some people in  
 2 there working, doing repairs. Is that  
 3 --- I don't know who wants to take  
 4 that, but ---.  
 5 MR. J.TOLER:  
 6 That is not entirely  
 7 correct. We produced coal on Friday.  
 8 We did not produce coal on Saturday and  
 9 Sunday. But there were individuals  
 10 working on Saturday and Sunday.  
 11 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 12 On Saturday and Sunday  
 13 you did have men --- people in the  
 14 mine?  
 15 MR. STEMPLE:  
 16 Yes, sir.  
 17 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 18 On days of inactivity, no  
 19 production, who fire bosses the mine?  
 20 Is it a fire boss or a pump man?  
 21 MR. J.TOLER:  
 22 The guys that are working  
 23 there, there would be a certified  
 24 foreman there that would be required to  
 25 examine the mines. On Saturday, I

1 think I did have fire bosses that  
 2 worked Saturday, and they should have  
 3 been --- there should have been  
 4 somebody there on Sunday fire bossing  
 5 as well.  
 6 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 7 Presently, has the sealed  
 8 area that --- where the explosion  
 9 occurred, has that been resealed?  
 10 MR. J.TOLER:  
 11 No, sir, it has not.  
 12 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 13 How are we liberating  
 14 that methane?  
 15 MR. J.TOLER:  
 16 We are --- currently,  
 17 we're ventilating that panel with fresh  
 18 air.  
 19 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 20 And where is that  
 21 ventilation coming from?  
 22 MR. J.TOLER:  
 23 The inlet is coming off  
 24 of a split of air off of our main  
 25 intake, and we are ventilating through

1 a series of boreholes that were drilled  
 2 down from the surface to points of  
 3 deepest penetration in that panel, and  
 4 it's returning out those holes.  
 5 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 6 How many boreholes were  
 7 installed after the explosion in the  
 8 sealed area?  
 9 MR. STEMPLE:  
 10 Three.  
 11 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
 12 Excuse me. It's five.  
 13 There are three boreholes up on the  
 14 head end.  
 15 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 16 Could you point with  
 17 the --- please?  
 18 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
 19 I'll try. There are  
 20 three boreholes in that area. One of  
 21 them is 24 inches. We were concerned,  
 22 along with the regulatory agencies,  
 23 that you could have a methane buildup  
 24 in the face of these old mains here  
 25 that wouldn't get flushed out, so two

1 additional holes were drilled in the  
 2 face of the old mains. So there's a  
 3 total of five.  
 4 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 5 Okay. Are these  
 6 boreholes working properly? Are they  
 7 ventilating the methane and we don't  
 8 have a problem in that ---?  
 9 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
 10 Yes, that's correct.  
 11 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 12 Why were these boreholes  
 13 not installed prior to the explosion?  
 14 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
 15 Because it was sealed.  
 16 The plan was to seal the area and not  
 17 ventilate it. But then subsequently,  
 18 the explosion occurred. And there were  
 19 several reasons --- ongoing  
 20 investigations required people to still  
 21 travel that area. So the decision was  
 22 made to drill a borehole, pump the  
 23 water down. On the exhibit here, you  
 24 can see the bluish color represents  
 25 water at the time of the explosion. So

Page 330

1 before we could ventilate the area, we  
2 first had to pump it down. And we'll  
3 get into that in detail tomorrow during  
4 the investigation panel.  
5 SENATOR KESSLER:  
6 So there was no  
7 discussion that you would --- after the  
8 explosion, that you would reseal that  
9 area? That was out of the question?  
10 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
11 Well, it just wasn't  
12 practical in order to complete the  
13 investigation. So the decision was to  
14 ventilate it.  
15 MR. HATFIELD:  
16 More to the point,  
17 frankly, our comfort level with sealed  
18 areas at Sago simply wasn't such that  
19 we were comfortable sealing that area.  
20 We made the determination we would  
21 permanently ventilate it until we knew  
22 exactly what had happened.  
23 SENATOR KESSLER:  
24 Can you all show me on  
25 the map where the --- where all the

Page 331

1 battery charging stations are in the  
2 mine?  
3 MR. KITTS:  
4 I don't have that level  
5 of familiarity. Jeff, could you come  
6 over and point them out, or at least  
7 some of them?  
8 MR. J.TOLER:  
9 Carl will do that.  
10 MR. CRUMRINE:  
11 All right. There's one  
12 charging station right here at Four  
13 tail. We had a charger down on One  
14 Left, but it wasn't hooked up yet at  
15 that time. There's a charging station  
16 at First Right. A charging station  
17 right there at First Right. And then  
18 the rest of the charges are outside,  
19 with the exception of in the motor barn  
20 itself, which is right in that area  
21 right there.  
22 SENATOR KESSLER:  
23 Thank you. Why was there  
24 no signal from outside of the mine to  
25 answer the trapped miners who were

Page 332

1 pounding on a roof bolt to signal where  
2 they were?  
3 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
4 I'll let Ty Coleman  
5 answer that question.  
6 MR. COLEMAN:  
7 During the mine emergency  
8 operations, we did ask for the --- what  
9 we call the seismograph truck, the  
10 truck, on two different occasions.  
11 MR. STEMPLE:  
12 You have to talk into the  
13 mic.  
14 MR. COLEMAN:  
15 We had asked for the  
16 seismograph truck from MSHA on two  
17 different occasions, and not only  
18 myself but other panel members, who  
19 I'll let interject as they wish.  
20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
21 And where was that truck?  
22 MR. COLEMAN:  
23 I do not know, sir.  
24 SENATOR KESSLER:  
25 Who would have that

Page 333

1 answer?  
2 MR. COLEMAN:  
3 That would be an MSHA  
4 question.  
5 SENATOR KESSLER:  
6 Oh, and I'm not allowed  
7 to ask that.  
8 AUDIENCE APPLAUDS  
9 SENATOR KESSLER:  
10 If it's proper procedure,  
11 and that's to signal on the inside, if  
12 you're a trapped miner, and then you  
13 answer on the outside, why was the  
14 procedure not followed on the outside?  
15 Our miners followed it on the inside.  
16 MR. COLEMAN:  
17 I can't answer your  
18 question, sir.  
19 SENATOR KESSLER:  
20 Pardon me?  
21 MR. COLEMAN:  
22 I can't answer your  
23 question because we didn't have the  
24 truck which to do that with.  
25 SENATOR LOVE:

Page 334

1 I'll direct this question  
2 to Mr. Jamison, the fire boss, or any  
3 of you. It's long been  
4 a principle of investigations to sort  
5 of look where the people activity is  
6 taking place. Ninety-nine (99) percent  
7 of the time the activity will either  
8 directly or indirectly lead to the  
9 cause of the accident. And the closest  
10 --- or the closest activity to that  
11 sealed area was the belt attendant, the  
12 fire boss, Jerry Helms. That's where  
13 his body was located. And his body was  
14 found at the beginning of the mouth of  
15 Two Left. I understand he went into  
16 the mines early; fire bossed One Left,  
17 then went to the coal belt transfer  
18 point at Two Left. And this is where  
19 the coal belt from Two Left dumps the  
20 coal into the main belt. I think his  
21 regular job was attendant at Two Left.  
22 But this would have --- this would  
23 have --- he would have checked probably  
24 and cleaned up the area, then started  
25 the belts and maybe some other

Page 335

1 equipment. There was a shop under  
2 construction in this area, in the old  
3 crack entry that used to go to the  
4 sealed area. And in that shop was a  
5 575-volt portable welder that was not  
6 recovered by investigators during the  
7 beginning of the investigation. And  
8 the welder would have been powered from  
9 the belt drive in Helms' location. My  
10 question is, would Terry Helms have  
11 been starting the equipment and belts  
12 at the mouth of the Two Left section  
13 shortly after that section crew  
14 arrived?  
15 MR. J.TOLER:  
16 Are you asking would  
17 Terry have been energizing that belt?  
18 SENATOR LOVE:  
19 Yes. Would he have been  
20 starting equipment in that area?  
21 MR. J.TOLER:  
22 No.  
23 SENATOR LOVE:  
24 Would his activity have  
25 taken place at the same time maybe as

Page 336

1 the lightning strike?  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 No. It would be unlikely  
4 that Terry would have been starting ---  
5 .  
6 SENATOR LOVE:  
7 I understand in the  
8 previous closed interview statements,  
9 in the mine, if I read that mine map  
10 properly, the electrical source now  
11 known to be closest to the seals was a  
12 portable welder in the shop area under  
13 construction. Did state or federal  
14 investigators examine the portable  
15 welder? And where is the welder now?  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 That's --- as far as  
18 whether they examined that, you would  
19 have to direct that question to them.  
20 CHAIR:  
21 Did you examine it as  
22 part of your investigation?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 Me, personally, no.  
25 CHAIR:

Page 337

1 But ICG examined it?  
2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  
3 I'm not clear on what  
4 we're examining. What's the question?  
5 MR. HATFIELD:  
6 He's asking you about a  
7 welder near the mouth of Two Left. Did  
8 we --- was it there and was it focused  
9 on during the investigation, Sam.  
10 MR. KITTS:  
11 I'm not aware of a  
12 welder, but there was a battery charger  
13 there that was displaced some distance  
14 that got a lot of attention from the  
15 investigation. Is it possible that it  
16 was a battery charger that you're  
17 referring to?  
18 SENATOR LOVE:  
19 I'm talking about a  
20 welder. I'm talking about a welder.  
21 It's my understanding that the welder  
22 was in that shop area, that the welder  
23 undoubtedly was moved. I just wonder  
24 if anybody --- if the federal  
25 investigators examined the portable

Page 338

1 welder. It's known the welder was  
2 there.  
3 MR. KITTS:  
4 If it was there after the  
5 explosion, it would have been  
6 documented on the mapping, the mapping  
7 effort. The mapping effort documented  
8 everything in the mine from the portal  
9 all the way to the  
10 --- all the faces. So if there would  
11 have been some object there, it should  
12 be in the document.  
13 SENATOR LOVE:  
14 Let me ask you another  
15 question then. Why did the mine, the  
16 state and the federal personnel miss  
17 the absence of lightning arresters? I  
18 understand there were no lightning  
19 arresters.  
20 MR. HATFIELD:  
21 Your question is why did  
22 they miss the absence? I didn't  
23 understand that question. Could you  
24 repeat it? I did not hear your  
25 question.

Page 339

1 SENATOR LOVE:  
2 Why did the mine company,  
3 the state and the federal personnel,  
4 miss the absence of lightning  
5 arresters?  
6 MR. KITTS:  
7 Miss the absence of  
8 lightning arresters?  
9 SENATOR LOVE:  
10 Arresters. Lightning  
11 arresters. Lightning arresters. It's  
12 my understanding that possibly this  
13 explosion caused from lightning.  
14 MR. HATFIELD:  
15 With respect to the  
16 lightning arrester issue, I don't think  
17 they missed it. It was actually cited  
18 on the occasions where the lightning  
19 arresters were not in place. And that  
20 --- from --- in all instances, that was  
21 determined to not be connected to the  
22 accident. It was not identified as  
23 being a contributor. It was simply  
24 recognized as an electrical deficiency.  
25 I don't think it was missed.

Page 340

1 SENATOR LOVE:  
2 In May of 2001, the  
3 National Institute of Safety and  
4 Health, I guess it's called NIOSH,  
5 issued a technology news bulletin  
6 entitled, Reducing the Danger of  
7 Explosions in Sealed Areas. Now, this  
8 bulletin was the result of a study of a  
9 sealed area in a coal mine in Alabama  
10 where the seals were blown out or  
11 damaged on three different occasions,  
12 once in 1994, once in 1996 and again in  
13 1997. These explosions were all  
14 believed to have been methane  
15 explosions ignited by lightning. Now,  
16 for these explosions to occur, the  
17 methane had to be in the explosive  
18 range of 5 to 15 percent. Methane will  
19 not explode above 15 percent.  
20 NIOSH found that if the  
21 ventilation pressures were balanced at  
22 the seal location, the methane levels  
23 would rise to above 15 percent and be  
24 maintained above the explosive range.  
25 And in 1997, after building new seals,

Page 341

1 the ventilation was balanced,  
2 minimizing the pressure differential  
3 across seals in that Alabama mine,  
4 which is similar to Sago. At the time  
5 of the issuance of May 2001, no further  
6 explosions have occurred in that sealed  
7 area even though there were dozens and  
8 dozens of lightning storms that passed  
9 through that area. Why did the Sago  
10 Mine not --- did you ever know about  
11 this pressurizing the balance in the  
12 seals? Could this have been  
13 implemented at this mine, possibly, if  
14 lightning caused that?  
15 MR. HATFIELD:  
16 I can only speak to a  
17 very general and brief familiarity with  
18 that NIOSH report. But I believe if  
19 you'll reference the details of that  
20 report on those particular explosions  
21 in Alabama, there was a vertical  
22 conduit from the surface to the sealed  
23 area, indeed a cased porthole, as I  
24 recall. And that was thought to be the  
25 means by which lightning was

1 transmitted into the sealed area. So  
 2 on occasions where we didn't have a  
 3 clear conduit from the surface into the  
 4 sealed area, we didn't think it was a  
 5 risk. I think that's generally true of  
 6 the industry in general.  
 7 SENATOR LOVE:  
 8 Can I ask you one final  
 9 question? Why was the methane allowed  
 10 to accumulate in that mine to the 5 to  
 11 15 percent level, unmonitored? It  
 12 seems that it wasn't --- it was  
 13 unmonitored.  
 14 MR. HATFIELD:  
 15 With respect to why the  
 16 methane was allowed to accumulate in a  
 17 sealed area, indeed, by design that's  
 18 what's supposed to happen. That is the  
 19 means by which a sealed area becomes  
 20 safe. The methane increases from the  
 21 day that you close off the seal, the  
 22 oxygen decreases, and you achieve an  
 23 inert and stable environment. And  
 24 that's what has been very successful in  
 25 this industry for many years. So the

1 fact that methane was rising behind the  
 2 seals is not only expected, it's indeed  
 3 the plan, if you will, and that's how  
 4 you get the safety.  
 5 The problem at Sago is we  
 6 weren't in a safe zone yet. Clearly,  
 7 we had an explosive mixture that came  
 8 in contact with an ignition source  
 9 before the methane had accumulated to  
 10 the point of making it an inert  
 11 environment.  
 12 SENATOR LOVE:  
 13 Thank you, sir.  
 14 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 15 I just have a few  
 16 questions, and it might deal with the  
 17 process in the sealed area, number one.  
 18 It's my understanding, at least from  
 19 some of our discussions and meetings,  
 20 that area had been taken out of  
 21 production due to roof falls; is that  
 22 correct?  
 23 MR. KITTS:  
 24 Yes.  
 25 SENATOR KESSLER:

1 And do you know  
 2 approximately when that occurred then?  
 3 MR. KITTS:  
 4 My recollection is in the  
 5 fall. Jeff might have a more specific  
 6 date.  
 7 MR. J.TOLER:  
 8 It was late September or  
 9 early October, I think, is when we  
 10 pulled off that section.  
 11 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 12 Okay. And when then were  
 13 the seals in place?  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 Well, construction began  
 16 the end of October and continued  
 17 through the middle of December.  
 18 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 19 And what I'm trying to  
 20 get at is the condition of the sealed  
 21 area prior to the time it being  
 22 completely sealed. Were there any type  
 23 of photos, testing or other  
 24 documentations on any type of gas  
 25 levels or anything else concerning the

1 condition of that area?  
 2 MR. KITTS:  
 3 That area would have been  
 4 pre-shifted. And that's one of the  
 5 primary reasons for constructing the  
 6 seals, is you actually improve the  
 7 safety of the miners because they don't  
 8 have to go into those areas that have  
 9 the very bad top conditions. So during  
 10 the time the seals were being  
 11 constructed, it would have had to have  
 12 been  
 13 pre-shifted on a daily basis, so there  
 14 is a record of those conditions.  
 15 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 16 Have those been reviewed  
 17 or turned over to the appropriate state  
 18 and federal officials so we can get a  
 19 good picture of what the conditions  
 20 were like in that area immediately  
 21 prior to January 2nd?  
 22 MR. KITTS:  
 23 I'm not sure, but we can  
 24 get you an answer on that.  
 25 MR. HATFIELD:

Page 346

1 All of those records have  
2 been turned over.  
3 SENATOR KESSLER:  
4 And there's a question  
5 made earlier by some of the family  
6 members when the seal was installed and  
7 the Omega blocks used. You contracted  
8 that out; is that correct?  
9 MR. KITTS:  
10 The question was, was the  
11 construction of the seals contracted  
12 out?  
13 SENATOR KESSLER:  
14 Was that done?  
15 MR. KITTS:  
16 No. It was all ICG  
17 employees that constructed the seals,  
18 plus --- I'll let Jeff Toler answer the  
19 question.  
20 MR. J.TOLER:  
21 The construction was done  
22 primarily by ICG employees. But I also  
23 had a few employees there that were  
24 employees of Garrett Mine Service that  
25 worked on it as well.

Page 347

1 SENATOR KESSLER:  
2 Okay. Well, that's what  
3 I thought I heard the family saying,  
4 that there may have been some folks  
5 that were actually involved in the  
6 construction of the seals that may not  
7 have been certified. Is there a  
8 certification process that individuals  
9 go through in order to be able to be  
10 trained to ---?  
11 MR. J.TOLER:  
12 No one can work in an  
13 underground coal mine without having  
14 either a miner certification or an  
15 apprentice miner certification.  
16 SENATOR KESSLER:  
17 But there was some  
18 suggestion that the folks that may have  
19 been involved in the laying of these  
20 particular blocks or seals were not  
21 properly certified. You would deny  
22 those allegations?  
23 MR. COLEMAN:  
24 I'd like to interject.  
25 There is no certification --- there is

Page 348

1 no certification requirement, either by  
2 the State of West Virginia, 22 Code, or  
3 the CFR 30, pursuant to seal  
4 construction.  
5 SENATOR KESSLER:  
6 Or properly trained.  
7 Were the individuals --- were they  
8 properly trained? Had individuals who  
9 put --- who constructed these seals,  
10 had they been experienced in laying  
11 Omega block?  
12 MR. COLEMAN:  
13 That would come under the  
14 gamut of task training.  
15 SENATOR KESSLER:  
16 Pardon?  
17 MR. COLEMAN:  
18 That would come under the  
19 gamut of task training.  
20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
21 I just got another  
22 question. I think it probably goes to  
23 Mr. Jamison. Mr. Jamison, you've  
24 talked and advised that you arrived at  
25 about 2:30, is that correct, in the

Page 349

1 morning?  
2 MR. JAMISON:  
3 Yes.  
4 SENATOR KESSLER:  
5 Do you want to just lead  
6 us through what you actually did once  
7 you arrived there that day up until the  
8 time of the explosion?  
9 MR. JAMISON:  
10 I arrived at  
11 approximately 2:30, and Terry Helms  
12 arrived a little after. We got  
13 dressed. And I asked him how he wanted  
14 to do it, and he said, you get your  
15 regular run on Two Left and I'll do  
16 mine and get One Left. So I said, all  
17 right. So we signed off the books, got  
18 our lights and went down the hill to go  
19 in the mine. We got a mantrip and I  
20 started up the belt. I heard him  
21 coming. I opened the man door for him,  
22 and he was headed for Four head.  
23 That's where I was supposed to pick the  
24 jeep up. I rode up to Three drive with  
25 him, started walking Three belt. Went



1 in to 22 block. I had a pump sitting  
 2 in the return. So I went in and it  
 3 wasn't running. So I made a note of it  
 4 and come back and went to Four head,  
 5 picked up the mantrip, went up to the  
 6 mouth of One Left --- or Two Left.  
 7 Walked up and done the face and come  
 8 back. And when I got back to the jeep,  
 9 I seen he'd left his bucket and thermos  
 10 on the jeep. I told the dispatcher  
 11 that I'd leave it at One Left so he  
 12 could get it. So I proceeded to come  
 13 back outside. And I come back to Three  
 14 head, checked Three head out, see if it  
 15 had any rock, there are any posts in  
 16 it, went down the belt line, come back  
 17 up and got on the Jeep, went down to  
 18 Two head and done the same thing. And  
 19 then I proceeded to come on outside.  
 20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 21 And you indicated that  
 22 you then went back in; is that right?  
 23 MR. JAMISON:  
 24 At six o'clock I went  
 25 back in to Two head, and I was going to

1 wait until they started running coal.  
 2 Because sometimes they run a lot of  
 3 rock, posts and cribs and you got to  
 4 clean them out of the head.  
 5 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 6 So you went back in then  
 7 at 6:00. And how --- what actually did  
 8 you do at that point? How much  
 9 activity did you engage in prior to the  
 10 explosion?  
 11 MR. JAMISON:  
 12 Well, I wasn't that long.  
 13 Probably about 15 minutes until it  
 14 blew up, when the mine blew.  
 15 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 16 You had indicated that as  
 17 part of your --- you going in and did  
 18 your fire boss, that you put your notes  
 19 in your shirt pocket; is that right?  
 20 MR. JAMISON:  
 21 Yeah, in a book.  
 22 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 23 And that's what you did  
 24 in this particular instance as well?  
 25 MR. JAMISON:

1 Yeah. I carry a Nine  
 2 Central book. It's a little tablet.  
 3 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 4 And did you take any  
 5 notes?  
 6 MR. JAMISON:  
 7 I did write in there that  
 8 that pump was down. And then when I  
 9 got outside, I looked at it and told  
 10 John Boni that that pump was down. He  
 11 was to go check it.  
 12 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 13 And then you put it back  
 14 in your shirt and ---?  
 15 MR. JAMISON:  
 16 Right.  
 17 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 18 And was that the only  
 19 thing that you remember writing in your  
 20 notes that day?  
 21 MR. JAMISON:  
 22 I didn't have any  
 23 violation or nothing to write.  
 24 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 25 Because I thought I heard

1 you say, and I could be wrong, that the  
 2 section looked good and that you did  
 3 not write anything down in your ---.  
 4 MR. JAMISON:  
 5 It looked good. That's  
 6 why ---.  
 7 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 8 I'm just trying to ---  
 9 I'm not trying to confuse you, but I  
 10 just --- at one --- I thought I heard  
 11 you say that you did not write anything  
 12 down, and I wasn't sure. Did you write  
 13 something down in your missing book or  
 14 not?  
 15 MR. JAMISON:  
 16 No violation or anything.  
 17 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 18 And the book you think is  
 19 maybe put in a laundry somewhere?  
 20 MR. JAMISON:  
 21 I would say with my  
 22 clothes. I never did even get my  
 23 clothes back.  
 24 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 25 Did you make any attempt

1 to try to locate it after you knew that  
 2 an explosion had occurred?  
 3 MR. JAMISON:  
 4 No. I never been back to  
 5 that mine.  
 6 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 7 When was the first time  
 8 that you notified anybody that your  
 9 notes and field notes as a fire boss  
 10 may have been left in the laundry  
 11 before today? I mean, when was the  
 12 first time that ---?  
 13 MR. JAMISON:  
 14 I think Greg Nestor  
 15 called me, and I --- I think I  
 16 mentioned it to him that my clothes  
 17 were there.  
 18 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 19 And when was that?  
 20 MR. JAMISON:  
 21 That was --- I believe it  
 22 was that evening.  
 23 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 24 You never made an attempt  
 25 to go back to try to find your notes?

1 MR. JAMISON:  
 2 Usually they send your --  
 3 - send our clothes on over to the other  
 4 mine.  
 5 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 6 But you never made any  
 7 further attempt, I take it, to try to  
 8 recover your shirt which had your fire  
 9 boss notes in it, I take it?  
 10 MR. JAMISON:  
 11 No. I ain't worried  
 12 about no clothes.  
 13 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 14 Were the belts turned on  
 15 that day?  
 16 MR. JAMISON:  
 17 They was turned on after  
 18 it had been pre-shift, for start-up  
 19 from outside.  
 20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 21 Would Terry have turned  
 22 them on, or who else?  
 23 MR. JAMISON:  
 24 The dispatcher turns the  
 25 belts on.

1 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 2 And that would have been  
 3 turned on by the dispatcher, not by  
 4 Terry?  
 5 MR. JAMISON:  
 6 No, the dispatcher  
 7 outside. They start them up and let  
 8 them run so they get wet.  
 9 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 10 Had you worked --- how  
 11 long had you been a fire boss prior to  
 12 January 2nd?  
 13 MR. JAMISON:  
 14 '81.  
 15 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 16 Since 1981?  
 17 MR. JAMISON:  
 18 Right.  
 19 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 20 And had you worked  
 21 continuously at the Sago Mine or at  
 22 predecessors or ---?  
 23 MR. JAMISON:  
 24 I've worked --- I've  
 25 worked Sago and Spruce and --- I've

1 worked all of them.  
 2 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 3 How about at the Sago  
 4 Mine, how long have you been fire  
 5 bossing prior to January 2nd?  
 6 MR. JAMISON:  
 7 Where at? At Sago?  
 8 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 9 At Sago Mine, yes, sir.  
 10 MR. JAMISON:  
 11 I believe I come over in  
 12 July.  
 13 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 14 Pardon? July?  
 15 MR. JAMISON:  
 16 July of '05.  
 17 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 18 And how many times had  
 19 you --- actually, you had been doing  
 20 that on a daily basis, since July of  
 21 '05?  
 22 MR. JAMISON:  
 23 Yeah.  
 24 SENATOR KESSLER:  
 25 Every time you went out

Page 358

1 to pre-shift, to check the conditions  
2 of the mine?  
3 MR. JAMISON:  
4 Yeah, that's my job. I  
5 mean, I --- that's what I do.  
6 SENATOR KESSLER:  
7 Did you do any type of  
8 checking for any type of methane as a  
9 fire boss on the morning of January  
10 2nd?  
11 MR. JAMISON:  
12 Yes.  
13 SENATOR KESSLER:  
14 And would you just  
15 describe what you did for the ---?  
16 MR. JAMISON:  
17 Well, I carry a spotter,  
18 and it checked all the time for you.  
19 All you got to do is just look at it.  
20 And if you don't look at it and you run  
21 into gas, it sets an alarm off.  
22 SENATOR KESSLER:  
23 And did you make any  
24 --- and I take it you made no notations  
25 that there were --- did you get any

Page 359

1 type of reading?  
2 MR. JAMISON:  
3 .1 usually.  
4 SENATOR KESSLER:  
5 Would that have been  
6 --- I take it you'd note that in your  
7 missing book. Would that have been the  
8 type of information you would have  
9 customarily kept in your ---?  
10 MR. JAMISON:  
11 Sometimes I'll write it  
12 down. Other times I don't. Because  
13 it's not a violation. .1 is not a  
14 violation.  
15 SENATOR KESSLER:  
16 I understand that. But  
17 did you not --- was it your practice to  
18 only note in your fire boss book that  
19 you kept violations that occurred, or  
20 did you routinely monitor and document  
21 safe conditions?  
22 MR. JAMISON:  
23 If I'd see him, I'd  
24 document them, yeah.  
25 SENATOR KESSLER:

Page 360

1 I just have just a couple  
2 more. And it probably deals with a map  
3 I was provided early on in the  
4 investigation behind the sealed area.  
5 And I'm not sure who --- maybe you may  
6 know, but there appears to be a --- at  
7 least on the map I'm looking at, a well  
8 that's behind a sealed area. Is that a  
9 methane well; do you know? Would  
10 anybody ---?  
11 MR. KITTS:  
12 You're referring to this  
13 one?  
14 SENATOR KESSLER:  
15 Yes, it appears to be.  
16 Was that in operation?  
17 MR. KITTS:  
18 Yes. That's a natural  
19 gas well.  
20 SENATOR KESSLER:  
21 Methane gas?  
22 MR. KITTS:  
23 Yes.  
24 SENATOR KESSLER:  
25 Natural gas. And how far

Page 361

1 was that from your operation? Is that  
2 a --- I'm trying to look at the scale.  
3 MR. KITTS:  
4 It was 108 feet from the  
5 nearest --- or the nearest workings.  
6 SENATOR KESSLER:  
7 And was that a metal  
8 casing?  
9 MR. KITTS:  
10 Yes, I believe that's  
11 true.  
12 SENATOR KESSLER:  
13 And was there any type --  
14 - was there any type of laterals coming  
15 out of that well that ---?  
16 MR. KITTS:  
17 I'm sorry, any type of  
18 what?  
19 SENATOR KESSLER:  
20 Any type of laterals that  
21 may have ---  
22 MR. KITTS:  
23 No, sir.  
24 SENATOR KESSLER:  
25 --- come over into the

Page 362

1 abandoned mine section area?  
2 MR. KITTS:  
3 No, sir.  
4 SENATOR KESSLER:  
5 I was just trying to  
6 determine if there was any type of  
7 thing that may have served as a  
8 conductor over into that area. Are you  
9 folks satisfied that there was nothing  
10 in that well that could have been a  
11 conduit for the alleged lightning  
12 strike in that area?  
13 MR. KITTS:  
14 There have been numerous  
15 parties that have inspected that entire  
16 area adjacent to that well. And to  
17 date, we have not been able to find any  
18 indication that it was related.  
19 SENATOR KESSLER:  
20 That's all I have.  
21 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
22 Thank you. This morning,  
23 one of the panels was talking about  
24 that you all, I didn't pick it up  
25 exactly, had either changed the fan,

Page 363

1 changed the speed, changed the blades  
2 or did something that improved the  
3 overall quantity of air and  
4 ventilation. Could you talk about that  
5 and when it was?  
6 MR. KITTS:  
7 Yes, sir. I can talk in  
8 generalities, but these fellows down  
9 here on the end of the table are the  
10 ones who actually did the work. So I  
11 would ask Jeff and Carl to address how  
12 you improved the ventilation system.  
13 MR. J.TOLER:  
14 Well, one thing we did,  
15 we made an adjustment on the main fan  
16 that increased the airflow into and out  
17 of the mines.  
18 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
19 How much? How much was  
20 it before? How much after?  
21 MR. KITTS:  
22 The short answer to that  
23 question is 15,000 to 20,000 CFM was  
24 going through the intakes at each  
25 section. And after they made their

Page 364

1 corrects, and correct me if I'm wrong,  
2 Jeff, but I think it doubled to 40,000  
3 to 50,000 CFM.  
4 MR. J.TOLER:  
5 Yes, sir, that's correct.  
6 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
7 I was wondering, could  
8 you find --- or maybe you've already  
9 done it, quantities at the fan, how  
10 much they went up also, before and  
11 after?  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 The fan itself --- Carl,  
14 correct me if I'm wrong. It went from  
15 probably around 100,000 up to 160,000  
16 on this air change.  
17 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
18 I'm sorry?  
19 MR. J.TOLER:  
20 The fan itself ---  
21 immediately in by the fan the air  
22 quantity probably jumped from around  
23 90,000 to 100,000 CFMs up to 160,000,  
24 so an increase of 60,000 to 70,000 CFM  
25 at the fan.

Page 365

1 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
2 How did you do that? Was  
3 it a blade speed or a new fan? How did  
4 you do that?  
5 MR. J.TOLER:  
6 It's blade pitch.  
7 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
8 Blade pitch, okay. I  
9 notice you pointed out on the map where  
10 the explosion occurred that you talked  
11 about five holes now that you have.  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 Yes, sir.  
14 DELGATE CAPUTO:  
15 When did that water get  
16 in there that you talk about you had to  
17 pump out?  
18 MR. J.TOLER:  
19 The water accumulates  
20 naturally in that --- in several areas  
21 of the mine, water accumulates  
22 naturally. But in a sealed area like  
23 that, it --- if it's in an area that  
24 we're working, we de-water and pump the  
25 water. But in a sealed environment

1 like that, it will naturally accumulate  
 2 and naturally fill up.  
 3 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 4 Do you know if it was  
 5 filled up before the explosion?  
 6 MR. KITTS:  
 7 Yes, we do. After the  
 8 explosion, the boreholes penetrated the  
 9 water, and we were able to determine  
 10 the elevation of it.  
 11 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 12 All right. Now, you had  
 13 five holes, if I heard you correctly.  
 14 Somebody was talking about three, but I  
 15 think now you said it's five.  
 16 MR. KITTS:  
 17 I believe there's five  
 18 boreholes right there.  
 19 MR. J.TOLER:  
 20 Yes, there are five.  
 21 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 22 Do you know what's  
 23 roughly the total quantity of air when  
 24 you're using a blowing system that  
 25 you're blowing through that section,

1 now blowing to the outside? What's the  
 2 total quantity out of those five holes?  
 3 MR. J.TOLER:  
 4 Do you have that answer?  
 5 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 6 I believe it's been 8,000  
 7 and 9,000 going into the intake.  
 8 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 9 What's the methane  
 10 content going out now?  
 11 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 12 All of our holes are  
 13 reading zero, with the exception of one  
 14 jumped up to eight-tenths for some  
 15 reason. I went up and checked it the  
 16 very next day. And that was the same  
 17 hole when we were drilling and drilled  
 18 into it that it had methane in the hole  
 19 itself, not in the mines, but the  
 20 methane was coming out of the hole.  
 21 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 22 Eight-tenths is the  
 23 highest reading that you've had? Is  
 24 that what you said?  
 25 MR. CRUMRINE:

1 Eight-tenths is what I  
 2 have noticed up there. I believe it  
 3 was reported that I had one percent  
 4 coming out of that hole. And I went  
 5 the very next morning to check it, and  
 6 I had eight-tenths because my methane  
 7 spotter had just been calibrated and I  
 8 wanted to see what I had coming out of  
 9 there.  
 10 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 11 How often do you check  
 12 those holes?  
 13 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 14 They're checked daily.  
 15 DELEGATE CAPUTO:  
 16 That answers all my  
 17 questions. Thank you.  
 18 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 19 Thank you. I have  
 20 several questions. I'd like to start  
 21 out with you, Mr. Jamison, if I might.  
 22 What areas of the mine --- and forgive  
 23 me if some of this sounds repetitive,  
 24 but I've had a little trouble hearing  
 25 up here. What area of the mine were

1 you responsible for on the fire boss  
 2 run that January 2nd? The Two Left  
 3 section; is that correct?  
 4 MR. JAMISON:  
 5 Yes.  
 6 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 7 How about the seal areas?  
 8 MR. JAMISON:  
 9 No.  
 10 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 11 You didn't do any spot  
 12 checks ---  
 13 MR. JAMISON:  
 14 I don't ---.  
 15 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 16 --- at the intakes of the  
 17 seals or anything like that?  
 18 MR. JAMISON:  
 19 No.  
 20 MR. KITTS:  
 21 Excuse me. Mr. Chairman,  
 22 it might be helpful if we can help Fred  
 23 point out what areas he did fire boss  
 24 on the map, right here on the computer.  
 25 CHAIR:

1 If you could do that, Mr.  
 2 Jamison, with Mr. Kitts. Point out on  
 3 the map with the cursor what areas you  
 4 did fire boss that day. If you would  
 5 step up, Mr. Jamison, to go over there.  
 6 MR. JAMISON:  
 7 All right. I done One,  
 8 Two and Three belts. Right there is  
 9 One, there's Two and there's Three up  
 10 at the Four head. All right. I come  
 11 out of Four head, got on the mantrip  
 12 and went up to the mouth of Two Left.  
 13 Went up the belt line to the face,  
 14 across the face, back down the track,  
 15 got on my mantrip, came back outside.  
 16 Up the road out there on the --- yeah,  
 17 right about there on Three track. And  
 18 then I came down to Three head, checked  
 19 it out. Come down to Two head, checked  
 20 it out. And then I came back down the  
 21 track to the outside and put the jeep  
 22 on charge.  
 23 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 24 Thank you, Mr. Jamison.  
 25 You said that you carried a spotter to

1 check for methane; is that correct?  
 2 MR. JAMISON:  
 3 Right here.  
 4 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 5 And could you show us how  
 6 you checked for the methane at the face  
 7 areas?  
 8 MR. JAMISON:  
 9 (Indicating). All right.  
 10 This is the part that tells you your  
 11 oxygen, your CH<sub>4</sub> and your toxic. You  
 12 put it on your hand, carry it just like  
 13 that, and you look at it. You keep  
 14 glancing at it. I mean, you just don't  
 15 stare.  
 16 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 17 You just carry it in your  
 18 hand through the whole fire boss run?  
 19 MR. JAMISON:  
 20 Yeah, you can carry it.  
 21 Or if you're doing something, you can  
 22 put it in your pouch and it will still  
 23 work. And if you run into methane or  
 24 any kind of bad gas or air ---.  
 25 SENATOR CARUTH:

1 Did you just carry it in  
 2 your hand or in your pouch and walk  
 3 those faces to determine if CH<sub>4</sub> was  
 4 present?  
 5 MR. JAMISON:  
 6 I carry it and sometimes  
 7 I put it in my pouch.  
 8 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 9 You don't do the ---?  
 10 MR. JAMISON:  
 11 When you're at the face,  
 12 yes, 12 inch ---.  
 13 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 14 Did you conduct tests  
 15 like that at the face areas? You did?  
 16 MR. JAMISON:  
 17 Yes, I did. And I'll  
 18 tell you what it does if you're in any  
 19 kind of gas.  
 20 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 21 Did you detect any  
 22 abnormal conditions in your fire boss  
 23 run that morning?  
 24 MR. JAMISON:  
 25 No. No, I didn't.

1 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 2 Is there any areas that  
 3 you fire bossed that has potted-out  
 4 areas where the top had fell  
 5 previously?  
 6 MR. JAMISON:  
 7 No. Mine I can usually  
 8 reach. I don't need a probe.  
 9 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 10 You can reach everything  
 11 without a probe. Did you call your  
 12 fire boss report out or did you carry  
 13 it outside?  
 14 MR. JAMISON:  
 15 I carried it out.  
 16 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 17 You said the belts were  
 18 running when you left that area of the  
 19 mine; is that correct?  
 20 MR. JAMISON:  
 21 No. Them belts wasn't  
 22 running until after I okayed it and  
 23 Terry okays it, and then they start the  
 24 belt.  
 25 SENATOR CARUTH:

1 So you're saying you  
2 carried your fire boss report outside  
3 and give them the green light, so to  
4 speak, and then the dispatcher started  
5 the belts? Them belts were not running  
6 before you got out of that mine, is  
7 that what you're telling me?  
8 MR. JAMISON:  
9 No. The belt wasn't  
10 running when we got there, and it  
11 wasn't running until after the fire  
12 boss was done.  
13 SENATOR CARUTH:  
14 Okay. Who did you turn  
15 in your fire boss report to, Mr.  
16 Jamison?  
17 MR. JAMISON:  
18 I filled the Two Left  
19 section book out, and Junior Toler,  
20 that's the boss coming on, then he  
21 looked at it and then he co-signed it.  
22 SENATOR CARUTH:  
23 Thank you. I just have  
24 some questions --- and I just want to  
25 ask management, in general. Mr.

1 Hatfield, you might want to take some  
2 of these. You talked about earlier the  
3 intent of sealing an area is basically  
4 to let the area you're sealing build  
5 the CHR level above the explosive  
6 range, I think is what I heard you say  
7 earlier.  
8 MR. HATFIELD:  
9 The intent is to  
10 establish an inert environment, a  
11 nonexplosive environment, which usually  
12 happens by the methane increasing and  
13 oxygen decreasing.  
14 SENATOR CARUTH:  
15 But it's been brought out  
16 in testimony that some methane was  
17 found around the seals. Did that lead  
18 you guys to believe that the seals were  
19 leaking, or did you just kind of write  
20 it off as ---?  
21 MR. HATFIELD:  
22 I'll let Mr. Toler speak  
23 to that. I think the quantity found  
24 was two-tenths, and I believe  
25 --- well, I'll let him respond to that.

1 SENATOR CARUTH:  
2 That's fine.  
3 MR. J.TOLER:  
4 I think he summed it up  
5 right there. The quantity is  
6 two-tenths of a percent. And again,  
7 that is well within the legal limits of  
8 what can be there.  
9 SENATOR CARUTH:  
10 I understand that it's  
11 well within the legal limits, Mr.  
12 Toler. But did that give you an  
13 indication that those seals may have  
14 been leaking was the question.  
15 MR. J.TOLER:  
16 I can't answer that. I  
17 mean, it's ---.  
18 SENATOR CARUTH:  
19 So there was no  
20 discussion in management meetings that  
21 maybe the seals were leaking?  
22 MR. J.TOLER:  
23 I think that's why Mr.  
24 Crumrine went back the next day to do a  
25 follow-up inspection on it, just to see

1 if there was any indication that it was  
2 leaking out of the seals.  
3 SENATOR CARUTH:  
4 Well, what were the  
5 results of that follow-up?  
6 MR. CRUMRINE:  
7 Two-tenths.  
8 SENATOR CARUTH:  
9 So at that point, did you  
10 ---?  
11 MR. CRUMRINE:  
12 I had the same as John  
13 had.  
14 SENATOR CARUTH:  
15 I'm sorry?  
16 MR. CRUMRINE:  
17 I had the same as John  
18 Boni had 24 hours before.  
19 SENATOR CARUTH:  
20 I'm sorry, I still didn't  
21 ---.  
22 MR. CRUMRINE:  
23 I had the same reading as  
24 John Boni 24 hours before.  
25 SENATOR CARUTH:

1 I understand that. Did  
 2 you assume at that point in time that  
 3 the seals were leaking?  
 4 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 5 No. As far as I'm  
 6 concerned, you cannot build a complete  
 7 seal that won't --- gas will not push  
 8 out of. That's what they do. They  
 9 push --- some gas pushes out of seals  
 10 and stuff. And I look for any big  
 11 cracks or anything, wondering if  
 12 something had happened there. And no,  
 13 I did not find anything.  
 14 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 15 Did you do much testing  
 16 through the sampling height that went  
 17 into the old area?  
 18 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 19 No, sir. My knowledge of  
 20 that sampling height is as if you are  
 21 going to go breach the seal and go  
 22 behind there for some reason. That is  
 23 why you use the sampling pipe. If I  
 24 open that sampling pipe, then I let  
 25 pressure out into the area that I want

1 to keep clear.  
 2 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 3 So you didn't think it  
 4 was worth testing that area to see if  
 5 the atmosphere was getting inundated to  
 6 above the explosive range once you  
 7 found the two-tenths outside the seals?  
 8 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 9 What I thought was that  
 10 sampling tube is not for me to be  
 11 correct, unless I'm going to breach  
 12 that seal. And John had told me that  
 13 he had opened that and had gotten 1.2.  
 14 To my recollection, that's what he  
 15 told me. Which, you know, indicated to  
 16 me that what was happening behind the  
 17 seals, what we expected to happen  
 18 behind the seals was happening behind  
 19 the seals, that it was gaining methane.  
 20 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 21 Did you instruct anyone  
 22 to continue to monitor the methane  
 23 levels at those seals?  
 24 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 25 No. They were within a

1 legal range and they were to be checked  
 2 the very next week. And that's --- and  
 3 we would check it on a weekly.  
 4 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 5 So you wasn't concerned  
 6 too much about the two-tenths and one  
 7 percent that you found outside the  
 8 seals?  
 9 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 10 No, sir. No, sir, I  
 11 wasn't concerned about the two-tenths  
 12 of one percent. I went --- now, had I  
 13 gotten four or five-tenths, then I  
 14 would have been alarmed that it was  
 15 --- that maybe I had a breach in a seal  
 16 someplace.  
 17 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 18 Were you involved with  
 19 the construction of the seals? Which  
 20 one of you folks maybe would have been  
 21 closely involved to the construction of  
 22 the seals?  
 23 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 24 Probably both of us to an  
 25 extent.

1 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 2 The question was asked  
 3 and I never did get a clear answer on  
 4 it, was the Omega blocks mortared  
 5 between blocks or were they laid up and  
 6 then plastered?  
 7 MR. J.TOLER:  
 8 The plan requires that  
 9 there be mortar between ---.  
 10 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 11 I know what the plan  
 12 said. I know exactly what the plan  
 13 said.  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 To the best of my  
 16 knowledge, they were mortared --- they  
 17 were built, constructed according to  
 18 the plan.  
 19 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 20 Did you actually see the  
 21 mortar between the seals ---  
 22 MR. J.TOLER:  
 23 When I was ---.  
 24 SENATOR CARUTH:  
 25 --- or between the



Page 382

1 blocks? I'm sorry.  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 The times that I was at  
4 the seals, and I was watching very  
5 little of the construction while I was  
6 there, but they appeared to be  
7 constructing them the way they were  
8 supposed to.  
9 SENATOR CARUTH:  
10 And you mentioned that  
11 Garrett Mine Service was also involved  
12 in the construction of these seals.  
13 Did I hear you say that?  
14 MR. J.TOLER:  
15 Yes, sir.  
16 SENATOR CARUTH:  
17 Was there a contract with  
18 Garrett Mine Service on this or was  
19 this done basically in house?  
20 MR. J.TOLER:  
21 Garrett Mine Service, we  
22 routinely used them to do some work at  
23 our mines. And I think of all the  
24 individuals that worked on the  
25 construction of the seals, three of

Page 383

1 them were with Garrett Mine Supply.  
2 SENATOR CARUTH:  
3 So you had a contract  
4 with Garrett Mine Supply to build the  
5 three seals?  
6 MR. J.TOLER:  
7 No. No, sir. They  
8 assisted.  
9 SENATOR CARUTH:  
10 They just assisted?  
11 MR. HATFIELD:  
12 I believe what he's  
13 describing is we have a contract with  
14 Garrett Mine Services to periodically  
15 supply supplemental labor. They're  
16 used on different tasks at different  
17 times.  
18 SENATOR CARUTH:  
19 I understand. After the  
20 seals were completed, did anybody from  
21 your management team inspect them and  
22 verify that they were built according  
23 to the plan or constructed well enough  
24 to seal the old area of the mine?  
25 MR. J.TOLER:

Page 384

1 There were certified  
2 foremen in a manager capacity present  
3 during the construction of the seal. My  
4 foremen would be part of my management  
5 structure. And they were present  
6 during the --- after the construction  
7 was completed, I think Mr. Crumrine  
8 made a run by those seals and looked at  
9 them.  
10 MR. CRUMRINE:  
11 Yes. I went by there  
12 with the federal inspector, and he  
13 complimented me on the appearance of  
14 the seals, of the roof control around  
15 the seals, the ventilation of the seals  
16 themselves, the rock dusting around the  
17 seals and just the general appearance  
18 and clean-up of them.  
19 SENATOR CARUTH:  
20 Was it determined --- I  
21 know there was some talk earlier when  
22 regulatory agencies were testifying.  
23 Was it determined if the rib was  
24 chipped out for the seals to go back  
25 into the rib, or was it just kind of

Page 385

1 cut and mortared around the edges?  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 It's not required that  
4 they be cut into the ribs like that.  
5 SENATOR CARUTH:  
6 So it was not done there?  
7 MR. J.TOLER:  
8 No, sir.  
9 SENATOR CARUTH:  
10 Okay. One thing I'm not  
11 clear on, Mr. Toler. Maybe you can  
12 help me. You said that --- what time  
13 did you first enter the mine after you  
14 found out there was --- or found out  
15 there was some type of problem?  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 I would say approximately  
18 6:40 to 6:45.  
19 SENATOR CARUTH:  
20 And at that point in time  
21 --- well, let me back up. A news  
22 report says, and we talked about this  
23 earlier, that the CO monitor went off  
24 at 6:10. Was there anybody --- were  
25 you aware of that? Let me ask you that

Page 386

1 first.  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 Was I aware that the  
4 alarm went off at 6:10? No, sir, I was  
5 not.  
6 SENATOR CARUTH:  
7 Okay. So you were first  
8 made aware that there was a problem at  
9 what time?  
10 MR. J.TOLER:  
11 At 6:31, when the event  
12 happened.  
13 SENATOR CARUTH:  
14 And you entered the mine  
15 at about 6:45?  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 Yes, sir.  
18 SENATOR CARUTH:  
19 Now, you said you were  
20 trying to establish some ventilation as  
21 you went into the mine. I assume that  
22 seals were blown out; is that correct?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 We know now that the  
25 seals were blown out.

Page 387

1 SENATOR CARUTH:  
2 Well, when you was ---  
3 what was you repairing as you went in?  
4 MR. J.TOLER:  
5 What we call a permanent  
6 stopping, a permanent ventilation  
7 control that directs the air deeper and  
8 deeper into the mine.  
9 SENATOR CARUTH:  
10 Now, were they blown out  
11 as well?  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 Yes, sir.  
14 SENATOR CARUTH:  
15 Totally blown out or  
16 partially blown ---?  
17 MR. J.TOLER:  
18 Varying degrees, but  
19 anywhere from a third destroyed to  
20 completely destroyed.  
21 SENATOR CARUTH:  
22 And what did you try to  
23 patch those stoppings with?  
24 MR. J.TOLER:  
25 We used brattice cloth or

Page 388

1 curtain, as we typically call it.  
2 SENATOR CARUTH:  
3 Did you load up supplies  
4 that you would need? Would you take  
5 them in on a mantrip, or how did you --  
6 -?  
7 MR. J.TOLER:  
8 On the --- when we went  
9 inside the mines, no, sir, I wasn't  
10 aware of what I would need or anything.  
11 I was wanting to get in there and  
12 assess what had happened. When Dick  
13 Wilfong and Vernon Hofer exited the  
14 mines with the One Left crew, Mr.  
15 Schoonover and myself were able to get  
16 to a point that we could --- we were --  
17 - we saw that we had some damage to  
18 ventilation controls. At that point, I  
19 called back out and I told Mr. Wilfong  
20 and Mr. Hofer to get the necessary  
21 supplies to make those repairs and get  
22 it back in to us as quick as they  
23 could.  
24 SENATOR CARUTH:  
25 And what were the

Page 389

1 necessary supplies? What did he bring  
2 in?  
3 MR. J.TOLER:  
4 They brought curtain.  
5 They brought boards. They brought  
6 nails. They brought detectors. Owen  
7 Jones' hard hat was lost during this,  
8 and I had them bring Owen another hard  
9 hat.  
10 SENATOR CARUTH:  
11 Did they bring in any  
12 extra SCSRs?  
13 MR. J.TOLER:  
14 Yes, sir, I think they  
15 did. Yes, sir.  
16 SENATOR CARUTH:  
17 Your ventilation plan,  
18 tell me what it would require in the  
19 event of a CO2 monitor going off,  
20 showing, what is it, 26 parts per  
21 million.  
22 MR. J.TOLER:  
23 The CO alarm will  
24 initially alarm --- it will give you an  
25 alert at ten parts per million. And at

Page 390

1 that point we're required to go and  
2 check that sensor. And at 15 parts per  
3 million, we are to --- I believe we are  
4 to evacuate to that point --- to a  
5 point outby that and then check that.  
6 SENATOR CARUTH:  
7 So the alarm at 6:10  
8 indicated 26 parts per million; is that  
9 correct?  
10 MR. J.TOLER:  
11 The alarm at 6:10 I think  
12 indicated that there was --- it also  
13 indicated a malfunction.  
14 SENATOR CARUTH:  
15 Was anybody close by the  
16 alarm when it went off at 6:10?  
17 MR. J.TOLER:  
18 The alarm in the mine  
19 itself?  
20 SENATOR CARUTH:  
21 Yes.  
22 MR. J.TOLER:  
23 No, sir. That alarm that  
24 signaled, I believe, was at the section  
25 loading point on the One Left section.

Page 391

1 SENATOR CARUTH:  
2 Okay. Mr. Crumrine, you  
3 were not working that day; is that  
4 correct?  
5 MR. CRUMRINE:  
6 I was scheduled off, yes,  
7 sir.  
8 SENATOR CARUTH:  
9 And how did you first  
10 find out about the incident?  
11 MR. CRUMRINE:  
12 Bill Chisholm or somebody  
13 from the mines called my house.  
14 SENATOR CARUTH:  
15 And about what time was  
16 that?  
17 MR. CRUMRINE:  
18 I'm not sure what time  
19 they called the house. My daughter  
20 --- or my granddaughter brought me the  
21 phone and said that the mines had  
22 called. I'm thinking it was about  
23 quarter 'till 8:00 or so.  
24 SENATOR CARUTH:  
25 What time, Mr. Toler, did

Page 392

1 you finally determine that it was more  
2 than an incident, it was an explosion?  
3 MR. J.TOLER:  
4 As I said earlier, I  
5 can't say --- I couldn't determine that  
6 it was an explosion until we got to the  
7 area that we were actually --- that I  
8 saw the soot accumulate on a rib, which  
9 would have placed me probably 8:45 to  
10 9:15, something like that.  
11 SENATOR CARUTH:  
12 But you obviously knew it  
13 was a pretty serious incident prior to  
14 that, I would assume?  
15 MR. J.TOLER:  
16 Yes, sir.  
17 SENATOR CARUTH:  
18 And at what point did you  
19 feel that --- or what time was the ---  
20 I know you said this, but for  
21 clarification, what time was the mine  
22 rescue teams called?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 I did not place a call to  
25 the mine rescue team. I had a

Page 393

1 conversation with Johnny Stemple when  
2 the One Left crew --- when we were  
3 getting them to exit the mines. I was  
4 able to talk to Johnny Stemple at that  
5 point. I have no idea what time that  
6 was.  
7 SENATOR CARUTH:  
8 And there is not a mine  
9 rescue team in place at the Sago  
10 operation; is that correct?  
11 MR. J.TOLER:  
12 Not at this moment, no.  
13 SENATOR CARUTH:  
14 Still not at this moment?  
15 MR. J.TOLER:  
16 Still not at this moment,  
17 but ---.  
18 SENATOR CARUTH:  
19 Thank you, Mr. Toler.  
20 That's all I have right now, Mr.  
21 Chairman.  
22 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
23 Mr. Jamison, you had  
24 testified that you had fire bossed Two  
25 Left; is that correct?

Page 394

1 MR. JAMISON:  
2 Yes.  
3 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
4 And that was only the  
5 second time that you had fire bossed  
6 that section; is that correct?  
7 MR. JAMISON:  
8 Yes. Yes. I had done it  
9 after Christmas vacation.  
10 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
11 The first time after  
12 Christmas and then the second time,  
13 January 2nd. Why the change in where  
14 you fire bossed? Who --- where did you  
15 fire boss at --- what sections of the  
16 mine had you fire bossed prior to  
17 December 26th?  
18 MR. JAMISON:  
19 I'd just do the belts and  
20 the track. And we have section bosses  
21 on One Left and Two Left that does  
22 that.  
23 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
24 So why would you be fire  
25 bossing Two Left on those two

Page 395

1 particular days?  
2 MR. JAMISON:  
3 Because the section boss  
4 wasn't there yet.  
5 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
6 And who would have been  
7 the section boss on Two Left that day?  
8 MR. JAMISON:  
9 Well, it would have been  
10 a midnight guy who would have really  
11 got it. But since he wasn't there, I  
12 picked it up. Because he was off on  
13 New Year's break.  
14 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
15 So this wasn't like a  
16 change in --- you were just covering  
17 for somebody else because they were  
18 absent that day; correct?  
19 MR. JAMISON:  
20 Right.  
21 CHAIR:  
22 Mr. Kitts?  
23 MR. KITTS:  
24 Just as a follow-up to  
25 that ---

Page 396

1 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
2 Yes.  
3 MR. KITTS:  
4 --- question, let me  
5 clarify that the mine had been idle, so  
6 there was no third shift or midnight  
7 shift. So it wasn't like Fred was  
8 covering for somebody or changing out  
9 with someone. The mine was idle, and  
10 his ordinary routine was interrupted to  
11 go up and fire boss that production  
12 section because the mine had been idle.  
13 And that's the reason, right after  
14 Christmas, after a Christmas vacation,  
15 the mine had been idle. That's the  
16 reason for the interruption in his  
17 normal routine.  
18 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
19 Thank you, Mr. Kitts.  
20 Mr. Stemple, you had told me earlier  
21 when I asked the question about that  
22 time element between the explosion and  
23 the call that went into the Upshur  
24 County Com Center that you had no  
25 knowledge that there had been an

Page 397

1 explosion; is that correct?  
2 MR. STEMPLE:  
3 Yes. That's correct,  
4 yes.  
5 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
6 In reading some of the  
7 testimonies that's posted on the  
8 Gazette's web site, is it true that  
9 John Boni testified that he told Mr.  
10 Toler there was an explosion an hour  
11 earlier?  
12 MR. STEMPLE:  
13 I don't have any  
14 recollection or idea what John Boni  
15 told Jeff Toler.  
16 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
17 Could you address that,  
18 Mr. Toler?  
19 MR. J.TOLER:  
20 The only conversation  
21 that Mr. Boni and I had was when we  
22 passed on the track. I encountered  
23 John at a track switch around the One  
24 Right section. My main concern at that  
25 time was that John appeared --- I

Page 398

1 wanted to make sure he was okay and I  
2 wanted him to exit the mines. He did  
3 comment that he felt that it could have  
4 been an explosion that we had  
5 experienced. An explosion is not  
6 necessarily the only thing that would  
7 cause a rush of air.  
8 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
9 And was Mr. Boni on his  
10 way out of the mine when you passed  
11 ---?  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 Yes, sir. Yes, sir. He  
14 continued to exit the mine.  
15 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
16 Do you know about what  
17 time that was?  
18 MR. J.TOLER:  
19 It's after I started into  
20 the mines and before I got to the One  
21 Left crew.  
22 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
23 Could somebody explain to  
24 me what kind of an effect a barometer  
25 would have on the seals? I mean, would

Page 399

1 anybody like to take ---?  
2 MR. COLEMAN:  
3 During the times of a low  
4 barometric pressure, the volume of gas  
5 within a sealed area will expand.  
6 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
7 And what about that day?  
8 Do you have any readings or  
9 ---?  
10 MR. COLEMAN:  
11 I don't have any  
12 readings, but there was a storm front  
13 that come through there.  
14 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
15 What evidence do any of  
16 you have that the explosion came from  
17 inside of the sealed area?  
18 MR. KITTS:  
19 Well, the first evidence  
20 was collected by the mine rescue teams.  
21 When they encountered the seals during  
22 their exploration, it was clear to them  
23 that the seals had been blown outward.  
24 So at that point, it pretty much  
25 established that the explosion had

Page 400

1 occurred in by the seals, in the  
2 previously-sealed area.  
3 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
4 Is there any possibility  
5 that it could have come from directly  
6 outside the seals or that there was  
7 more than one explosion?  
8 MR. KITTS:  
9 Well, anything is likely.  
10 The investigation is ongoing. But the  
11 documentation up to this point  
12 overwhelmingly indicates that one event  
13 occurred and that the --- not only the  
14 seals but other pieces of material,  
15 including a battery charger, were  
16 picked up and pushed out by a force.  
17 So at this point, I firmly believe  
18 that the explosion originated in by the  
19 seals.  
20 DELEGATE HAMILTON:  
21 Thank you.  
22 MS. CAMPBELL:  
23 Are you ready for me,  
24 Davitt? Mr. Jamison, did you fire boss  
25 every heading from the feeder to the

Page 401

1 face? Did you fire boss every header -  
2 -- every heading from the feeder to the  
3 face?  
4 MR. JAMISON:  
5 Yes.  
6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
7 Mr. McKinney, is that  
8 protocol to do that?  
9 MR. MCKINNEY:  
10 Sorry?  
11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
12 I asked Mr. Jamison if he  
13 fire bossed every heading from the  
14 feeder to the face, and he said, yes,  
15 he did. Is it protocol to do that?  
16 MR. MCKINNEY:  
17 Yes. That's the working  
18 section.  
19 MS. CAMPBELL:  
20 I'm back to you, Mr.  
21 Stemple. What happens to a  
22 self-rescuer when it goes bad while on  
23 the miner's belt? Would it test the  
24 same as if it had been used?  
25 MR. STEMPEL:

Page 402

1 I have tested many, as we  
2 do that every 90 days. And normally,  
3 in a 90-day period, I would remove six  
4 from service that tested bad. And in  
5 the course of training, I usually open  
6 one of those up. And 99 percent of  
7 those that I opened up worked, although  
8 they tested bad. Ninety-nine (99) out  
9 of a possible hundred worked for me.  
10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
11 Did you actually test the  
12 rescuers prior to the explosion?  
13 MR. STEMPLE:  
14 I did not test the  
15 rescuers, no. I was not located at the  
16 mine.  
17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
18 Were you working for ICG  
19 at that time?  
20 MR. STEMPLE:  
21 At that time, I was  
22 working for ICG out of a division  
23 office, not at the mine site.  
24 MS. CAMPBELL:  
25 Do you know who did the

Page 403

1 testing of the rescuers 90 days prior  
2 to the explosion?  
3 MR. STEMPLE:  
4 No, ma'am, I do not.  
5 MS. CAMPBELL:  
6 Does anybody on the panel  
7 know the answer to that question, who  
8 would have done the testing on the  
9 rescuers prior to the explosion?  
10 MR. HATFIELD:  
11 We'll have to confirm  
12 that and get back to you. I'm not sure  
13 which individual had that  
14 responsibility.  
15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
16 All right. Mr. Stemple,  
17 when the indicator light changes color  
18 from blue to pink or white or whatever  
19 it does, is it possible that it can  
20 turn back to blue?  
21 MR. STEMPLE:  
22 Not to my knowledge, no.  
23 MS. CAMPBELL:  
24 Not that you're aware of?  
25 MR. STEMPLE:

Page 404

1 Not that I'm aware of,  
2 no.  
3 MS. CAMPBELL:  
4 Okay. In your testimony  
5 you said that when you called mine  
6 rescue, that the answering machine had  
7 been turned off. Is that normal  
8 procedure for an emergency mine rescue  
9 team to turn off their answering  
10 machine?  
11 MR. STEMPLE:  
12 That's the first time  
13 I've ever called mine rescue.  
14 MS. CAMPBELL:  
15 But I'm asking --- anyone  
16 on the panel, mine rescue teams should  
17 know that they are of the utmost  
18 importance when they join that team.  
19 Is that --- does anybody want to  
20 comment on that?  
21 MR. HATFIELD:  
22 I don't think anybody  
23 would suggest that it's perfectly  
24 normal for an answering machine to be  
25 turned off for a rescue service.

Page 405

1 Something clearly had malfunctioned or  
2 gone wrong on that day. We're just not  
3 sure what the rest of the story is.  
4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
5 So don't you think that  
6 maybe the mine rescue team should be on  
7 --- I mean, 24-hour call and have  
8 pagers or, you know, something in order  
9 to get ahold of them? You know, there  
10 were 13 men in that mine and an  
11 answering machine kept Mr. Stemple from  
12 getting ahold of a mine rescue team.  
13 MR. HATFIELD:  
14 I believe it delayed him  
15 for about 30 minutes for talking to  
16 them, but that's still unacceptable and  
17 I don't disagree with your point. To  
18 this point, that mine has relied on a  
19 contract providing of mine rescue  
20 services. That's commonly done in the  
21 industry, particularly with smaller  
22 mines. From ICG's perspective, we've  
23 determined that's not acceptable  
24 anymore, so that's why Mr. Toler was  
25 just explaining or referenced a few

1 minutes ago that we're now in the  
 2 position of where we're putting our own  
 3 teams in. We don't have them in place  
 4 today, but we will have our own team at  
 5 Sago and the other major mines.  
 6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 7 It's a little too late  
 8 for us now, Mr. Hatfield.  
 9 MR. HATFIELD:  
 10 I don't disagree.  
 11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 12 Are there maps of the  
 13 mine on site every day?  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 Yes, ma'am.  
 16 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 17 Like when the explosion  
 18 occurred, did you have maps on site of  
 19 the underground tunnels from the  
 20 surface that you knew where your  
 21 tunnels were underground? Did you have  
 22 those maps?  
 23 MR. J.TOLER:  
 24 Yes, ma'am.  
 25 MS. CAMPBELL:

1 And they were on site?  
 2 MR. J.TOLER:  
 3 Yes, ma'am.  
 4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 5 Yet you guys didn't know  
 6 where to drill? Whoever wants to take  
 7 it can.  
 8 MR. HATFIELD:  
 9 It's a lot more  
 10 complicated than that. What they're  
 11 referring to is GPS precision  
 12 surveying. It's not a matter of  
 13 knowing where the mine is and where the  
 14 surface is. There's a much higher  
 15 level of accuracy required when you're  
 16 putting a drill hole down 300 feet.  
 17 That's what Mr. Kitts was making  
 18 reference to in his statement.  
 19 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 20 So you have the maps,  
 21 surface and underneath; correct? But  
 22 yet you can't take those maps and  
 23 pinpoint a section or approximately  
 24 where a section is to set up a seismic  
 25 to listen for your miners that are

1 beating themselves out of air, beating  
 2 on those roof bolts?  
 3 MR. HATFIELD:  
 4 As I believe has been  
 5 explained before, the seismic equipment  
 6 isn't owned by us. It's owned by MSHA  
 7 and it's under their control as to  
 8 where it goes. And I don't know where  
 9 it was that day. But we weren't  
 10 waiting on a location to get the  
 11 seismic truck in. We were actually  
 12 doing precision surveying to get a  
 13 drill hole down. That was the priority  
 14 that we were referencing in the  
 15 statement. And it is a complicated  
 16 process. They had to bring the  
 17 controlled survey in from about two  
 18 miles away.  
 19 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 20 Mr. Stemple, what  
 21 happened to the notes that you were  
 22 taking --- you said you were standing  
 23 around, just like everyone else was  
 24 doing. Do you recall saying that in  
 25 your testimony?

1 MR. STEMPLER:  
 2 Yes, I recall saying  
 3 that.  
 4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 5 So was everyone just  
 6 standing around that morning, as you  
 7 said in your testimony?  
 8 MR. STEMPLER:  
 9 When I arrived at the  
 10 mine, it was very confusing. There  
 11 were at least 80 people at the mine,  
 12 many of who I've never seen before in  
 13 my life. I didn't know who was in  
 14 charge or where to report to or what to  
 15 do. It was very confusing.  
 16 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 17 Who was in charge? Can  
 18 anyone tell me that?  
 19 MR. COLEMAN:  
 20 The command structure  
 21 within a mine emergency operation is  
 22 within a three-part input, which  
 23 consists of MSHA, the State of West  
 24 Virginia Office of Miners' Health,  
 25 Safety and Training and ICG.

Page 410

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
2 Who was in charge before  
3 MSHA or the state got there?  
4 MR. KITTS:  
5 It would have been local  
6 mine management.  
7 MS. CAMPBELL:  
8 Pardon me?  
9 MR. KITTS:  
10 It would have been Jeff  
11 Toler. Jeff was in charge of the mine.  
12 And then Raymond Coleman and Chuck  
13 Dunbar and other folks were arriving to  
14 address the problem. Eventually, on  
15 the ICG side, it was me. And then  
16 eventually Ben Hatfield came on site.  
17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
18 Mr. Toler, Mr. Wilfong,  
19 Mr. Schoonover and Mr. Hofer were  
20 underground trying to rescue these  
21 miners. So who would have been in  
22 charge, since these men were busy  
23 trying to save their lives?  
24 MR. KITTS:  
25 Who would have been in

Page 411

1 charge on the surface?  
2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
3 That's correct. Who  
4 would have been in charge --- had Mr.  
5 Toler --- since Mr. Toler was  
6 underground, and I'm sure the  
7 dispatcher knew that --- okay? You  
8 follow me so far?  
9 MR. KITTS:  
10 Yes.  
11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
12 Mr. Toler was  
13 underground. He was trying to rescue  
14 these men, which I appreciate that,  
15 Mr. Toler, I do, that you and those men  
16 tried to do that for us. What I'm  
17 asking you is, somebody, the dispatcher  
18 or somebody should have gotten someone  
19 else there who would have been in  
20 charge, since Mr. Toler was trying to  
21 save these men's lives.  
22 MR. KITTS:  
23 Well, we had --- the  
24 dispatcher was performing his duties.  
25 He was on the phone with Mr. Stemple,

Page 412

1 making the notifications. Early on the  
2 process, the K Order was issued. So the  
3 K Order specifically states that no one  
4 goes into the mine. It basically  
5 freezes the activities there. And I  
6 think the MSHA and the state people  
7 were coming on site, and at that point  
8 there was a collection of people there  
9 on the surface. And I think that's  
10 what Johnny is referring to, was it  
11 probably took some time to get  
12 organized as to who is doing what. But  
13 all during this time the K Order is in  
14 place.  
15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
16 So once Mr. Toler and  
17 those other gentlemen were already  
18 underground, then they had no  
19 communication, good communication, to  
20 the outside because they were trying to  
21 do this rescue, they were trying to  
22 hang curtains to give these men air.  
23 Who would have been --- would Mr.  
24 Stemple have been the man that should  
25 have come in instead of staying home

Page 413

1 and making all those phone calls or  
2 who? That's all I'm asking.  
3 MR. KITTS:  
4 Mr. Crumrine. He was the  
5 mine foreman.  
6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
7 Pardon me?  
8 MR. KITTS:  
9 Mr. Crumrine.  
10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
11 And where were you, Mr.  
12 Crumrine?  
13 MR. CRUMRINE:  
14 Once I received the word,  
15 I came to the mine. I talked to Jeff  
16 briefly. He wanted me to check the  
17 ventilation. I put my belt on and was  
18 heading in the mines. Mr. Collins come  
19 in, asked me what had happened. I said  
20 that I don't know. There's been an  
21 incident. We haven't had any contact  
22 with the Two Left crew. He said, I'm  
23 issuing a control order that I am ---  
24 you know, I'm now in control basically.  
25 You're not to go in the coal mines.



Page 414

1 Then he started calling people.  
2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
3 Mr. Coleman, I never did  
4 get --- understand what your duties  
5 were that day. Could you explain that  
6 to me?  
7 MR. COLEMAN:  
8 I was the ICG  
9 representative in the command center  
10 concerning mine emergency operations.  
11 MS. CAMPBELL:  
12 So you were there that  
13 morning, too?  
14 MR. COLEMAN:  
15 Yes, ma'am. I arrived on  
16 site approximately 8:15, 8:30.  
17 MS. CAMPBELL:  
18 This one is a little  
19 difficult for me, so --- this comes  
20 from Mr. McCloy's letter; okay? Mr.  
21 McCloy reported that he and Martin  
22 Toler hit a methane pocket while they  
23 were in --- drilling in the roof. Who  
24 was that reported to and where was it  
25 at?

Page 415

1 MR. J.TOLER:  
2 That would have been on  
3 the working section, on the Two Left  
4 section. It happened a couple weeks  
5 before the incident. Junior called out  
6 and told me what he had found. I asked  
7 him what he had done, and he told me  
8 what --- that he had --- or now he'd  
9 de-energize the equipment. I notified  
10 Ty Coleman and discussed it with Ty.  
11 And after a discussion with Ty, it was  
12 determined that at the --- it was a  
13 liberation of methane. That it was  
14 never allowed to accumulate. The  
15 ventilating current was sweeping the  
16 air --- the gas out of there. And we  
17 initially  
18 --- we plugged the hole, so to speak.  
19 We stopped it.  
20 MS. CAMPBELL:  
21 You plugged it with what?  
22 MR. J.TOLER:  
23 A stick of resin that  
24 typically goes into a roof bolt hole.  
25 MS. CAMPBELL:

Page 416

1 Do you have any idea what  
2 readings they got out of that methane  
3 pocket?  
4 MR. J.TOLER:  
5 Excuse me?  
6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
7 Do you have any idea how  
8 much methane that was that registered?  
9 MR. J.TOLER:  
10 I think they reported  
11 --- right at the hole, coming out of  
12 the hole I think they reported five  
13 percent.  
14 MS. CAMPBELL:  
15 And I'm not sure which  
16 one of them said that if they had  
17 gotten a four-percent reading, they  
18 would have been alarmed. And you had a  
19 five-percent reading there. Was that  
20 not cause for alarm?  
21 MR. COLEMAN:  
22 If I may?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 Go ahead.  
25 MR. COLEMAN:

Page 417

1 That was a liberation.  
2 And his answer was that the test was  
3 taken right against the hole, the base  
4 of the hole, within --- taking it  
5 within 12 inches of the roof face of  
6 rib, which included the hole. It was  
7 significantly less. Correct me if I'm  
8 wrong, Jeff. I believe it was less  
9 than two-tenths.  
10 MR. J.TOLER:  
11 Yes. That's correct.  
12 MS. CAMPBELL:  
13 I'm sorry. Maybe I don't  
14 understand liberated methane. Could  
15 you explain that to me?  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 Right at the --- where  
18 the hole was actually being drilled  
19 within --- right at the roof level,  
20 that is where the high concentration of  
21 CH<sub>4</sub> was detected. But if you moved  
22 your detector away from the hole to  
23 within 12 inches of the hole, the  
24 concentration was dissipated down to a  
25 .2 percent. So the ventilating current

1 was doing what it was supposed to do.  
 2 It was dissipating the gas.  
 3 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 4 That 12 inches is  
 5 considered a diffusion area, so that  
 6 will allow the methane to be diluted  
 7 and rendered harmless.  
 8 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 9 Well, is that normal  
 10 practice to plug the hole with glue or  
 11 resin or whatever you ---?  
 12 MR. J.TOLER:  
 13 Yes, ma'am, it is.  
 14 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 15 Could the bolter have  
 16 ignited that pocket and slowly gotten  
 17 into the seal through a crack or  
 18 something?  
 19 MR. J.TOLER:  
 20 No.  
 21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 22 And how do you know that?  
 23 MR. J.TOLER:  
 24 There wouldn't have been  
 25 enough oxygen.

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 2 Not enough oxygen?  
 3 MR. J.TOLER:  
 4 Not in the hole, no.  
 5 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 6 Thank you.  
 7 MS. COHEN:  
 8 Can one of you describe  
 9 the areas of the mine where the seals  
 10 were built? Was it a wet area, a dry  
 11 area? I understand that the roof was  
 12 bad. That's why you determined to seal  
 13 that area; is that correct?  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 I'm sorry. I only heard  
 16 about half of what you're saying.  
 17 MS. COHEN:  
 18 I said can you describe  
 19 the conditions around the sealed area  
 20 before you sealed it?  
 21 MR. J.TOLER:  
 22 Where the seals were  
 23 constructed themselves, it was ---  
 24 there was some --- very little wet  
 25 conditions there, mostly dry. But the

1 reason we decided to seal the area was  
 2 the condition of the area deeper into  
 3 the sealed area.  
 4 MS. COHEN:  
 5 And that was the roof,  
 6 from my understanding?  
 7 MR. J.TOLER:  
 8 Roof and water.  
 9 MS. COHEN:  
 10 Okay. Prior to the  
 11 explosion, were the fans operated  
 12 continuously, without interruption?  
 13 MR. J.TOLER:  
 14 Yes, ma'am.  
 15 MS. COHEN:  
 16 The walkie-talkies that  
 17 the Two Left crew have, where are they?  
 18 MR. J.TOLER:  
 19 They'd be in possession  
 20 of MSHA right now.  
 21 MS. COHEN:  
 22 And Mr. Hatfield, the  
 23 rescue team workers got debriefed  
 24 before the families. You were  
 25 comfortable with that. Why did that

1 happen?  
 2 MR. HATFIELD:  
 3 I didn't feel like we had  
 4 a choice. It wasn't a matter of being  
 5 comfortable with it. I didn't feel  
 6 like we had information that we could  
 7 feel was valid to carry to the  
 8 families.  
 9 MS. COHEN:  
 10 Do you think that by  
 11 putting up the curtains to re-establish  
 12 the air, that it pushed the bad air  
 13 back to the Two Left section?  
 14 MR. J.TOLER:  
 15 No, ma'am. I have no  
 16 reason to believe that would have  
 17 caused that.  
 18 MS. COHEN:  
 19 And when were the belts  
 20 started, Mr. Jamison? Could you answer  
 21 that, please?  
 22 MR. JAMISON:  
 23 I don't know exactly what  
 24 time he started them. But he didn't  
 25 start them until we come out. MR.

Page 422

1 HATFIELD:  
2 I believe we reported to  
3 you earlier in a previous written  
4 correspondence that they started around  
5 6:00 a.m. sequentially from outside  
6 moving in, and all the main line belts  
7 were running by approximately 6:10.  
8 MS. COHEN:  
9 Is there a written  
10 emergency manual or procedure manual  
11 that describes everybody's  
12 responsibilities at the mine? Like  
13 when you have a disaster like this, do  
14 you guys have a manual that you can  
15 pull out and look and see who's  
16 responsible for what?  
17 MR. J.TOLER:  
18 Yes.  
19 MS. COHEN:  
20 Did you guys pull that  
21 manual on January 2nd?  
22 MR. STEMPLE:  
23 I can answer that. Yes,  
24 I did. We call it our crisis  
25 management plan. It's not a required

Page 423

1 plan. It's something that we developed  
2 on our own, and it tells you what to do  
3 as far as patrolling the gate,  
4 assigning an area for the families to  
5 assemble, assigning an area for the  
6 mine rescue teams to assemble, an area  
7 for the media to assemble, where to get  
8 food, phone numbers of restaurants in  
9 the area and motels in the area, that  
10 type of thing.  
11 MS. COHEN:  
12 And where is it generally  
13 kept?  
14 MR. STEMPLE:  
15 I keep a copy with me. We  
16 keep a copy in the safety department.  
17 MS. COHEN:  
18 And that would be at the  
19 mines, on the grounds of the mine  
20 itself?  
21 MR. STEMPLE:  
22 Yes, ma'am.  
23 MS. COHEN:  
24 Is it accessible to  
25 everybody? Does everybody have access

Page 424

1 to that?  
2 MR. STEMPLE:  
3 Yes, ma'am. It's posted.  
4 MS. COHEN:  
5 Is there any way we can  
6 get a copy of that manual to review?  
7 MR. STEMPLE:  
8 Yes, ma'am.  
9 MS. COHEN:  
10 Are all the fire bosses  
11 certified in that they have taken their  
12 gas test?  
13 MR. STEMPLE:  
14 Yes, ma'am.  
15 MS. COHEN:  
16 Mr. Kitts, did you say  
17 the first rescue teams entered the mine  
18 at 5:25 on 1/2, p.m.?  
19 MR. KITTS:  
20 Did the first rescue  
21 teams enter the mine at 5:25 p.m.?  
22 Yes.  
23 MS. COHEN:  
24 Because the time line  
25 indicates that it was 5:51 p.m. that

Page 425

1 we've seen.  
2 MR. KITTS:  
3 Yes, ma'am. We're still  
4 seeing the same sorts of discrepancies.  
5 People have different recollections.  
6 And as part of the investigation  
7 process, we're trying to resolve those  
8 discrepancies. So it's common for us  
9 to have several different times for the  
10 same event, and we're trying to get  
11 those resolved.  
12 MS. COHEN:  
13 Can one of you tell me  
14 how long it took to drill those five  
15 boreholes over the sealed section? Did  
16 it take as long as it did to drill the  
17 hole to get to the Two Left section?  
18 MR. KITTS:  
19 I'm having a hard time  
20 hearing you. Could you repeat it?  
21 MS. COHEN:  
22 The five boreholes that  
23 you drilled over the sealed area now,  
24 how long did it take you guys to map  
25 those out and drill them? Did it take

1 as long as it did to drill the one to  
 2 try to save my dad and the other  
 3 miners?  
 4 MR. KITTS:  
 5 No. It took much longer.  
 6 MS. COHEN:  
 7 Because they --- go  
 8 ahead. I'm sorry.  
 9 MR. KITTS:  
 10 Well, the effort that  
 11 those people made to get the hole down  
 12 in the time that they did, despite the  
 13 delays and the unfortunate outcome, was  
 14 exceptional. And I know that doesn't  
 15 make you all feel any better. But  
 16 compared to how long it normally takes  
 17 to set a drill and hit a place that's  
 18 only 20 feet wide and do it  
 19 successfully on the first try was a  
 20 remarkable effort. But ordinarily you  
 21 can take four to five days to drill a  
 22 hole in that manner. And the holes  
 23 that we drilled were different  
 24 diameters. One hole was a 24-inch  
 25 diameter, so it took considerably

1 longer than the hole we put down into  
 2 the Two Left face.  
 3 MS. COHEN:  
 4 Do you guys know when the  
 5 SCSRs that you have were manufactured?  
 6 MR. STEMPLE:  
 7 Yes.  
 8 MS. COHEN:  
 9 And what year is that?  
 10 MR. STEMPLE:  
 11 They were manufactured in  
 12 different months and different years.  
 13 Each one has that stamped on the side  
 14 of it, and MSHA has those in their  
 15 possession at this time.  
 16 MS. COHEN:  
 17 And who is usually  
 18 responsible for testing those? Is that  
 19 something you do, Mr. Stemple?  
 20 MR. STEMPLE:  
 21 We do that in the safety  
 22 department. We will train certain  
 23 people to test those, and then we keep  
 24 a record of that in the safety  
 25 department. And those records were

1 turned over to MSHA, the testing, these  
 2 90-day checks.  
 3 MS. COHEN:  
 4 And can someone --- I  
 5 have copies of the citations from  
 6 March. Can someone explain to me where  
 7 the number four and number eight  
 8 charger are?  
 9 MR. KITTS:  
 10 I'm sorry. Number four  
 11 and number eight charger?  
 12 MS. COHEN:  
 13 Uh-huh (yes).  
 14 MR. KITTS:  
 15 Carl, can you speak to  
 16 that?  
 17 MR. CRUMRINE:  
 18 I am not familiar with  
 19 the numbers, just the location.  
 20 MR. KITTS:  
 21 Is that a particular  
 22 citation?  
 23 MS. COHEN:  
 24 Uh-huh (yes). Right  
 25 here.

1 MR. KITTS:  
 2 If you'll give me the  
 3 citation numbers, we can ---.  
 4 MS. COHEN:  
 5 They were given to Dick  
 6 Wilfong on March 31st.  
 7 MR. KITTS:  
 8 If we could just get a  
 9 copy of those citations, we can follow  
 10 up with you. Or we can look at it  
 11 right now. Both these chargers were on  
 12 the surface outside the mine.  
 13 MS. COHEN:  
 14 They're on the surface?  
 15 MR. KITTS:  
 16 Yes, ma'am.  
 17 MS. COHEN:  
 18 Where at on the surface?  
 19 MR. KITTS:  
 20 I'm going to assume that  
 21 --- well, you probably know, Jeff.  
 22 MR. J.TOLER:  
 23 They would have been in  
 24 the building we have constructed to  
 25 park our mantrips in. Those were

Page 430

1 obviously mantrip chargers.  
2 MR. KITTS:  
3 It would have been done  
4 in the pit.  
5 MR. J.TOLER:  
6 Down in the pit, yes.  
7 MS. COHEN:  
8 Mr. Jamison, if you  
9 didn't take any notes --- at some point  
10 you said you did document some notes.  
11 And when I originally asked you the  
12 question you said you didn't document  
13 anything because everything looked  
14 good. Then how does anyone know what  
15 the velocity of the air was in that  
16 section, in Two Left?  
17 MR. JAMISON:  
18 It's in the book.  
19 MS. COHEN:  
20 And can I ask why the  
21 families were not contacted and  
22 informed --- be informed about the  
23 explosion? I know we've heard over and  
24 over that we were. But I personally  
25 know that there was nothing on my

Page 431

1 caller ID and several families ---  
2 MS. CAMPBELL:  
3 Mike told us that he  
4 didn't even have a phone number four my  
5 sister, but yet they called him to  
6 work.  
7 MS. COHEN:  
8 Whose responsibility was  
9 that, according to your manual, to  
10 contact the families?  
11 MR. STEMPLE:  
12 To notify the families,  
13 it would be the human resource  
14 department.  
15 MS. COHEN:  
16 And do they have the  
17 numbers accessible to them to be able  
18 to contact us?  
19 MR. STEMPLE:  
20 When you begin work, you  
21 fill out forms for emergency  
22 notification, and you put that  
23 emergency notification number on the  
24 form that you fill out when you begin  
25 work.

Page 432

1 MS. COHEN:  
2 Okay. And that still  
3 doesn't explain why none of us were  
4 called. I had to find out from a  
5 friend that works on EMS that my dad  
6 was --- there was an explosion at his  
7 mine. Do you consider that good  
8 protocol?  
9 MR. HATFIELD:  
10 There's nothing good  
11 about failing to call the families in a  
12 crisis of that situation, so we don't  
13 suggest that it's good. But all the  
14 information I've received confirms that  
15 our people made a  
16 good-faith effort to reach the  
17 families. In some cases, they did not  
18 have phone numbers. But we can follow  
19 up with specifics. You've asked a  
20 reasonable question. I'll get you a  
21 written explanation as to who was  
22 called and what numbers they were  
23 relying on.  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 Well, Mr. Heims

Page 433

1 (phonetic), when I had to go into the  
2 classroom to find out if my dad truly  
3 was one of the miners trapped, said  
4 --- he told me what number he called,  
5 and that was my father's house, and I  
6 was there. And he said he left a  
7 message, and there was no message.  
8 MR. HATFIELD:  
9 I cannot explain that. I  
10 don't know. I don't know what the  
11 situation was.  
12 MS. COHEN:  
13 That's understandable.  
14 But I think that that's something you  
15 guys need to check into because I think  
16 it's pretty inhumane for me to have to  
17 find out about my father through a  
18 friend that works on EMS.  
19 MR. HATFIELD:  
20 Again, I don't disagree.  
21 But I'm told that we tried to contact  
22 everyone, and I'm not sure where the  
23 failures were, but we'll look into it.  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 Is it true that the

Page 434

1 company undermined the sealed area to  
2 produce additional coal before they  
3 sealed it?  
4 MR. J.TOLER:  
5 I'm sorry, could you  
6 repeat that?  
7 MS. COHEN:  
8 Is it true that the  
9 company undermined the sealed area to  
10 produce additional coal before sealing  
11 that area?  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 Yes, ma'am, we did.  
14 MS. COHEN:  
15 And there were several  
16 metal objects, such as roof bolts, pipe  
17 hands and even a pump left in the  
18 sealed area?  
19 MR. HATFIELD:  
20 Let's back up and clarify  
21 that point. You're asking about the  
22 second mining that was done within the  
23 sealed area?  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 Yes.

Page 435

1 MR. HATFIELD:  
2 Yes, there was retreat  
3 mining done in the sealed area where  
4 they mined the bottom bench, but they  
5 stopped short of where the seals were  
6 constructed.  
7 MS. COHEN:  
8 Okay. And then the roof  
9 bolts and the pipe hands and the pump  
10 that was left back in that sealed area,  
11 if there was a roof fall back in that  
12 sealed area, could those have sparked?  
13 MR. HATFIELD:  
14 I don't think anyone in  
15 the industry removes roof bolts and  
16 pipe hands. Retrieval of roof bolts  
17 stopped three decades ago because it's  
18 not safe for the men. But with respect  
19 to the pump, I am told that that pump  
20 was under 12 feet of water and three  
21 feet of mud and was impossible to  
22 salvage, so they simply cut the cable  
23 and abandoned the pump.  
24 MS. COHEN:  
25 Do you know, Mr.

Page 436

1 Hatfield, why this mine was closed for  
2 a year or two before re-opening in  
3 2004?  
4 MR. HATFIELD:  
5 That predates my  
6 knowledge of anything at this point.  
7 One can only assume that if the mine  
8 wasn't cost effective, they couldn't  
9 make any money there, and they closed  
10 it. But I didn't have any involvement  
11 with the mine at that time.  
12 MS. COHEN:  
13 Does any of you know why  
14 it was closed? And is it a  
15 cost-effective mine now?  
16 MR. HATFIELD:  
17 Actually, no, it  
18 continues to lose money. But we  
19 believe that it can be made a  
20 profitable mine and a safe mine.  
21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
22 What was your reasoning  
23 for drilling the holes, you know, to  
24 begin with? What reason did you drill  
25 the holes for? Because that took a lot

Page 437

1 of time.  
2 MR. KITTS:  
3 We knew from Jeff Toler's  
4 testimony that we had a problem at the  
5 mouth of Two Left.  
6 MS. CAMPBELL:  
7 I'm sorry, you had what?  
8 MR. KITTS:  
9 We had a problem. We had  
10 smoke and something happened at the  
11 mouth of Two Left. At this point,  
12 early Monday morning, that's all that  
13 we knew. So the thought process was  
14 that, hopefully, the Two Left crew was  
15 on the other side of that, and that if  
16 we could establish a data point, if you  
17 will, up there in the face of Two Left  
18 and check the mine atmosphere, drop a  
19 camera into the hole and be able to see  
20 what's there and also give anybody in  
21 there an opportunity to sound the  
22 still, then we would have a much better  
23 idea of how to direct the mine rescue  
24 teams as they advanced.  
25 MS. CAMPBELL:

1 So you drilled the holes  
 2 in order to drop a camera, is that what  
 3 you just said? Because maybe I just  
 4 spaced out on that. I'm sorry.  
 5 MR. KITTS:  
 6 Well, there were three  
 7 reasons. One was the camera, so that  
 8 you can get an image of what's there.  
 9 Is it covered in soot? Is there  
 10 explosion damage all over? Maybe the  
 11 explosion originated in those spaces.  
 12 At that time, we didn't know. So  
 13 that's one reason. The other reason  
 14 was to check the atmosphere. Do you  
 15 have a lot of methane there? Do you  
 16 have a lot of CO? Are you dealing with  
 17 a mine fire? Do you have a methane  
 18 issue, some sort of methane buildup  
 19 that could be explosive? Again, at  
 20 this point, we are trying to assess the  
 21 safety of the mine rescue teams, along  
 22 with the rescue effort. So we're  
 23 struggling with the decision to send  
 24 the team in. And if we could know if  
 25 there was an explosive range there or

1 not, then that would have a direct  
 2 bearing on the rate of advance of the  
 3 mine rescue teams. But ---.  
 4 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 5 And did you --- I'm  
 6 sorry, go ahead.  
 7 MR. KITTS:  
 8 But the third reason, and  
 9 the most important reason, and let me  
 10 be clear about that, is if you get that  
 11 hold down and you get a response, then  
 12 the whole game changes and the whole  
 13 complexion changes. Because at that  
 14 point you can communicate. You can  
 15 pump air down the hole. Without any  
 16 communication, you could be pumping air  
 17 into an area, and that is something you  
 18 alluded to earlier, that you could  
 19 actually be pushing bad air on top of  
 20 that crew. So the prime reason for  
 21 drilling that hole was hoping that we  
 22 could establish a line of  
 23 communication.  
 24 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 25 So when you drilled the

1 hole and you didn't hear anything from  
 2 underground, did you just assume that  
 3 they were dead?  
 4 MR. KITTS:  
 5 No, ma'am. We assumed  
 6 they weren't there.  
 7 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 8 You assumed they were not  
 9 at the face? Is that where you drilled  
 10 the hole? You drilled ---.  
 11 MR. KITTS:  
 12 They were not in an area  
 13 --- they were not able to get to that  
 14 borehole when it penetrated the mine.  
 15 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 16 What was your methane  
 17 reading that came out of that hole?  
 18 MR. KITTS:  
 19 It was low. It was less  
 20 than one ---.  
 21 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 22 It was very low, which  
 23 means it wasn't explosive; right?  
 24 MR. KITTS:  
 25 That's correct.

1 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 2 So since you didn't get  
 3 an explosive reading on methane, why  
 4 did you not --- why was mine rescue not  
 5 sent in there from Two Left, where Mr.  
 6 Toler and the rest of those gentlemen  
 7 had made it, 2,000 feet from these men?  
 8 MR. KITTS:  
 9 It was. The mine rescue  
 10 protocol was modified and stretched,  
 11 and the communication lines were  
 12 stretched beyond protocol in order to  
 13 expedite the team to get up there.  
 14 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 15 I guess you misunderstood  
 16 me, Mr. Kitts. Mr. Toler testified  
 17 that he was 2,000 feet from where those  
 18 men were found. He was never under  
 19 apparatus.  
 20 MR. KITTS:  
 21 That was 23 hours before  
 22 the hole penetrated the mine.  
 23 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 24 But Barbour County was on  
 25 site at 9:30.

Page 442

1 MR. KITTS:  
2 About that, yes.  
3 MS. CAMPBELL:  
4 Then why couldn't they go  
5 in?  
6 MR. KITTS:  
7 Well, that gets back to  
8 the K Order. That gets back to the  
9 heart of this issue in that ---.  
10 MS. CAMPBELL:  
11 You have human life  
12 underground and you have a K Order, and  
13 Mr. Toler tells us that he was 2,000  
14 feet from where they found those men  
15 and they were never under apparatus,  
16 and yet you let a K Order keep somebody  
17 from going in and rescuing 12 men.  
18 That is just unacceptable in my book.  
19  
20 MR. KITTS:  
21 I don't blame you.  
22 MS. COHEN:  
23 Mr. Hatfield, is there a  
24 reason why you tried to call the State  
25 Police and the clergy, to have them

Page 443

1 communicate? Was that the reason?  
2 Were you going to have them do your job  
3 to tell us that there was a  
4 miscommunication?  
5 MR. HATFIELD:  
6 It was on the advice of  
7 many people around me that we elected  
8 to try to get that word over quickly to  
9 the families. There was no phone.  
10 To actually leave the command center  
11 and drive over there through that huge  
12 crowd of people that had gathered would  
13 have consumed about an hour. In  
14 hindsight, yes, that's exactly what I  
15 would do if I had it to do over again.  
16 But at that point, we had new  
17 information coming in. We were trying  
18 to debrief the rescue team on exactly  
19 who was alive, who was not alive. We  
20 didn't know the identity of our  
21 survivor. We didn't know much of  
22 anything. So we were trying to get  
23 information. And it was thought that  
24 we could simply get word to the  
25 families that we have conflicting

Page 444

1 information. The earlier reports may  
2 have been too optimistic. That's all we  
3 know at this point. We tried to do  
4 that and it did not work well. I don't  
5 disagree with you.  
6 MS. COHEN:  
7 And you talked about the  
8 crowd. You guys made it through the  
9 crowd. Every briefing that you gave us  
10 for the 41 hours, we sat in the church.  
11 MR. HATFIELD:  
12 At that hour of the  
13 evening, as you'll recall, the crowd  
14 probably doubled from what we were  
15 dealing with most of the day.  
16 MS. COHEN:  
17 Yeah, I'm quite aware of  
18 the crowd. But you had troopers.  
19 People move for troopers. There was no  
20 reason you couldn't have got through  
21 the crowd or someone. If people were  
22 standing around, there is no reason  
23 someone could not have come over there  
24 to tell us the truth.  
25 MR. HATFIELD:

Page 445

1 As I have said many  
2 times, if I had it to do over again, I  
3 would do exactly that. But at the time  
4 we made the decision, we didn't know  
5 how soon we would have answers. I was  
6 trying to get answers for the family.  
7 That was what our focus was 100 percent  
8 of the time.  
9 MS. COHEN:  
10 And how much attempt was  
11 made to try to contact the Two Left  
12 crew, because according to the  
13 transcript, their trolley phone on  
14 their manbus was not even working when  
15 they went in.  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 The Two Left crew, we  
18 attempted to call them through the mine  
19 phone throughout the day. All day long  
20 we were trying to page inside to get  
21 them. As we now know, the antenna wire  
22 for the trolley phones and the cable  
23 that carries signal on the mine phones,  
24 all that was destroyed in the  
25 explosion.



1 MS. COHEN:  
 2 Speaking of the  
 3 explosion, all the briefings that we  
 4 have we hear minor damage. I have sat  
 5 and cried over these transcripts and  
 6 read the transcripts, including some of  
 7 the One Left crew saying how they lost  
 8 their hats, how they were blown off  
 9 their manbus. Can you explain to me  
 10 why we were told there was minor  
 11 damage? Reading these transcripts, it  
 12 sounds like there was a whole lot of  
 13 damage, because the One Left crew  
 14 couldn't even take their manbus back  
 15 out because it was blocked from debris,  
 16 according to the transcripts.

17 MR. J.TOLER:  
 18 I can't answer why that  
 19 is in their transcripts. What I can,  
 20 from my perspective, I only talked to  
 21 one man that morning. I'm sorry I  
 22 didn't talk to all of them. But once I  
 23 was aware that there was a situation,  
 24 my focus was getting in there and  
 25 trying to assess what had happened.

1 MR. HATFIELD:  
 2 Your reference to minor  
 3 damage probably comes from some of my  
 4 comments to the family during our  
 5 briefings. I think it's all a matter  
 6 of context. The debris that stopped  
 7 the Second Left crew from coming out  
 8 was not widespread debris. It was an  
 9 overcast essentially that collapsed on  
 10 the track, a single structure. We  
 11 didn't even get to that point until  
 12 late on the second day. So what we  
 13 were seeing as the mine rescue teams  
 14 were advancing throughout Monday  
 15 evening and Tuesday was what we would  
 16 generally characterize as relatively  
 17 minor damage to stoppings, some  
 18 partially damaged, some blown  
 19 completely over. But we didn't see  
 20 extensive damage until we got all the  
 21 way to the mouth of the Second Left.  
 22 And then it was specifically focused on  
 23 ventilation structures that were  
 24 damaged.

25 MS. COHEN:

1 Mr. Toler, when you were  
 2 --- in your testimony you said that you  
 3 guys heard something. Can you describe  
 4 what you heard?

5 MR. J.TOLER:  
 6 It could have been a  
 7 noise like a piece of rock that maybe  
 8 just fell from the roof to the floor  
 9 and, you know, it --- I might have  
 10 heard something off in one direction  
 11 and, you know, holding onto hope that  
 12 that's what --- that it might have been  
 13 them, I would go as far as I could in  
 14 that direction and just yell for them.  
 15 And then we may have sat there for a  
 16 few more minutes and hear another piece  
 17 of debris fall in another direction,  
 18 and I would again go in that direction  
 19 and yell for them.

20 MS. COHEN:  
 21 Mr. Hatfield, when the  
 22 rescue --- well, I guess this could go  
 23 to any of you. When the rescue process  
 24 started, did you guys think that the  
 25 men were already dead? Is that why you

1 took so long to get the rescue workers  
 2 in there to find our men?

3 MR. KITTS:  
 4 Absolutely not.  
 5 MR. HATFIELD:  
 6 No.

7 MR. J.TOLER:  
 8 Absolutely not.  
 9 MS. COHEN:  
 10 That's all I have.

11 CHAIR:  
 12 The panel --- we would  
 13 like to ask a few questions from here.  
 14 What I propose is that we continue  
 15 with the questions, to finish some  
 16 clarifying questions and complete this  
 17 panel today, but ask that you would  
 18 come back tomorrow if there are  
 19 additional questions, but we try to get  
 20 closure of this panel. And then if  
 21 there are other questions that arise,  
 22 that we would have an opportunity to  
 23 submit those. But now I'd ask Mr.  
 24 Clair and Mr. McKinney to submit  
 25 questions.

Page 450

1 MR. MCKINNEY:  
2 I'd just like to clarify  
3 the notification process and exactly  
4 when people determined there was an  
5 explosion underground, because I'm  
6 struggling a little bit with that right  
7 now. Mr. Coleman, at what point in  
8 time did you know that there was an  
9 explosion underground?  
10 MR. COLEMAN:  
11 After Mr. Toler came  
12 outside.  
13 MR. MCKINNEY:  
14 And approximately what  
15 time was that?  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 I think I exited the  
18 mines at approximately 10:30 a.m.  
19 MR. MCKINNEY:  
20 Mr. Stemple indicated he  
21 did not know it until the mine rescue  
22 team went into the sealed area. So was  
23 there a briefing, a communication  
24 between company personnel to share  
25 information and have an understanding

Page 451

1 of what occurred underground by the  
2 people that were on the property?  
3 MR. COLEMAN:  
4 I mean, during the  
5 briefing we took the information and we  
6 ascertained or determined from it as  
7 best we could. I mean, we figured that  
8 due to the stoppings, that we had had  
9 some type of event that had produced  
10 pressure, either from a large roof fall  
11 or from an explosion, which both could  
12 produce the same type of  
13 characteristics.  
14 MR. MCKINNEY:  
15 I don't think you'll have  
16 smoke, as a rule, from a roof fall. I  
17 don't think the stoppings that we  
18 talked about losing, those type of  
19 things --- I'm not --- I'm just  
20 pointing, as I listened to everyone  
21 talk, at what point in time we truly  
22 knew we had an explosion, how we began  
23 that process and started assessing the  
24 situation and assigning roles and  
25 identities to people doing things. I'm

Page 452

1 trying to get to that point as a basis  
2 before I move on to the next step. I  
3 guess, Mr. Toler, you indicated you  
4 came out at 10:30 a.m.?  
5 MR. J.TOLER:  
6 That's correct.  
7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
8 Mr. Kitts, you indicated  
9 that there was a K Order issued at  
10 8:30, and everything froze at the mine?  
11 MR. KITTS:  
12 Yes.  
13 MR. MCKINNEY:  
14 What froze?  
15 MR. KITTS:  
16 Any additional activity.  
17 The K Order was not --- Jeff Toler and  
18 his men were not aware of the K, but  
19 any additional entry into the mine was  
20 what I meant, that no one else was  
21 allowed inside after that point.  
22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
23 But there was work  
24 ongoing underground during that period  
25 of time? I wanted to clarify that.

Page 453

1 MR. KITTS:  
2 Yes. The efforts of Jeff  
3 Toler were ongoing after the 8:30 and  
4 K.  
5 MR. MCKINNEY:  
6 Mr. Toler, you indicated  
7 that at some point in time, when you  
8 got to 49 block or some location there,  
9 that you had dense smoke and you had  
10 ventilation controls that were out and  
11 you had concerns about outby controls.  
12 And I thought you said earlier that  
13 you had a concern about a potential  
14 fire and you didn't want to continue to  
15 try to push air into that area.  
16 MR. J.TOLER:  
17 You have to understand  
18 that we're running every possible  
19 scenario through our minds. And that  
20 was one scenario, that if the place  
21 were on fire or if there was still an  
22 explosive level of methane in an area  
23 and we pushed the fresh air into it, we  
24 created the potential for another  
25 explosive atmosphere.

1 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 2 Did you have the same  
 3 concerns about moving smoke through  
 4 areas you had not been in?  
 5 MR. J.TOLER:  
 6 Initially, I would have  
 7 to say --- I would have to answer no  
 8 because we continued to push in. But  
 9 as I said, you know, when we reached  
 10 this --- when we reached this point,  
 11 that's when we really got into a  
 12 significant amount of smoke. And  
 13 that's when we started running the  
 14 what-ifs through our mind.  
 15 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 16 I think you also  
 17 indicated that you were in fresh air.  
 18 Did anybody that was on your initial  
 19 rescue team have to seek medical  
 20 attention?  
 21 MR. J.TOLER:  
 22 No one that entered the  
 23 mine with me that morning had to seek  
 24 medical attention, to my knowledge.  
 25 MR. MCKINNEY:

1 I was thinking I read in  
 2 a transcript where there was a person  
 3 that went to the doctor due to high CO  
 4 concentrations.  
 5 MR. J.TOLER:  
 6 That's --- possibly that  
 7 might have been Owen Jones, and that  
 8 might have been a result of his being  
 9 in the mines when the explosion  
 10 happened.  
 11 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 12 Mr. Coleman, you  
 13 indicated that on at least two  
 14 occasions you made a request for the  
 15 seismic equipment at the mine. Could  
 16 you tell me who you made that request  
 17 to and about what time it was?  
 18 MR. COLEMAN:  
 19 I'm doing this from  
 20 memory. And it was on two different  
 21 occasions. It was around 10:30. One  
 22 was Jeff Kravitz. And the other one I  
 23 had spoken to was Virgil Brown. And  
 24 that's when --- and there were some  
 25 other federal officials there. I don't

1 remember who it was, but they basically  
 2 said, you know, we've got stuff coming  
 3 towards you. We've got the package  
 4 coming to you.  
 5 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 6 Did you do that by  
 7 telephone or did you do that in person?  
 8 MR. COLEMAN:  
 9 In person.  
 10 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 11 So you spoke to Jeff  
 12 Kravitz at about 10:30 that morning?  
 13 MR. COLEMAN:  
 14 That may have been Tim  
 15 Satter. But I did speak to Mr. Kravitz  
 16 later on, when he arrived, as well as  
 17 with --- spoke to Mr. Virgil Brown.  
 18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 19 What time did you speak  
 20 with Virgil Brown?  
 21 MR. COLEMAN:  
 22 I don't remember  
 23 specifically, sir.  
 24 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 25 Would it have been the

1 afternoon, in the morning?  
 2 MR. COLEMAN:  
 3 I believe it would be the  
 4 afternoon, sir.  
 5 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 6 When you spoke to Mr.  
 7 Kravitz, was that by telephone or was  
 8 that in person?  
 9 MR. COLEMAN:  
 10 That was in person, sir.  
 11 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 12 Do you know what time  
 13 that was?  
 14 MR. COLEMAN:  
 15 It was in the evening.  
 16 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 17 After the mine rescue  
 18 teams went underground or before; do  
 19 you know?  
 20 MR. COLEMAN:  
 21 I believe it was a little  
 22 after.  
 23 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 24 Mr. Stemple, you  
 25 indicated that maybe not at this mine,

Page 458

1 but at a particular mine you had  
2 checked some SCSRs that had expired.  
3 MR. STEMPLE:  
4 Yes, sir.  
5 MR. MCKINNEY:  
6 Or maybe they failed the  
7 shake test. Which one did you say?  
8 MR. STEMPLE:  
9 They tested bad. Either  
10 the indicator on the top or bottom was  
11 pink or they failed the shake test,  
12 yes, sir.  
13 MR. MCKINNEY:  
14 As you understand that  
15 particular type of SCSR, what does it  
16 mean when the shake test --- when it  
17 fails the shake test? What part of the  
18 SCSR doesn't work?  
19 MR. STEMPLE:  
20 I'm not --- I don't know.  
21 I've never opened one up.  
22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
23 What are you basing your  
24 opinion on then that you opened that  
25 SCSR up and it was a functional SCSR?

Page 459

1 MR. STEMPLE:  
2 That I activated it. I  
3 didn't physically open the unit to see  
4 the internal components, but I did  
5 activate it, put it on and use it, put  
6 the mouthpiece in my mouth and breathe  
7 through it.  
8 MR. MCKINNEY:  
9 For what period of time?  
10 MR. STEMPLE:  
11 As I said, I put on a  
12 hundred of them. Each of them were  
13 different amounts of time. The longest  
14 one, I believe, was 45 minutes.  
15 MR. MCKINNEY:  
16 Would it be proper to ask  
17 for a demonstration of a CSC (sic)?  
18 And I understood you came prepared to  
19 do that?  
20 MR. STEMPLE:  
21 Yes, sir, I can give you  
22 a demonstration.  
23 MR. MCKINNEY:  
24 If that please the Chair.  
25 CHAIR:

Page 460

1 That would be fine. If  
2 you can demonstrate that for us, Mr.  
3 Stemple, that would be fine. If you  
4 can stand out here so that you could  
5 get it for the audience, please.  
6 MR. STEMPLE:  
7 This is the unit that the  
8 men carry with them. It has to be  
9 within arm's reach at all times. We  
10 provide a holster that they carry on  
11 their belt so that it is within arm's  
12 reach at all times. This is a training  
13 unit, so you can see the similarities  
14 in them.  
15 Each day, before the men  
16 enter the mine, they're trained to do a  
17 visual check on the unit. On the top  
18 of the unit is an indicator, as they  
19 were talking about earlier, whether  
20 that indicator is blue or pink. So you  
21 check the top indicator. There's also  
22 one on the front, on the bottom side.  
23 And with this unit in your pouch, you  
24 can just physically do that check,  
25 easy, every day to make sure those

Page 461

1 indicators are blue. When I train  
2 everyone, I train them to check those  
3 indicators and to also check the  
4 physical condition of the unit. And if  
5 anyone has a unit that does not look  
6 good or the indicators are pink, they  
7 don't go underground. We keep them at  
8 the mine site, and they're to change  
9 them out.  
10 Every 90 days, I will put  
11 up a notice on the bulletin board for  
12 these to be turned in. When they're  
13 turned in, we do the same visual check,  
14 plus we also do an indicator check that  
15 Mr. McKinney was discussing, where we  
16 put the noise meter on the unit. We  
17 shake the unit several times up and  
18 down. If the indicator flashes red off  
19 and on, then that unit is removed from  
20 service. And as I said earlier,  
21 normally in a 90-day period, I would  
22 remove six units from service that  
23 tested bad. But when I've opened those  
24 units up, they still functioned.  
25 Although they tested bad, they still

1     functioned, which gave me a little  
 2     better feeling about the unit.  
 3     To operate the unit, when  
 4     do you use this unit? In cases of fire  
 5     and explosion in the mine or you've  
 6     been notified there's a fire and  
 7     explosion in the mine, that's when you  
 8     operate the unit. It's not a rescue  
 9     unit. You don't use it to rescue  
 10    people. You use it to evacuate the  
 11    mine.  
 12    The unit is on your  
 13    pouch. You're to remove the pouch  
 14    --- remove the Velcro cover, take it  
 15    out of the pouch, you get on the mine  
 16    floor, on your knees, remove your hard  
 17    hat, put your hard hat on the floor by  
 18    you to shine your light on the unit and  
 19    onto yourself so you can see what  
 20    you're doing. On the top is a release  
 21    tab. You pull up the release tab. The  
 22    bands will spring free. You remove the  
 23    top and discard it, because you don't  
 24    need the top. I train everyone that  
 25    there's a set of goggles in here, to

1     put the goggles on your wrist so you  
 2     don't drop them in the mud and the  
 3     water that's on the mine floor. You  
 4     remove the bottom cannister. You don't  
 5     need it. Take the neck strap out and  
 6     put it over your neck. And I've put  
 7     the unit on backwards, so I train  
 8     everyone to be aware that the actuator  
 9     tab goes on your right, not your left.  
 10    So I would need to remove the unit and  
 11    turn it around. If I don't turn it  
 12    around, I'm going to have to take my  
 13    nose clips up around my mouthpiece.  
 14    That's the only function of having it  
 15    forward or backward, is the nose clips  
 16    would have to be stretched to bring  
 17    them up to your nose. And you would  
 18    realize that once you went to put your  
 19    nose clips on. At that point, you  
 20    activate the oxygen by pulling down on  
 21    the tab. The bag will start to fill up  
 22    with oxygen. While it's filling up  
 23    with oxygen, you remove the plug from  
 24    the mouthpiece. You insert the  
 25    mouthpiece, wrap your lips around, bit

1     down on the bit lugs. You put your  
 2     nose clips on to isolate your lungs  
 3     from the atmosphere so that you're only  
 4     breathing through the mouthpiece.  
 5     There's a waist strap in here that you  
 6     wrap around your body. There, I  
 7     dropped my goggles in the mud. You  
 8     would snap the waist strap in. It can  
 9     be detached very easily or reattached.  
 10    If you've got a lot of strain on your  
 11    hose, you can adjust the neck strap by  
 12    pulling up on the silver ring. There's  
 13    a black faceted clip to hold it in  
 14    place. If you're bent over or crawling  
 15    and the unit is swaying, there's a  
 16    strap --- or a ring on here you can  
 17    pull to tighten up the unit to your  
 18    chest. And you have basically 60  
 19    minutes of oxygen to use. And at rest,  
 20    this unit will provide up to four hours  
 21    of oxygen. You can outbreathe the  
 22    unit, though. When I've worn this unit,  
 23    I've tested it by pushing myself and  
 24    pushing my limits by walking fast and  
 25    running, and it feels like you're

1     breathing through a straw as opposed to  
 2     breathing through a hose. When I  
 3     slowed myself down and went to a normal  
 4     pace or a slower pace, it just feels  
 5     like the hose is opening back up and  
 6     I'm getting good oxygen.  
 7     CHAIR:  
 8     Thank you.  
 9     MR. MCKINNEY:  
 10    Thank you, Mr. Stemple.  
 11    Who does the SCSR training at the mine?  
 12    MR. STEMPLE:  
 13    When an individual is  
 14    hired at the mine, prior to going in,  
 15    it's part of their newly-employed  
 16    training that they receive hands-on  
 17    training with the SCSR. It's done by  
 18    the safety director.  
 19    MR. MCKINNEY:  
 20    So would you be doing  
 21    that training at certain times?  
 22    MR. STEMPLE:  
 23    Yes. When I was at the  
 24    mine in June and July I would say that  
 25    I probably did some of that training,

1 yes.  
 2 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 3 How about Mr. Coleman?  
 4 MR. COLEMAN:  
 5 No. I've only --- I come  
 6 out with ICG July the 27th. And within  
 7 my capacity, I oversee the safety  
 8 program and the safety directors.  
 9 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 10 Mr. Stemple, you  
 11 indicated that you had donned the SCSR.  
 12 Begin that process when you're  
 13 notified of a fire or an explosion.  
 14 During the interview process and  
 15 looking at some of the transcripts,  
 16 it's apparent that some of the miners  
 17 were in smoke or went into smoke and  
 18 didn't done the SCSRs. Would there be  
 19 a time during your training process  
 20 you'd make them aware that they should  
 21 wear an SCSR?  
 22 MR. STEMPLE:  
 23 Yes, sir.  
 24 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 25 Do you have any idea why

1 that process would not have been  
 2 followed?  
 3 MR. STEMPLE:  
 4 No, I do not. That was  
 5 their individual decision.  
 6 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 7 Do you believe that most  
 8 people respond to the training they  
 9 received?  
 10 MR. STEMPLE:  
 11 Yes, sir.  
 12 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 13 Mr. Hatfield, I pose this  
 14 question to you, and you can delegate  
 15 it to whom you want to. We talked a  
 16 little bit about building the seals and  
 17 the process of training people to build  
 18 those seals. And I would wonder who on  
 19 your team could answer the question  
 20 what type of training those people  
 21 would have.  
 22 MR. HATFIELD:  
 23 I believe Jeff Toler is  
 24 probably the most qualified to address  
 25 that. But he may want to ask Ty

1 Coleman to help him.  
 2 MR. J.TOLER:  
 3 Typically, the training,  
 4 Ray, is going to be --- I would  
 5 verbally go over the seal construction  
 6 process. And then beyond that, it  
 7 would be a hands-on type.  
 8 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 9 What would you use as a  
 10 reference document for the training  
 11 that you were going to do?  
 12 MR. J.TOLER:  
 13 A copy of the approved  
 14 seal construction plan.  
 15 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 16 And how is that  
 17 transferred to the contractors that  
 18 came on your property and did contract  
 19 work on the seals?  
 20 MR. J.TOLER:  
 21 Those gentlemen were  
 22 already on the property, working with  
 23 our men on some of the other various  
 24 outby improvements we were making. And  
 25 they all just kind of filtered into the

1 process as the construction went along.  
 2 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 3 So did you do that  
 4 training for those individuals?  
 5 MR. J.TOLER:  
 6 No, sir, I did not.  
 7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 8 Would someone in the  
 9 company have done that?  
 10 MR. J.TOLER:  
 11 Somebody at the seal site  
 12 would have done that.  
 13 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 14 Would that have been a  
 15 company person?  
 16 MR. J.TOLER:  
 17 Yes, sir.  
 18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 19 You indicated earlier  
 20 that you felt like the seals were  
 21 properly constructed.  
 22 MR. J.TOLER:  
 23 Yes, sir.  
 24 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 25 What did you do as the

Page 470

1 person being responsible for the  
2 building of the seals and the  
3 construction process to provide  
4 oversight to see that they were  
5 constructed properly?  
6 MR. J.TOLER:  
7 As I said, when I was in  
8 the mines during the construction of  
9 the seals, I would --- I made a few  
10 stops by, checked on their  
11 construction, see how it was going.  
12 They appeared to be following the plan  
13 as it was approved.  
14 MR. COLEMAN:  
15 Jeff, if I may interject.  
16 You had earlier stated that you had  
17 reviewed the plan with supervisors that  
18 was going to oversee the seals  
19 installation; is that correct?  
20 MR. J.TOLER:  
21 Yes, sir. And I also  
22 think that each of these supervisors  
23 had a copy of that seal construction  
24 plan with them.  
25 MR. MCKINNEY:

Page 471

1 We had an interview  
2 process, a statement where the first  
3 row of blocks were placed down and then  
4 there was a bag of BBond poured over  
5 that as a footer. Would that be the  
6 proper way to construct the seal?  
7 MR. J.TOLER:  
8 No, sir. I don't think  
9 that --- that's not the way they would  
10 have done that, I don't think.  
11 MR. MCKINNEY:  
12 You don't think or you're  
13 sure?  
14 MR. J.TOLER:  
15 I don't think they would  
16 have done it that way.  
17 MR. MCKINNEY:  
18 And what would you base  
19 that opinion on?  
20 MR. J.TOLER:  
21 Just verbal descriptions  
22 of how they built the seals. Are you  
23 indicating that they just laid a little  
24 row of blocks down and dumped ---  
25 MR. MCKINNEY:

Page 472

1 Yes.  
2 MR. J.TOLER:  
3 --- BBond on top of that?  
4 MR. MCKINNEY:  
5 The BBond was not mixed.  
6  
7 MR. J.TOLER:  
8 It was not mixed?  
9 MR. MCKINNEY:  
10 It was dumped on the  
11 floor.  
12 MR. J.TOLER:  
13 No, sir. I think the  
14 only instance that they would use a dry  
15 mix is if the bottom conditions were  
16 damp, wet, they would maybe pour dry  
17 mix down. Or if there was a big,  
18 uneven area there, they may put it down  
19 in there for a leveling purpose. But it  
20 would have been on the footer below the  
21 first row of blocks.  
22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
23 If you did what you just  
24 described, you used dry BBond and  
25 poured it out of the bag and set the

Page 473

1 block on top of it, does that comply  
2 with the seal plan?  
3 MR. J.TOLER:  
4 If the conditions were  
5 damp, I would --- yes, I think they  
6 would.  
7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
8 So you would not, in your  
9 opinion, be mixing a mortar to lay that  
10 block in?  
11 MR. J.TOLER:  
12 If it's drawing --- if it  
13 can draw its moisture from the ground,  
14 no, sir.  
15 MR. MCKINNEY:  
16 There was also some  
17 statements about the number of  
18 flyboards that were placed on top of  
19 the seals that were being built, the  
20 40-inch thick seals. If there were  
21 three flyboards, would that comply with  
22 the plan?  
23 MR. J.TOLER:  
24 Three flyboards would  
25 comply with the plan.

Page 474

1 MR. MCKINNEY:  
2 Would or would not?  
3 MR. J.TOLER:  
4 It would.  
5 MR. MCKINNEY:  
6 Would anything less than  
7 three comply with the plan?  
8 MR. J.TOLER:  
9 No, sir, it would not.  
10 MR. MCKINNEY:  
11 Who is responsible for  
12 the annual refresher training and the  
13 newly-employed and experienced mining  
14 training at the mine, for conducting  
15 that training?  
16 MR. COLEMAN:  
17 The safety director at  
18 that site and/or a certified  
19 instructor.  
20 MR. MCKINNEY:  
21 Can you tell me how that  
22 is handled administratively --- or how  
23 was it handled administratively at the  
24 Sago Mine? Did you bring all your  
25 miners into a training class once a

Page 475

1 year?  
2 MR. COLEMAN:  
3 I can't comment prior to.  
4 Subsequent to the event, we have  
5 brought all miners in to conduct the  
6 annual retraining.  
7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
8 Who can comment prior to?  
9 MR. STEMPLE:  
10 Based on the anniversary  
11 date of their hire date was how we were  
12 doing the training previously. And if  
13 there were eight men in the month of  
14 August that were due for annual  
15 refresher training, those eight men  
16 would be posted on the mine door to  
17 report for annual refresher training.  
18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
19 So that it could be if  
20 one person was due, it would be a one-  
21 on-one training session?  
22 MR. STEMPLE:  
23 What I would do is I  
24 would bring one person into a group  
25 with others. If I had eight in October

Page 476

1 and two in November, I would bring the  
2 two in November into October.  
3 MR. MCKINNEY:  
4 But to your knowledge,  
5 there would never be a one-on-one  
6 training session?  
7 MR. STEMPLE:  
8 To my knowledge, I have  
9 done several of those in the past.  
10 It's not very convenient to do a  
11 one-on-one.  
12 MR. MCKINNEY:  
13 Who tracks the expiration  
14 dates on your SCSRs?  
15 MR. STEMPLE:  
16 Those are tracked mostly  
17 through the department.  
18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
19 Is that logged in  
20 electronically or how do you track  
21 that?  
22 MR. STEMPLE:  
23 Well, initially it's done  
24 by hand and then logged in  
25 electronically.

Page 477

1 CHAIR:  
2 Mr. Stemple, if I may  
3 follow up on that question. Earlier a  
4 question was asked as to the logs or as  
5 to the dates of these SCSRs. Could you  
6 provide us with a copy of those dates,  
7 when they were purchased?  
8 MR. STEMPLE:  
9 I don't know when they  
10 were purchased. They do have the  
11 manufacturer's date stamped on them  
12 when they were made, but I don't know  
13 when they were purchased.  
14 CHAIR:  
15 And it was asked if we  
16 could get copies of those manufacturer  
17 dates.  
18 MR. STEMPLE:  
19 Yes. MSHA has those.  
20 CHAIR:  
21 Okay.  
22 MR. MCKINNEY:  
23 Mr. Coleman, I think you  
24 indicated that you were at the mine  
25 somewhere a little after eight o'clock



1 and also that you were working in the  
2 command center. Can you tell me how --  
3 - the functionality of that operation,  
4 what your input was as you represented  
5 the company in this process?

6 MR. COLEMAN:

7 Yes, sir. We took and  
8 used the incident command structure so  
9 that --- we set a place for  
10 engineering, surface critical support,  
11 along with, you know, securing access  
12 to the gate, and started working with  
13 logistics as far as taking into account  
14 what resources we had at the mines.  
15 And in conjunction with this, MSHA and  
16 the state was also assisting with  
17 resources as well.

18 MR. MCKINNEY:

19 You debriefed, as you  
20 understood, Mr. Toler when he came  
21 outside?

22 MR. COLEMAN:

23 Yes, sir.

24 MR. MCKINNEY:

25 Based on that debriefing,

1 what did you gain from that as far as  
2 the conditions underground?

3 MR. COLEMAN:

4 I felt that we had had a  
5 significant event.

6 MR. MCKINNEY:

7 Could you tell me what  
8 significant event you felt you had?

9 MR. COLEMAN:

10 Some type of maybe an  
11 explosion or mine fire or --- I mean,  
12 there was even talk that, you know,  
13 possibly even a major roof fall.

14 MR. MCKINNEY:

15 I think we've all been in  
16 the mining industry quite sometime. As  
17 you debriefed Mr. Toler, who's already  
18 told us that I think when he saw soot  
19 deposits on the mine roof, ---

20 MR. COLEMAN:

21 Yes.

22 MR. MCKINNEY:

23 --- he saw stoppings  
24 destroyed, he saw smoke, and at that  
25 point in time, underground, looking at

1 the conditions, he felt there had been  
2 an explosion. You still had not  
3 decided that after debriefing him?

4 MR. COLEMAN:

5 After debriefing him,  
6 yes. But pursuant to --- we got bits  
7 and pieces of information. I mean, the  
8 firsthand information come from Mr.  
9 Toler and the others that went  
10 underground to assist, what the  
11 conditions were and what was going on.

12 MR. MCKINNEY:

13 Can you tell me a little  
14 bit about the operation as far as what  
15 the plan was? As Mr. Kitts indicated,  
16 a K Order was issued, which now the  
17 company puts forth a plan of what you  
18 want to do. What was the first plan  
19 that you brought forth as your plan of  
20 action?

21 MR. COLEMAN:

22 The first plan that was  
23 approved is that once that we was  
24 assured that we didn't have a mine fire  
25 or excessive levels of methane, the

1 plan was submitted and signed off on by  
2 state and the federal and ICG to  
3 systematically explore the mines once  
4 we did the portals and to advance up  
5 the track with the secondary back-up  
6 team following at approximately 500  
7 feet and advancing that way. And we  
8 was tied into the returns I believe  
9 every 500 feet.

10 MR. MCKINNEY:

11 You're pretty well into  
12 the operation now. I guess I'm talking  
13 about the first window when you  
14 debriefed Mr. Toler and you thought you  
15 had an explosion underground. A  
16 decision has to be made about whether  
17 you're going to send people underground  
18 at this point in time, once the teams  
19 were mobilized. What was your  
20 position, as the company official at  
21 that time? Did you want to send teams  
22 underground?

23 MR. COLEMAN:

24 We had approached MSHA  
25 with that, and that was not accepted

1 because they wanted to get a trending  
 2 analysis to ensure the safety of the  
 3 team, that we didn't have a mine fire.  
 4 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 5 You indicated this was a  
 6 joint discussion process. So when you  
 7 say approached MSHA, did you have  
 8 meetings between yourself, MSHA and the  
 9 state to make decisions on this?  
 10 MR. COLEMAN:  
 11 Yes, sir.  
 12 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 13 Did you have any concerns  
 14 as the person in charge of the mine  
 15 that there might be a second explosion?  
 16 MR. COLEMAN:  
 17 Yes, sir.  
 18 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 19 And you still wanted to  
 20 send people underground?  
 21 MR. COLEMAN:  
 22 We was speaking of  
 23 several different aspects. You have to  
 24 realize we was acquiring information.  
 25 We were monitoring the returns. We was

1 getting additional information from the  
 2 people we was  
 3 --- we had a lot of different  
 4 information that we was --- we, as the  
 5 command center, was trying to  
 6 assimilate this.  
 7 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 8 Once you did compile the  
 9 information, you understood the  
 10 concentrations were coming outside.  
 11 And I think Mr. Kitts and Mr. Hatfield,  
 12 one, indicated that, you know, you were  
 13 up to over 2,000 parts per million.  
 14 You're in the mine office. Once you  
 15 knew that and you knew what had  
 16 transpired before that, did that cause  
 17 you concern about sending people  
 18 underground?  
 19 MR. COLEMAN:  
 20 Yes. Once we seen the  
 21 upward trend of the CO, I was  
 22 apprehensive.  
 23 MS. CAMPBELL:  
 24 Excuse me, Davitt. I'm  
 25 sorry. There's a lot of families that

1 really need to get home to their  
 2 children. Can I make a motion that we  
 3 adjourn and have this panel come back  
 4 tomorrow? I'm sorry. If that's all  
 5 right with you guys.  
 6 CHAIR:  
 7 I think the questioning  
 8 is finished. We would ask the panel,  
 9 and we want to thank you for answering  
 10 these questions, but we would ask for  
 11 you to return tomorrow. And I know most  
 12 of you are, but we would request that  
 13 Mr. Crumrine, Mr. Toler and Mr. Jamison  
 14 join you tomorrow. We will look  
 15 tomorrow morning to see if we have to  
 16 finish any questions here. But I think  
 17 we're done with this panel, and we can  
 18 begin with the additional, the next  
 19 panel, which would be panel number  
 20 four. And then if we had questions for  
 21 you, follow-up questions, we might ask  
 22 them at the latter panel.  
 23 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 24 With the Chair's  
 25 indulgence, we have one question for

1 Mr. Jamison since he is not coming  
 2 back.  
 3 CHAIR:  
 4 Is Mr. Jamison coming  
 5 back tomorrow?  
 6 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 7 We'd just ask one  
 8 question. It's a very simple question.  
 9 The notes that you kept underground,  
 10 Mr. Jamison, I know you have to record  
 11 an air reading and you record your  
 12 methane concentrations, was that  
 13 recorded in the notebook that you lost?  
 14 MR. JAMISON:  
 15 Yeah. Yeah.  
 16 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 17 So you filled the book  
 18 out before you lost the notebook?  
 19 MR. JAMISON:  
 20 All right. I come out  
 21 and filled the books out, put it back  
 22 in my shirt, went back inside, the mine  
 23 blew up, come out.  
 24 MR. MCKINNEY:  
 25 Thank you. I appreciate

1 that.  
2 CHAIR:  
3 Thank you very much. And  
4 thank you to the families for being  
5 here today and for --- to all of you,  
6 this panel and the other panels, we  
7 will convene again tomorrow morning at  
8 nine o'clock. Thank you.

9  
10 \* \*MEETING CONTINUED\* \*  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 CERTIFICATE

2  
3 I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE  
4 FOREGOING PROCEEDINGS WERE REPORTED BY  
5 ME AND THEREAFTER REDUCED TO  
6 TYPEWRITING AND THAT THIS TRANSCRIPT IS  
7 A TRUE AND ACCURATE RECORDING THEREOFF.

8  
9 SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING  
10 SERVICE, INC.

11  
12 Miranda D. Elkins  
13 Court Reporter  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25